

2003

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
IN AND FOR THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
BEFORE THE HONORABLE JOHN E. MUNTER, JUDGE  
DEPARTMENT NO. 505

LESLIE J. WHITELEY AND )  
LEONARD WHITELEY, )  
PLAINTIFFS, )  
VS. ) NO. 303184  
RAYBESTOS-MANHATTAN, INC., ET )  
AL., )  
DEFENDANTS. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS  
WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 2, 2000  
(VOLUME 16, PAGES 2003-2145)

REPORTED BY: JUDITH ANN OSSA, CSR 2310  
OFFICIAL REPORTER

2004

APPEARANCES:

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:

WARTNICK, CHABER, HAROWITZ & TIGERMAN  
BY: MADELYN J. CHABER, ESQ.  
ROBERT BROWN, ESQ.  
MARTHA A.H. BERMAN, ESQ.  
101 CALIFORNIA STREET, SUITE 2200  
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94111-5802

FOR THE DEFENDANT PHILIP MORRIS INCORPORATED:

SHOOK, HARDY & BACON LLP  
BY: DAVID K. HARDY, ESQ.  
GERALD V. BARRON, ESQ.  
LUCY E. MASON, ESQ.  
ONE MARKET, STEUART TOWER, NINTH FLOOR  
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105-1310.

FOR THE DEFENDANT R.J. REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY:

WOMBLE, CARLYLE, SANDRIDGE & RICE  
BY: JEFFREY L. FURR, ESQ.  
200 WEST SECOND STREET  
WINSTON-SALEM, NORTH CAROLINA 27101

HOWARD, RICE, NEMEROVSKI, CANADY,  
FALK & RABKIN  
BY: H. JOSEPH ESCHER III  
THREE EMBARCADERO CENTER, 7TH FLOOR  
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94111-4065

FOR DEFENDANT METALCLAD INSULATION CORPORATION:

MISCIAGNA & COLOMBATTO  
BY: GREGORY S. ROSSE, ESQ.  
27 MAIDEN LANE, 4TH FLOOR  
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94108

21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
2005

1		
2	EXAMINATION OF PLAINTIFFS' WITNESSES	
3	WITNESS NAME	PAGE
4	PATSY R. WHITTEKER.....	2018
	CROSS-EXAMINATION.....	2019
5	CROSS-EXAMINATION.....	2036
	REDIRECT EXAMINATION.....	2038
6		
	RICHARD W. POLLAY, PH.D.....	2042
7	DIRECT EXAMINATION.....	2042
	DIRECT EXAMINATION (CONTINUED).....	2084

8		
	COURT EXHIBITS	
9	EXHIBIT	PAGE
10	COURT EXHIBIT 3	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2008

11		
	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS	
12	EXHIBIT	PAGE
13	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS 44, 66, 79, 90, 108, 318, 331,	
	332, 397, 413, 451, 448, 451, 516, 571, 609, 807,	
14	1009, 1017, 1036, 1040, 1055, AND 1138	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2011
15	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS 1033, 1034 & 1091	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2012
16	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 165	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2016
17	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1856-A	
	MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.....	2017
18	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1890	
	MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.....	2072
19	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS 1860-1864, 1858-1859, 1888-1892	
	MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.....	2082
20	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS 1866-1873, 1875-1886	
	MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.....	2084
21	PLAINTIFFS EXHIBIT 1869	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2093
22	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1885	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2094
23	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1884	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2098
24	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1873	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2100
25	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1867	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2104
26	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1871	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2105
27	PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1872	
	RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE.....	2106

28  
2006  
1

PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS

PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1886

RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE..... 2109

PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS 1875-1876, 1878 & 1880

RECEIVED IN EVIDENCE..... 2114

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 2, 2000

9:10 A.M.

(THE FOLLOWING PROCEEDINGS WERE HELD IN THE  
COURTROOM, OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY)

THE COURT: WE ARE ON THE RECORD OUTSIDE THE  
PRESENCE OF THE JURY.

I UNDERSTAND FROM A DISCUSSION OFF THE RECORD  
THAT THE PARTIES WANT TO HAVE MADE AS COURT EXHIBIT 3, A  
DOCUMENT THAT'S ENTITLED "FIRST SUPPLEMENT TO PLAINTIFFS'  
EXHIBIT SUBJECT TO JANUARY 27, 2000 STIPULATION OF  
COUNSEL. "

AM I CORRECT THAT THE PARTIES WANT THAT TO BE  
COURT EXHIBIT 3?

MS. CHABER: YES.

MS. MASON: YES, YOUR HONOR.

THE COURT: AND THAT IS A DOCUMENT WHICH I  
UNDERSTAND SETS FORTH A LIST OF EXHIBITS WHICH THE PLAINTIFF  
IS OFFERING INTO EVIDENCE; CORRECT?

MS. CHABER: YES.

THE COURT: AND THE DEFENDANTS' ONLY OBJECTION  
TO IT IS THE OBJECTION THAT THIS IS HEARSAY FOR THE REASONS  
PREVIOUSLY DISCUSSED, AS WE HAVE DEFINED THAT TERM;  
CORRECT?

MS. MASON: YES, YOUR HONOR.

MS. CHABER: YES.

THE COURT: AND SO I AM OVERRULING THAT  
OBJECTION, AGAIN SUBJECT, OBVIOUSLY, TO THE MOTION TO  
STRIKE, WHICH WILL GO WITHOUT SAYING IN THE FUTURE IN THIS  
CASE AS TO THAT CATEGORY OF DOCUMENTS.

THOSE DOCUMENTS ARE ALL RECEIVED INTO EVIDENCE.

(DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED

4 IN EVIDENCE AS COURT  
5 EXHIBIT # 3)  
6 THE COURT: AND I UNDERSTAND THAT THE PARTIES  
7 WANT TO HANDLE THIS BY MY JUST TELLING THE JURY THAT CERTAIN  
8 DOCUMENTS HAVE BEEN ADMITTED IN THEIR ABSENCE AS A  
9 CONVENIENCE TO THEM.  
10 AND I WILL ALSO REFERENCE THAT SOME OF THEM HAVE  
11 DELETIONS OR INFORMATION REMOVED. AND I WILL EXPLAIN THE  
12 CIRCUMSTANCE TO THEM.  
13 AND I GATHER THAT'S THE JOINT REQUEST OF THE  
14 PARTIES, THAT WE HANDLE A NUMBER OF THESE DOCUMENTS IN THAT  
15 FASHION; CORRECT?  
16 MS. CHABER: YES.  
17 MS. MASON: YES.  
18 THE COURT: SO I WILL DO THAT.  
19 NOW WE CAN GO OFF THE RECORD  
20 (RECESS TAKEN FROM 9:12 TO 9:30 A.M.)  
21 THE COURT: WE ARE BACK ON THE RECORD.  
22 MS. CHABER: YES. THE FOLLOWING DOCUMENTS ARE  
23 OFFERED BY THE PLAINTIFF. 44, 66, 79, 90.  
24 THE COURT: WHAT?  
25 MS. CHABER: I'M SORRY.  
26 THE COURT: WAIT A MINUTE.  
27 MS. CHABER: I HAVE THEM IN NUMBER ORDER.  
28 THE COURT: YOU HAVE THEM IN A DIFFERENT ORDER  
2009  
1 NUMBER. 44?  
2 MS. CHABER: YES. 66.  
3 THE COURT: OKAY.  
4 THE COURT: WHAT WAS THE NEXT ONE? 79?  
5 MS. CHABER: 79.  
6 THE COURT: LET ME ASK YOU TO GO SLOWLY. I'M  
7 GOING TO MAKE A NOTE OF THIS. 79.  
8 MS. CHABER: 80. EXCUSE ME. STRIKE 80.  
9 90 IS WHAT I MEANT TO SAY.  
10 THE COURT: 90. OKAY.  
11 MS. CHABER: 108.  
12 THE COURT: OKAY.  
13 MS. CHABER: 165.  
14 THE COURT: LET'S NOT DO 165 NOW.  
15 MS. CHABER: YOU MEAN TO SKIP IT?  
16 THE COURT: LET'S COME BACK TO THAT, BECAUSE  
17 THERE'S AN OBJECTION TO THAT ONE.  
18 MS. CHABER: OKAY. 318, 331.  
19 THE COURT: HOLD ON.  
20 MS. CHABER: I'M SORRY.  
21 THE COURT: 331. WE DID 108.  
22 MS. CHABER: AND THEN WE SKIPPED OVER TO --  
23 THE COURT: 318. JUST ONE SECOND. AND THEN  
24 331.  
25 AND THEN NEXT?  
26 MS. CHABER: 332.  
27 THE COURT: YES.  
28 MS. CHABER: 397.  
2010  
1 THE COURT: YES.  
2 MS. CHABER: 413.  
3 THE COURT: YES.  
4 MS. CHABER: 448.  
5 THE COURT: YES.  
6 MS. CHABER: 451.  
7 THE COURT: YES.  
8 MS. CHABER: 516.

9 THE COURT: YES.  
10 MS. CHABER: 571.  
11 THE COURT: YES.  
12 MS. CHABER: 609.  
13 THE COURT: YES.  
14 MS. CHABER: 807.  
15 THE COURT: YES.  
16 MS. CHABER: 1009.  
17 THE COURT: YES.  
18 MS. CHABER: 1017.  
19 THE COURT: YES.  
20 MS. CHABER: THERE ARE TWO DOCUMENTS COMING UP  
21 THAT HAVE LIMITING INSTRUCTIONS, THAT THEY WOULD BE OFFERED  
22 FOR STATE OF MIND AND NOT FOR THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER.  
23 BUT IF YOU WANT ME TO PUT THOSE AT THE END, THERE  
24 ARE ACTUALLY THREE THAT FALL INTO THAT CATEGORY.  
25 THE COURT: LET'S DO THOSE AT THE END.  
26 MS. CHABER: OKAY. 1036, 1043, 1055, 1138.  
27 THE COURT: IS THERE ANY OBJECTION TO ANY OF  
28 THOSE?  
2011  
1 MS. MASON: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
2 THE COURT: OKAY. SO THESE ARE THE DOCUMENTS  
3 THAT ARE RECEIVED WITHOUT LIMITATION?  
4 MS. CHABER: YES.  
5 THE COURT: 44, 66, 79, 90, 108, 318, 331, 332,  
6 397, 413, 451, 448, 451, 516, 571, 609, 807, 1009, 1017,  
7 1036, 1040, 1055, AND 1138; CORRECT?  
8 MS. CHABER: YES.  
9 MS. MASON: YES.  
10 THE COURT: OKAY.  
11 (DOCUMENTS MORE PARTICULARLY  
12 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
13 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
14 EXHIBIT #S 44, 66, 79, 90, 108,  
15 318, 331, 332, 397, 413, 451,  
16 448, 451, 516, 571, 609, 807,  
17 1009, 1017, 1036, 1040, 1055,  
18 & 1138)  
19 THE COURT: NOW, THERE'S THREE OF THESE YOU'RE  
20 OFFERING SUBJECT TO A LIMITING INSTRUCTION. YOU BOTH -- I  
21 GATHER YOU AGREE IT SHOULD GO INTO EVIDENCE SUBJECT TO A  
22 LIMITING INSTRUCTION.  
23 WHEN DO YOU WANT ME TO GIVE THAT LIMITING  
24 INSTRUCTION? I GUESS THAT'S --  
25 MS. CHABER: ACTUALLY, IT WAS FROM MR. ESCHER.  
26 THE COURT: DO YOU WANT TO ASK ME FOR THEM AT  
27 THE TIME THE DOCUMENTS ARE REFERENCED AS OPPOSED TO MAKING A  
28 STATEMENT AT THE BEGINNING HERE, WHEN THEY WON'T KNOW WHAT  
2012  
1 THOSE DOCUMENTS ARE?  
2 MR. ESCHER: THE FORMER, YOUR HONOR.  
3 THE COURT: THEN WILL YOU UNDERTAKE THE BURDEN  
4 OF REMINDING ME WHEN THERE IS A REFERENCE TO THE DOCUMENT,  
5 THAT THAT HAS BEEN RECEIVED ONLY FOR A LIMITED PURPOSE, AND  
6 THEN I'LL SO INSTRUCT THE JURY?  
7 MR. ESCHER: I WILL DO MY BEST, YOUR HONOR.  
8 THE COURT: IS THAT YOUR PREFERENCE AS TO HOW WE  
9 SHOULD HANDLE THAT?  
10 MR. ESCHER: YES.  
11 THE COURT: THE THREE ARE --  
12 MS. CHABER: 1033, 1034.  
13 THE COURT: 10 --

14 MS. CHABER: EXCUSE ME. IN OTHER WORDS, 1033.  
15 THE COURT: YES. 1034?  
16 MS. CHABER: YES.  
17 THE COURT: AND 1091 IS THE OTHER.  
18 MS. CHABER: AND 1091 IS THE OTHER.  
19 THE COURT: OKAY. ANY OBJECTION TO THOSE BEING  
20 RECEIVED, SUBJECT TO THE LIMITING INSTRUCTION, WHICH I  
21 SHOULD GIVE AT THE TIME THAT THE DEFENSE ASKS FOR IT?  
22 MR. ESCHER: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
23 THE COURT: THOSE THREE ARE RECEIVED.  
24 (DOCUMENTS MORE PARTICULARLY  
25 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
26 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
27 EXHIBIT #S 1033, 1034 & 1091)  
28 THE COURT: IS THE LIMITING INSTRUCTION THAT  
2013  
1 THEY'RE NOT RECEIVED FOR THE TRUTH OR ACCURACY OF THE  
2 INFORMATION IN THEM BUT FOR SOME OTHER PURPOSE?  
3 MR. ESCHER: YES, YOUR HONOR.  
4 THE COURT: AND WHAT IS THE OTHER PURPOSE, JUST  
5 SO I KNOW?  
6 MS. CHABER: STATE OF MIND.  
7 THE COURT: STATE OF MIND OF?  
8 MS. CHABER: OF THE DEFENDANTS. THE STATE OF  
9 MIND OF R.J. REYNOLDS, SPECIFICALLY.  
10 WE GET INTO THIS PROBLEM, BECAUSE I KNOW YOU WANT  
11 THIS VERY NARROW.  
12 THE COURT: WHATEVER THE STIPULATION IS, THAT'S  
13 THE STIPULATION.  
14 IT'S OFFERED AS EVIDENCE OF THE STATE OF MIND OF  
15 R.J. REYNOLDS?  
16 MR. ESCHER: YES, YOUR HONOR.  
17 THE COURT: OKAY. THEN I'LL DO THAT.  
18 JUST PLEASE REMIND ME AT THE TIME THAT THAT'S  
19 WHAT THE AGREEMENT IS ON THAT.  
20 OKAY. LET'S GO OFF THE RECORD FOR A MINUTE.  
21 (DISCUSSION OFF THE RECORD)  
22 THE COURT: BACK ON THE RECORD.  
23 MS. CHABER: DOCUMENT 165.  
24 MS. MASON: YOUR HONOR, PHILIP MORRIS HAS AN  
25 OBJECTION TO THAT EXHIBIT WHICH WE DISCUSSED OFF THE  
26 RECORD. AND THE OBJECTION IS HEARSAY, FOUNDATION AND 352.  
27 THE COURT: THE HEARSAY OBJECTION IS THE SAME  
28 HEARSAY OBJECTION THAT WE DISCUSSED OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF  
2014  
1 THE JURY; RIGHT?  
2 MS. MASON: THAT IT'S NOT A BUSINESS RECORD,  
3 YOUR HONOR.  
4 SHE DIDN'T -- WHAT SHE SAID WAS NOT SAID WITHIN  
5 THE SCOPE OF HER EMPLOYMENT, THE SCOPE OF HER AUTHORITY AT  
6 PHILIP MORRIS.  
7 THE COURT: AND WHAT IS YOUR RESPONSE TO THAT,  
8 MS. CHABER?  
9 MS. CHABER: THAT IT'S A STATEMENT. IT'S A  
10 BUSINESS RECORD. IT'S CONTAINED WITHIN THEIR FILES, AND  
11 THERE'S NO EVIDENCE THAT SHE IS ACTING OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF  
12 HER AUTHORITY.  
13 THE COURT: WAIT. WE HAVE DIFFERENT ISSUES  
14 HERE.  
15 THIS HASN'T BEEN SHOWN TO BE A BUSINESS RECORD.  
16 THE FACT THAT IT'S FOUND IN THE FILES DOES NOT MAKE IT A  
17 BUSINESS RECORD.  
18 I'M NOT SURE THAT THAT'S REALLY THE OBJECTION,

19       THOUGH, THAT'S BEING MADE TO IT. I THINK THE OBJECTION, IF  
20       I UNDERSTAND IT, IS DIFFERENT THAN THAT.  
21             AM I RIGHT OR WRONG ABOUT THAT?  
22       MS. MASON: YOUR HONOR, THE OBJECTION IS THAT  
23       BARBARA REUTER, THE AUTHOR OF THAT DOCUMENT, DID NOT -- WAS  
24       NOT EMPLOYED BY PHILIP MORRIS TO SPEAK ON THE AREAS OF  
25       ADDICTION. SHE DIDN'T DO ANY WORK IN THE ADDICTION AREA.  
26             FOR HER, FOR A DOCUMENT WITH THOSE THOUGHTS OF  
27       HERS IN IT ON ADDICTION TO BE A BUSINESS RECORD, I THINK YOU  
28       WOULD HAVE TO FIND THAT SHE WAS SPEAKING WITHIN THE SCOPE OF  
2015  
1       HER EMPLOYMENT AT PHILIP MORRIS.  
2             THE COURT: WHAT WAS HER POSITION AT PHILIP  
3       MORRIS?  
4       MS. CHABER: SHE WAS A MARKETING PERSON. AND  
5       SHE WAS SPEAKING WITH RESPECT TO SALES AND MARKETING.  
6             AND SHE WAS SPEAKING OF THE ADDICTIVE PROPERTIES  
7       AS A PART OF THE SALES AND MARKETING ANALYSIS THAT THEY  
8       MAKE.  
9             THE COURT: I UNDERSTAND -- AM I CORRECT ABOUT  
10       THIS? -- I UNDERSTAND THAT THE ONLY OBJECTION THAT'S MADE TO  
11       THIS IS THAT THIS WAS PREPARED BY A MARKETING PERSON, WHO IS  
12       PURPORTING TO STATE INFORMATION OF A SCIENTIFIC NATURE, AND  
13       YOUR OBJECTION IS THAT A MARKETING PERSON HAS NOT BEEN SHOWN  
14       TO BE QUALIFIED TO MAKE THOSE STATEMENTS OF A SCIENTIFIC  
15       KIND. I UNDERSTAND THAT TO BE THE ONLY OBJECTION.  
16             AM I CORRECT ABOUT THAT?  
17       MS. MASON: THAT'S CORRECT, YOUR HONOR.  
18       THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. THAT I'M GOING TO  
19       OVERRULE, BECAUSE IT'S AGREED THAT THIS WAS A MARKETING  
20       PERSON AND THAT THE SUBJECT MATTER OF THIS IS MARKETING.  
21             AND SO I'M GOING TO OVERRULE THE VARIOUS  
22       OBJECTIONS. AND I'VE DONE THE 352 WEIGHING. BECAUSE  
23       OTHERWISE, WE WOULD BE IN A SITUATION WHERE A MARKETING  
24       PERSON COULDN'T SAY ANYTHING THAT WAS SCIENTIFIC AND A  
25       SCIENTIFIC PERSON COULDN'T SAY ANYTHING ABOUT MARKETING,  
26       WHEREAS, IN REALITY, IT MAY WELL BE THAT THE MARKETING  
27       PEOPLE HAVE IN MIND SCIENTIFIC CONSIDERATIONS DURING THE  
28       COURSE OF THEIR MARKETING.  
2016  
1       AT LEAST, THAT IS INFORMATION THAT THE JURY IS  
2       ENTITLED TO EVALUATE TO DETERMINE, RATHER THAN THE COURT, IN  
3       A JURY TRIAL.  
4       MS. MASON: THANK YOU.  
5       THE COURT: OKAY. 165 IS RECEIVED  
6                   (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
7                   LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
8                   IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
9                   EXHIBIT 165)  
10       THE COURT: OFF THE RECORD.  
11       (DISCUSSION OFF THE RECORD)  
12       THE COURT: BACK ON THE RECORD.  
13       WHEN DR. FOGEL WAS TESTIFYING ON DIRECT  
14       EXAMINATION, HE DID A SECOND DRAWING THAT HASN'T BEEN MARKED  
15       FOR IDENTIFICATION.  
16       WHY DON'T WE MARK THAT FOR IDENTIFICATION.  
17       (DISCUSSION OFF THE RECORD)  
18       THE COURT: LET'S GO BACK ON THE RECORD.  
19       WHILE WE WERE OFF THE RECORD, COUNSEL AGREED THAT  
20       WE CAN APPROPRIATELY MARK THIS PAGE AS 1856-A, SINCE 1856  
21       WAS DR. FOGEL'S FIRST DRAWING.  
22       AND, FOR THE RECORD, YOU ALL AGREE WITH THAT  
23       MARKING?

24 MS. CHABER: YES.  
25 MS. MASON: YES.  
26 MR. BROWN: I BELIEVE WHAT I'M POINTING TO, THIS  
27 IS 1856.  
28 MS. CHABER: YES. I PUT IT THERE.

2017

1 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
2 LISTED IN THE INDEX MARKED  
3 FOR IDENTIFICATION PLAINTIFFS'  
4 EXHIBIT # 1856-A)  
5 THE COURT: OFF THE RECORD.  
6 (THE FOLLOWING PROCEEDINGS WERE HELD IN THE  
7 COURTROOM, IN THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY)  
8 THE COURT: GOOD MORNING, EVERYBODY. BEFORE WE  
9 START WITH THE TESTIMONY, LET ME JUST EXPLAIN SOMETHING TO  
10 YOU.  
11 THE LAWYERS HAVE BEEN COOPERATING WITH EACH OTHER  
12 AND WITH THE COURT IN A WAY SO THAT WE COULD HANDLE THESE  
13 DOCUMENTS AND STILL TAKE THE MINIMUM AMOUNT OF YOUR TIME  
14 WHILE WE DEALT WITH ANY LEGAL ISSUES CONCERNING THE  
15 DOCUMENTS.  
16 AND AS A RESULT OF THAT, A NUMBER OF DOCUMENTS  
17 HAVE BEEN RECEIVED INTO EVIDENCE IN A WAY THAT WE ARE NOT  
18 GOING TO TAKE YOUR TIME OUT HERE TO RECITE THE NUMBERS OF  
19 THOSE DOCUMENTS, BECAUSE IF THEY ARE IN EVIDENCE, THEN THE  
20 LAWYERS WILL REFER TO THEM, AND THAT WAY WE'LL KNOW ABOUT  
21 THEIR STATUS.  
22 SO THE BOTTOM LINE IS THAT A NUMBER OF DOCUMENTS  
23 HAVE ALREADY BEEN ADMITTED AND RECEIVED INTO EVIDENCE IN  
24 YOUR ABSENCE, IN AN EFFORT, BASICALLY, NOT TO TAKE UP YOUR  
25 TIME AND ENERGY LISTENING TO A BUNCH OF HOUSEKEEPING TYPE OF  
26 LANGUAGE THAT WE WOULD ENGAGE IN OURSELVES.  
27 WITH RESPECT TO THOSE DOCUMENTS, ON SOME OF THEM,  
28 CERTAIN INFORMATION HAS BEEN DELETED OR REMOVED OR REDACTED

2018

1 FROM THE DOCUMENTS. SOMETIMES THAT INFORMATION WAS REMOVED  
2 BECAUSE ALL OF THE LAWYERS AGREED THAT IT WAS IRRELEVANT AND  
3 HAD NOTHING TO DO TO DO WITH THE CASE. OTHER TIMES, I MADE  
4 THAT RULING, THAT IT HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH THIS CASE.  
5 SO IF YOU ARE IN THE JURY ROOM AND YOU'RE LOOKING  
6 AT THE DOCUMENTS OR YOU SEE THEM ON THE SCREEN OR HEAR ABOUT  
7 THEM AND THERE IS INFORMATION MISSING, YOU MUST NOT  
8 SPECULATE ABOUT WHAT IT WAS OR WHY IT'S MISSING. THAT WAS  
9 JUST THE PRODUCT OF EITHER AGREEMENTS OR RULINGS THAT THAT  
10 INFORMATION HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH THIS CASE AT ALL.  
11 SO DON'T DRAW ANY INFERENCE OR IMPLICATIONS OR  
12 ANYTHING ABOUT MISSING INFORMATION. IT IS A PERFECTLY  
13 NORMAL, APPROPRIATE, PROPER PART OF THE CASE THAT THAT HAS  
14 BEEN REMOVED. AND SO DON'T SPECULATE ABOUT WHAT IT WAS OR  
15 WHY IT WAS REMOVED.  
16 THE BOTTOM LINE IS, THE INFORMATION THAT WAS  
17 REMOVED HAS NOTHING TO DO WITH THIS CASE OR WITH ANY JOB  
18 THAT WE'RE ASKING YOU TO DO ON THE CASE EITHER.  
19 OKAY. I THINK WE ARE READY TO PICK UP WITH  
20 MS. PATSY WHITTEKER, AND WE HAD JUST COMPLETED THE DIRECT.  
21 AND I THINK YOU WERE ABOUT TO START, MS. MASON,  
22 ON CROSS.  
23 MS. MASON: THANK YOU.  
24 FURTHER TESTIMONY OF  
25 PATSY R. WHITTEKER,  
26 A WITNESS CALLED ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFFS, HAVING BEEN  
27 PREVIOUSLY DULY SWORN, TESTIFIED FURTHER AS FOLLOWS:  
28



2019

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION  
2 BY MS. MASON: Q. GOOD MORNING,  
3 MRS. WHITTEKER.  
4 A. GOOD MORNING.  
5 Q. MY NAME IS LUCY MASON.  
6 YOU AND I HAVE NOT MET BEFORE.  
7 A. PARDON. WHAT DID YOU SAY?  
8 Q. MY NAME IS LUCY MASON. I JUST WANTED TO  
9 INTRODUCE MYSELF, BECAUSE YOU AND I HAVE NOT MET BEFORE.  
10 A. RIGHT.  
11 Q. MRS. WHITTEKER, I HOPE TO BE BRIEF WITH YOU THIS  
12 MORNING.  
13 LET'S START WITH SOME OF THE TESTIMONY YOU GAVE  
14 YESTERDAY, MA'AM.  
15 IF I RECALL IT CORRECTLY, IT WAS YOUR TESTIMONY  
16 THAT DURING THE TIME PERIOD THAT YOUR DAUGHTER LESLIE WAS  
17 GROWING UP, THAT YOU DID NOT BELIEVE THAT CIGARETTE SMOKING  
18 WAS DANGEROUS.  
19 DID I GET THAT RIGHT, MA'AM?  
20 A. YES, THAT'S CORRECT.  
21 Q. AND IN FACT, I THINK YOU ALSO TOLD THIS JURY,  
22 MRS. WHITTEKER, YOU DIDN'T BELIEVE THAT SMOKING COULD LEAD  
23 TO DEATH UNTIL SOMETIME IN THE 1990S.  
24 IS THAT ALSO RIGHT, MA'AM?  
25 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
26 Q. LET'S TALK BRIEFLY FOR A MINUTE, MRS. WHITTEKER,  
27 ABOUT WHAT YOU KNEW ABOUT SMOKING AND WHEN YOU KNEW IT.  
28 MR. WHITTEKER HAD AN OLDER BROTHER NAMED ROY?

2020

1 A. YES.  
2 Q. AND MR. ROY WHITTEKER IS NO LONGER ALIVE; IS THAT  
3 RIGHT, MA'AM?  
4 A. YES.  
5 Q. AND MR. ROY WHITTEKER WAS A HEAVY SMOKER, WAS HE  
6 NOT?  
7 A. AS FAR AS I KNOW.  
8 Q. AND HE DIED FROM LUNG CANCER, DIDN'T HE, MA'AM?  
9 A. THAT'S WHAT I'M TOLD.  
10 Q. AND YOU KNEW THAT HIS LUNG CANCER DEATH WAS  
11 ATTRIBUTED TO HIS SMOKING CIGARETTES, DIDN'T YOU, MA'AM?  
12 A. THAT'S WHAT I WAS TOLD.  
13 Q. IN FACT, MR. WHITTEKER TOLD YOU THAT, DIDN'T HE?  
14 A. YES.  
15 Q. AND MR. ROY WHITTEKER DIED SOMETIME WHILE YOU  
16 WERE STILL LIVING IN VENTURA; IS THAT RIGHT?  
17 A. YES.  
18 Q. AND YOU LIVED ON ENTRADA DRIVE IN VENTURA FROM  
19 THE TIME YOU WERE MARRIED SOMETIME IN THE 1950S UNTIL 1974;  
20 IS THAT RIGHT?  
21 A. FROM 1955 UNTIL 1974.  
22 Q. AND MR. ROY WHITTEKER DIED FROM LUNG CANCER FROM  
23 SMOKING SOMETIME DURING THAT TIME PERIOD; IS THAT RIGHT?  
24 A. I DON'T REMEMBER WHAT TIME THAT WAS. I JUST  
25 REMEMBER I DIDN'T KNOW HIM WELL.  
26 Q. BUT YOU REMEMBER THAT IT WAS BEFORE YOU MOVED OUT  
27 OF YOUR HOME IN VENTURA?  
28 A. NO, I DON'T REMEMBER WHAT TIME IT WAS.

2021

1 Q. DO YOU REMEMBER GIVING YOUR DEPOSITION IN THIS  
2 CASE, MA'AM? DO YOU REMEMBER BEING ASKED SOME QUESTIONS IN  
3 OJAI NOT LONG AGO?  
4 A. YES, I DO.

5 Q. MRS. WHITTEKER, I'M GOING TO HAND YOU A COPY OF  
6 YOUR DEPOSITION.  
7 MRS. WHITTEKER, YOU GAVE THIS DEPOSITION SOMETIME  
8 IN NOVEMBER OF LAST YEAR.  
9 DO YOU REMEMBER THAT?  
10 A. YES, I REMEMBER.  
11 Q. AND MR. BROWN WAS THERE WITH YOU THAT DAY?  
12 A. YES.  
13 Q. AND YOU WERE UNDER OATH THAT DAY; DO YOU REMEMBER  
14 THAT, MA'AM?  
15 A. YES, I DO.  
16 Q. OKAY. I PROPOSE TO READ PAGE 127, LINES 1  
17 THROUGH 13.  
18 IN FACT, I BETTER START READING AT 126, LINE 17.  
19 A. EXCUSE ME. WHAT PAGE DID YOU SAY?  
20 Q. 126.  
21 MR. BROWN: LINE WHAT?  
22 MS. MASON: I BETTER START AT LINE 17.  
23 MR. BROWN: YES, THERE WILL BE AN OBJECTION.  
24 THE COURT: WHAT?  
25 MR. BROWN: HEARSAY.  
26 THE COURT: WHAT?  
27 MR. BROWN: HEARSAY.  
28 THE WITNESS: OKAY. I'M ON 1 --  
2022  
1 THE COURT: HOLD ON JUST A SECOND. THERE'S AN  
2 OBJECTION.  
3 IS THAT BEING OFFERED AS EVIDENCE OF THE TRUTH OR  
4 ACCURACY OF WHAT MR. MAY I JUST ASK YOU A QUESTION.  
5 THIS SAME TESTIMONY JUST WENT IN WITHOUT  
6 OBJECTION. YOU'RE MAKING NOW A HEARSAY OBJECTION BUT THE  
7 EVIDENCE --  
8 MR. BROWN: THERE IS MORE THAN THAT.  
9 THE COURT: THERE IS MORE THAN THAT HERE?  
10 MR. BROWN: FRANKLY, I'LL MOVE TO STRIKE THE  
11 OTHER EVIDENCE.  
12 THE COURT: I'M NOT GOING TO STRIKE SOMETHING  
13 THAT'S ALREADY BEEN TESTIFIED TO.  
14 MS. MASON: YOUR HONOR, IT GOES TO STATE OF MIND  
15 AND VERACITY.  
16 THE COURT: HOLD ON. IF THERE'S MORE HERE, I  
17 BETTER READ THE WHOLE THING.  
18 ARE YOU OFFERING WHAT MRS. WHITTEKER'S HUSBAND  
19 TOLD HER AS EVIDENCE OF THE TRUTH OR ACCURACY OF WHAT WAS  
20 TOLD HER, OR ARE YOU OFFERING IT AS EVIDENCE THAT SHE WAS  
21 TOLD THAT AS BEARING ON HER STATE OF MIND?  
22 MS. MASON: THE LATTER, YOUR HONOR.  
23 THE COURT: THAT TAKES CARE OF THE HEARSAY  
24 OBJECTION.  
25 NOW, IS THERE ANY OTHER OBJECTION?  
26 MR. BROWN: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
27 THE COURT: I'M GOING TO ALLOW THIS TO BE READ.  
28 LET ME JUST EXPLAIN TO THE JURY AGAIN. THAT  
2023  
1 PASSAGE INCLUDES SOME TESTIMONY, APPARENTLY, ABOUT WHAT  
2 MRS. PATSY WHITTEKER'S HUSBAND TOLD HER.  
3 THAT'S NOT BEING OFFERED AT THIS TIME FOR THE  
4 TRUTH OR THE ACCURACY OF WHAT SHE WAS TOLD, BUT MERELY AS  
5 EVIDENCE THAT SHE WAS TOLD THAT AS BEARING ON HER STATE OF  
6 MIND OR UNDERSTANDING.  
7 SO YOU MAY CONSIDER IT ONLY FOR THE PURPOSE FOR  
8 WHICH IT'S OFFERED, BUT NOT FOR THE BROADER PURPOSE OF ITS  
9 TRUTH OR ACCURACY.

10 NOW, YOU MAY READ.  
11 MS. MASON: PAGE 126, MA'AM, LINE 17. LET ME  
12 READ THAT.  
13 "QUESTION: WELL, DO YOU RECALL HOW OLD YOU WERE  
14 WHEN MR. ROY WHITTEKER DIED?  
15 "ANSWER: NO. WE WERE MARRIED AND LIVING IN  
16 VENTURA, BUT I HAVE NO IDEA WHAT YEAR IT WAS.  
17 "QUESTION: SO YOU WERE LIVING ON ENTRADA  
18 DRIVE --  
19 "ANSWER: YES.  
20 "QUESTION: -- WHEN MR. WHITTEKER DIED.  
21 "AND DID YOU RECEIVE NEWS THAT MR. WHITTEKER HAD  
22 DIED?  
23 "ANSWER: OF COURSE. HIS BROTHER DOYLE PHONED  
24 HIM.  
25 "QUESTION: DID YOUR HUSBAND EVER ATTRIBUTE HIS  
26 CONDITION, HIS LUNG CANCER CONDITION, TO SMOKING  
27 CIGARETTES?  
28 "ANSWER: YES.  
2024  
1 "QUESTION: AND DID HE RELAY THAT INFORMATION TO  
2 YOU?  
3 "ANSWER: YES.  
4 "QUESTION: AND THAT WAS WHEN YOU WERE LIVING ON  
5 ENTRADA DRIVE IN VENTURA, MA'AM?  
6 "ANSWER: YES.  
7 "QUESTION: AND YOU MOVED TO OJAI, I BELIEVE, IN  
8 197- --  
9 "ANSWER: '4.  
10 "QUESTION: -- '4. OKAY.  
11 "ANSWER: IN JUNE OF 1974."  
12 Q. DID I READ THAT CORRECTLY, MA'AM?  
13 MR. BROWN: YOUR HONOR --  
14 THE WITNESS: YES, YOU READ THAT CORRECTLY.  
15 THE COURT: LET ME JUST BE SURE. MY LIMITING  
16 INSTRUCTION APPLIED NOT ONLY TO WHAT MR. WHITTEKER SAID TO  
17 MRS. WHITTEKER, BUT ALSO TO ANYTHING THAT THE BROTHER DOYLE  
18 SAID.  
19 MR. BROWN: YOUR HONOR, MAY I ASK HER TO READ  
20 JUST TWO MORE LINES?  
21 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION TO DOING THAT?  
22 MS. MASON: THROUGH LINE 17?  
23 MR. BROWN: I'D LIKE YOU TO READ LINE 23 ON PAGE  
24 127 OVER THROUGH LINE 1 OF 128.  
25 MS. MASON: I HAVE NO PROBLEM READING THAT.  
26 LET'S START WITH LINE 15.  
27 MR. BROWN: NO. WELL, WHERE ARE YOU?  
28 MS. MASON: LET'S JUST READ IT IN CONTEXT.  
2025  
1 LET'S JUST CONTINUE THE READING.  
2 MR. BROWN: OKAY. WHATEVER.  
3 MS. MASON: "QUESTION: DID -- I'M SORRY.  
4 "ANSWER: WE BOUGHT THE HOUSE IN MARCH, BUT WE  
5 DIDN'T MOVE UNTIL JUNE BECAUSE OF SCHOOL.  
6 "QUESTION: I SEE. SO THIS ALL OCCURRED BEFORE  
7 YOU MOVED TO --  
8 "ANSWER: OH, YES.  
9 "QUESTION: -- OJAI.  
10 "ANSWER: LONG TIME.  
11 "QUESTION: DID YOU ATTRIBUTE MR. WHITTEKER'S  
12 DEATH TO SMOKING CIGARETTES?  
13 "ANSWER: I DIDN'T KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT IT. I  
14 JUST KNOW WHAT THEY SAID.

15 "QUESTION: BUT YOUR HUSBAND SAID THAT IT  
16 WAS --"  
17 MR. BROWN: YOUR HONOR, THAT'S WHAT I ASKED HER  
18 TO READ.  
19 MS. MASON: I'M SORRY?  
20 MR. BROWN: I JUST ASKED HER TO STOP RIGHT  
21 THERE, THROUGH LINE 1, YOUR HONOR.  
22 MS. MASON: YOUR HONOR, I NEED TO FINISH THE  
23 NEXT THREE LINES THEN.  
24 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?  
25 MR. BROWN: IF YOU ARE GOING ON AND ON, LET ME  
26 SEE WHAT IT IS.  
27 THE COURT: IS THERE ANY OBJECTION? SHE WANTS  
28 TO READ TWO MORE LINES.  
2026  
1 ANY OBJECTION?  
2 MR. BROWN: NOW WE ARE TALKING ABOUT HEARSAY ON  
3 HEARSAY.  
4 THE COURT: WE ARE NOT TALKING ABOUT HEARSAY ON  
5 HEARSAY. BUT I'M GIVING THE SAME LIMITING INSTRUCTION THAT  
6 I JUST GAVE YOU FOR THE NEXT COUPLE OF LINES.  
7 MR. BROWN: ACTUALLY, GO RIGHT AHEAD. I HAVE NO  
8 OBJECTION.  
9 CAN I SEE HOW FAR SHE OUGHT TO READ IT, YOUR  
10 HONOR?  
11 DOWN THROUGH 16. DOWN THROUGH LINE 16.  
12 MS. MASON: THAT'S FINE, YOUR HONOR.  
13 THE COURT: OKAY.  
14 MS. MASON: "QUESTION: BUT YOUR HUSBAND SAID  
15 THAT IT WAS --  
16 "ANSWER: WELL, HE SAID --  
17 "QUESTION: -- THAT HE ATTRIBUTED TO THE SMOKING  
18 CIGARETTES?  
19 "ANSWER: HE SAID THAT HIS BROTHER TOLD HIM  
20 THAT.  
21 "QUESTION: HIS BROTHER --  
22 "ANSWER: HIS BROTHER DOYLE.  
23 "QUESTION: HIS BROTHER DOYLE. OKAY.  
24 "DO YOU KNOW IF MR. ROY WHITTEKER EVER VISITED  
25 YOUR FAMILY WHILE MS. WHITELEY WAS GROWING UP?  
26 "ANSWER: NO, HE NEVER DID.  
27 "QUESTION: DID YOUR HUSBAND EVER TALK TO YOUR  
28 CHILDREN ABOUT MR. WHITTEKER AND -- MR. ROY  
2027  
1 WHITTEKER AND WHY HE HAD DIED?  
2 "ANSWER: NO."  
3 Q. DID I READ THAT CORRECTLY, MA'AM?  
4 A. YES, YOU DID.  
5 Q. OKAY, MA'AM. AND YOU KNEW, AT LEAST BEFORE YOU  
6 MOVED TO OJAI IN 1974, THAT MR. ROY WHITTEKER'S DEATH, HIS  
7 LUNG CANCER DEATH HAD BEEN ATTRIBUTED TO SMOKING; IS THAT  
8 RIGHT?  
9 A. YES. I KNEW IT HAD TO DO WITH SMOKING.  
10 Q. ALL RIGHT. AND MRS. WHITTEKER, MR. ROY WHITTEKER  
11 ISN'T THE ONLY DEATH THAT YOU'RE AWARE OF THAT HAS BEEN  
12 ASSOCIATED IN YOUR FAMILY TO SMOKING; IS THAT RIGHT?  
13 A. IN MY FAMILY?  
14 Q. YES.  
15 A. OR IN MY HUSBAND'S FAMILY?  
16 Q. LET'S TALK FOR A MINUTE ABOUT YOUR FAMILY.  
17 A. NO, I DON'T KNOW THAT ANYONE IN MY FAMILY'S DEATH  
18 WAS ATTRIBUTED TO SMOKING.  
19 Q. OKAY. LET'S TALK FOR A FEW MINUTES,

20 MRS. WHITTEKER, ABOUT YOUR FATHER.  
21 A. YES.  
22 Q. MA'AM, YOU'VE HEARD CIGARETTES REFERRED TO AS  
23 "COFFIN NAILS"; ISN'T THAT RIGHT?  
24 A. I HAVE HEARD THAT.  
25 Q. AND YOU HEARD THAT FROM YOUR FATHER, MA'AM,  
26 DIDN'T YOU?  
27 A. YES. HE WORKED IN THE OIL FIELDS.  
28 Q. YOU HEARD YOUR FATHER REFER TO CIGARETTES AS  
2028  
1 COFFIN NAILS A VERY LONG TIME AGO?  
2 A. BUT IT CAN -- COULD HAVE ONLY BEEN A FEW TIMES.  
3 THAT WAS YEARS AGO.  
4 Q. YOUR FATHER HAS PASSED AWAY, HASN'T HE, MA'AM?  
5 A. YES.  
6 Q. AND HE DIED IN 1968; IS THAT RIGHT?  
7 A. YES.  
8 Q. AND YOUR FATHER WAS A SMOKER, WASN'T HE, MRS.  
9 WHITTEKER?  
10 A. YES.  
11 Q. AND YOUR FATHER KNEW YOUR CHILDREN VERY WELL,  
12 DIDN'T HE, MA'AM?  
13 A. OF COURSE.  
14 Q. IN FACT, HE ONLY LIVED ABOUT FOUR MILES FROM YOUR  
15 HOUSE IN VENTURA?  
16 A. YES. I WOULD SAY FOUR MILES.  
17 Q. AND HE WOULD COME AND VISIT YOUR FAMILY QUITE  
18 OFTEN; ISN'T THAT RIGHT?  
19 A. WE WENT TO SEE HIM.  
20 Q. AND YOUR CHILDREN KNEW THAT HE SMOKED; ISN'T THAT  
21 RIGHT?  
22 A. YES.  
23 Q. AND MRS. WHITTEKER, YOUR FATHER HAD EMPHYSEMA,  
24 DIDN'T HE?  
25 A. THAT'S WHAT THE DOCTOR SAID.  
26 Q. AND THE DOCTOR ALSO TOLD HIM THAT HIS EMPHYSEMA  
27 WAS CAUSED BY SMOKING?  
28 MR. BROWN: OBJECTION. HEARSAY.  
2029  
1 THE COURT: AGAIN, I'M GOING TO GIVE THE  
2 LIMITING INSTRUCTION --  
3 MR. BROWN: ALSO, FOUNDATION ON WHAT HIS DOCTOR  
4 TOLD HIM.  
5 THE COURT: WELL, YES. WHY DON'T YOU REPHRASE  
6 THE QUESTION. AND THEN IF THERE IS AN OBJECTION ON HEARSAY,  
7 I WILL GIVE A LIMITING INSTRUCTION.  
8 I THINK THE QUESTION IS A LITTLE UNCLEAR.  
9 MS. MASON: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.  
10 Q. MRS. WHITTEKER, YOU KNOW, DON'T YOU, THAT YOUR  
11 FATHER'S EMPHYSEMA WAS ATTRIBUTED TO SMOKING?  
12 MR. BROWN: OBJECTION. SAME OBJECTION. IT JUST  
13 WALKS AROUND IT. FOUNDATION.  
14 THE COURT: PEOPLE ARE TRYING TO GIVE ME SOME  
15 LAW SCHOOL QUESTIONS.  
16 THIS IS BEING OFFERED NOT AS EVIDENCE THAT IT  
17 ACTUALLY WAS ATTRIBUTED TO SMOKING, BUT AS BEARING ON THE  
18 WITNESS' UNDERSTANDING, HER STATE OF MIND, THAT IT WAS  
19 ATTRIBUTED TO SMOKING.  
20 IS THAT IT?  
21 MS. MASON: YES, YOUR HONOR.  
22 THE COURT: OKAY. THAT'S NOT HEARSAY.  
23 MR. BROWN: THE FORM OF THE QUESTION IS "YOU  
24 KNEW THAT IT WAS ATTRIBUTED."

25 THE FOUNDATION -- WE DON'T KNOW IF THE HOLY GHOST  
26 TOLD HER. WE NEED TO KNOW HOW SHE KNEW THAT.  
27 THE COURT: CAN YOU MAKE THE QUESTION MORE  
28 SPECIFIC?  
2030  
1 MS. MASON: SURE.  
2 Q. MRS. WHITTEKER, YOU ACTUALLY SPOKE TO YOUR FATHER  
3 ABOUT HIS SMOKING, DIDN'T YOU?  
4 A. NO, I DID NOT.  
5 Q. YOU DIDN'T HAVE CONVERSATIONS WITH YOUR FATHER  
6 ABOUT WHAT HIS EMPHYSEMA WAS ATTRIBUTED TO?  
7 A. NO. I TALKED TO MY SISTER.  
8 Q. YOU TALKED TO YOUR SISTER ABOUT WHAT YOUR  
9 FATHER'S EMPHYSEMA WAS ATTRIBUTED TO; IS THAT RIGHT?  
10 A. YES.  
11 Q. AND SHE TOLD YOU THAT HIS EMPHYSEMA WAS  
12 ATTRIBUTED TO CIGARETTE SMOKING; ISN'T THAT RIGHT?  
13 A. NO.  
14 MR. BROWN: OBJECTION. HEARSAY.  
15 THE COURT: OKAY.  
16 MR. BROWN: I'M SORRY. I WALKED OVER HER LINE  
17 THERE.  
18 I DON'T KNOW WHAT SHE SAID. MAYBE SHE JUST  
19 ANSWERED.  
20 IF SHE DID, I WILL WITHDRAW THE OBJECTION.  
21 THE COURT: DO YOU WANT TO READ BACK WHAT SHE  
22 SAID. I THINK SHE WAS INTERRUPTED BY YOUR OBJECTION. SHE  
23 STARTED TO ANSWER.  
24 WHY DON'T YOU READ BACK WHAT PART OF THE ANSWER  
25 HAS BEEN GIVEN, AND THEN WE'LL SEE IF THERE'S AN OBJECTION.  
26 (RECORD READ)  
27 MR. BROWN: NO OBJECTION.  
28 MS. MASON: Q. MRS. WHITTEKER, DO YOU STILL  
2031  
1 HAVE YOUR DEPOSITION THERE IN FRONT OF YOU?  
2 A. YES, I DO.  
3 Q. LET ME ASK YOU A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT QUESTION.  
4 YOU CAME TO KNOW THAT YOUR FATHER'S EMPHYSEMA WAS  
5 CAUSED BY CIGARETTE SMOKING, DIDN'T YOU?  
6 A. PROBABLY IN THE '90S.  
7 Q. YOU DIDN'T KNOW IT IN 1968?  
8 A. NO.  
9 Q. OKAY. MA'AM, WHY DON'T YOU LOOK WITH ME AT PAGE  
10 124 OF YOUR DEPOSITION, LINE 24 -- LINES 7 THROUGH 19.  
11 A. OKAY.  
12 MR. BROWN: 7 THROUGH 19. THAT'S WHAT YOU ARE  
13 TALKING ABOUT?  
14 MS. MASON: YES.  
15 THE COURT: I'D LIKE TO SPEED THIS UP.  
16 MR. BROWN, ARE THERE ANY OBJECTIONS?  
17 MR. BROWN: THERE'S NO OBJECTION.  
18 THE COURT: OKAY. YOU MAY READ.  
19 MS. MASON: YOUR HONOR, MAY I ASK ONE QUESTION?  
20 THE COURT: THEN YOU CAN READ.  
21 THERE'S NO OBJECTION.  
22 MS. MASON: THANK YOU.  
23 Q. MRS. WHITTEKER, YOUR FATHER'S NAME WAS MR.  
24 ROBERSON; IS THAT CORRECT?  
25 A. YES. RAY ROBERSON.  
26 Q. IF YOU'LL READ WITH ME MA'AM, PAGE 124, LINE 7.  
27 A. YES.  
28 Q. "QUESTION: DO YOU RECALL HOW SOON BEFORE HE DIED  
2032

1 IN 1968 THAT HIS DOCTOR TOLD HIM THAT -- THAT -- I'M SORRY.  
2 LET ME FINISH THE QUESTION.  
3 "I'M JUST KIND OF -- WENT KIND OF -- HAD  
4 A LITTLE DREAM THERE. SORRY. NEED MORE COFFEE.  
5 "DO YOU KNOW HOW SOON BEFORE MR. ROBERSON'S  
6 DEATH IN 1968 THAT HIS DOCTOR TOLD HIM THAT HIS  
7 EMPHYSEMA AND HIS HEART CONDITION WERE RELATED TO  
8 HIS CIGARETTE SMOKING?  
9 "ANSWER: NO, I COULDN'T TELL YOU THE TIME. I  
10 DON'T KNOW. I HAD MY OWN FAMILY TO TAKE CARE OF.  
11 "QUESTION: BUT YOU WERE AWARE OF IT, PRIOR TO  
12 1968, THAT HIS DOCTOR HAD TOLD HIM THESE THINGS?  
13 "ANSWER: PROBABLY DURING 1968 SOMETIME."  
14 DID I READ THAT CORRECTLY, MA'AM?  
15 A. YES, YOU DID.  
16 AND I PROBABLY MISSPOKE, BECAUSE I WAS -- MY  
17 SISTER THAT TOLD ME THAT THE DOCTOR HAD TOLD MY MOTHER, WHO  
18 HAD TOLD HER, THAT IT MIGHT HAVE BEEN CIGARETTE SMOKING.  
19 Q. AND, MA'AM, YOUR FATHER ULTIMATELY DIED OF A  
20 HEART ATTACK; ISN'T THAT RIGHT?  
21 A. YES, HE DID.  
22 Q. AND HE HAD A HEART CONDITION; ISN'T THAT RIGHT?  
23 A. NO, HE HAD A SUDDEN HEART ATTACK THAT KILLED HIM.  
24 Q. YOUR FATHER DIDN'T HAVE A HEART CONDITION, MA'AM?  
25 A. NOT THAT I KNOW OF.  
26 Q. ALL RIGHT. YOUR DEPOSITION, MA'AM, PAGE 123 --  
27 PAGE 122, LINE 22 THROUGH LINE 13.  
28 THE COURT: OF WHAT PAGE?  
2033  
1 MS. MASON: I'M SORRY, YOUR HONOR.  
2 PAGE 123, LINE 13.  
3 THE WITNESS: DID YOU SAY 123 OR 122?  
4 MS. MASON: Q. BEGINNING ON PAGE 122.  
5 A. OKAY.  
6 Q. LINE 22, THROUGH 123, LINE -- WE MIGHT AS WELL GO  
7 THROUGH LINE 22.  
8 MR. BROWN: THERE'S SOME HEARSAY IN THERE, YOUR  
9 HONOR. NOT PARTICULARLY ALL OF IT, BUT SOME OF IT.  
10 THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. TO THE EXTENT THAT THIS  
11 PASSAGE SHOWS THAT MRS. WHITTEKER WAS TOLD VARIOUS THINGS,  
12 THIS IS NOT BEING OFFERED FOR THE TRUTH OR THE ACCURACY OF  
13 WHAT SHE WAS TOLD, BUT MERELY AS EVIDENCE THAT SHE WAS TOLD  
14 IT AND BEARING ON HER STATE OF MIND.  
15 SO YOU MAY CONSIDER IT ONLY FOR THAT PURPOSE.  
16 MS. MASON: THANK YOU.  
17 Q. PAGE 122, LINE 22, DO YOU HAVE IT THERE IN FRONT  
18 OF YOU?  
19 A. YES.  
20 Q. "QUESTION: DO YOU KNOW WHAT YOUR FATHER DIED OF?  
21 "ANSWER: YES. HE DIED OF A HEART ATTACK.  
22 "QUESTION: DID HE DIE OF -- DID HE HAVE  
23 EMPHYSEMA?  
24 "ANSWER: BEFORE THAT, HE HAD EMPHYSEMA, BUT IT  
25 WASN'T HORRIBLE. I MEAN, HE DIDN'T CARRY THE  
26 BACKPACK, YOU KNOW.  
27 "QUESTION: WOULD HE EVER ATTRIBUTE THAT TO ANY  
28 SPECIFIC CAUSE, HIS EMPHYSEMA?  
2034  
1 "ANSWER: HIS DOCTOR TOLD HIM TO QUIT SMOKING.  
2 "QUESTION: AND THAT WAS BEFORE HE DIED IN 1969?  
3 "ANSWER: YES.  
4 "QUESTION: DID HE TELL YOU THAT, THAT HIS --  
5 "ANSWER: YES.

6 "QUESTION: -- THAT HIS DOCTOR TOLD HIM TO QUIT  
7 SMOKING?  
8 "ANSWER: YES.  
9 "QUESTION: DID HE OR DID YOU BELIEVE AT ANY  
10 TIME THAT MAYBE HIS HEART CONDITION WAS ALSO  
11 RELATED TO SMOKING?  
12 "ANSWER: WELL, THAT'S WHAT THE DOCTOR SAID.  
13 "QUESTION: SO THAT HIS -- I'M SORRY. YOUR  
14 FATHER'S -- MR. ROBERSON'S DOCTOR --  
15 "ANSWER: MY FATHER --  
16 "QUESTION: -- TOLD HIM THAT?  
17 "ANSWER: YES.  
18 "QUESTION: -- HIS HEART CONDITION WAS ALSO  
19 RELATED TO SMOKING?  
20 "ANSWER: YES, THAT'S WHAT HE TOLD HIM.  
21 "QUESTION: AND THAT WAS IN 1969 -- BEFORE  
22 1969 -- OH, I'M SORRY. -  
23 "ANSWER: EXCUSE ME. I'M SORRY.  
24 "QUESTION: THAT'S OKAY. CAN WE CONTINUE?  
25 "ANSWER: YEAH.  
26 "QUESTION: OKAY. AND THAT WAS BEFORE MR.  
27 ROBERSON'S DEATH IN 1969; IS THAT CORRECT, MA'AM?  
28 "ANSWER: HE DIED IN 1968."

2035

1 DID I READ THAT CORRECTLY, MRS. WHITTEKER?  
2 A. YES, YOU DID.  
3 Q. OKAY. MRS. WHITTEKER, LET'S TURN BRIEFLY TO TALK  
4 ABOUT SOME OF THE ACTIVITIES LESLIE ENGAGED IN WHILE SHE WAS  
5 GROWING UP.  
6 AND I BELIEVE YOU HAVE ALREADY TOLD US,  
7 MRS. WHITTEKER, THAT LESLIE GRADUATED FROM HIGH SCHOOL AT  
8 THE AGE OF 16; IS THAT RIGHT?  
9 A. YES, SHE DID.  
10 Q. AND MA'AM, YOU DIDN'T KNOW THAT LESLIE WAS  
11 SMOKING MARIJUANA IN HIGH SCHOOL, DID YOU?  
12 A. NO, I DID NOT.  
13 Q. AND YOU DIDN'T KNOW THAT SHE WAS DRINKING ALCOHOL  
14 WHILE SHE WAS IN HIGH SCHOOL, DID YOU?  
15 A. NO, I DID NOT.  
16 Q. AND IN FACT, MA'AM, YOU DIDN'T KNOW SHE BEGAN TO  
17 SMOKE AT THE AGE OF 13; ISN'T THAT RIGHT?  
18 A. THAT'S RIGHT.  
19 Q. AND DID I UNDERSTAND YOU CORRECTLY,  
20 MRS. WHITTEKER, THAT YOU DIDN'T KNOW THAT LESLIE WAS  
21 SUSPENDED FROM HIGH SCHOOL FOR SMOKING; IS THAT RIGHT?  
22 A. YOU'RE CORRECT. I WOULD HAVE BEEN QUITE UPSET.  
23 Q. YOU JUST DIDN'T KNOW IT AT THE TIME IT HAPPENED?  
24 A. I DIDN'T KNOW IT.  
25 Q. YOU'VE NEVER HEARD OR SEEN ANYTHING ENTITLED "THE  
26 FRANK STATEMENT TO CIGARETTE SMOKERS"; IS THAT RIGHT?  
27 A. I'M NOT SURE I UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU MEAN BY THE  
28 "FRANK STATEMENT."

2036

1 Q. "THE FRANK STATEMENT TO CIGARETTE SMOKERS" THAT  
2 WAS PUBLISHED IN THE 1950S, YOU'VE NEVER SEEN, HAVE YOU?  
3 A. IN THE '50S?  
4 Q. CORRECT.  
5 A. NO, I NEVER SAW THAT.  
6 Q. AND THAT WASN'T ANYTHING YOU EVER DISCUSSED IN  
7 YOUR HOUSEHOLD, WAS IT, MA'AM?  
8 A. NO, IT WASN'T.  
9 MS. MASON: THANK YOU, MA'AM. THAT'S ALL I  
10 HAVE.



11 MR. BROWN: JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS YOUR  
12 HONOR.  
13 THE COURT: ANYBODY ELSE?  
14 MR. ROSSE: YES, YOUR HONOR.  
15 MR. BROWN: I'M SORRY.  
16 MR. ROSSE: I KNOW I'M EASY TO FORGET.  
17  
18 CROSS-EXAMINATION  
19 BY MR. ROSSE: Q. I JUST HAD A COUPLE OF  
20 QUESTIONS FOR YOU, MRS. WHITTEKER.  
21 A. YES.  
22 Q. DID YOUR DAUGHTER ATTEND KINDERGARTEN?  
23 A. YES, SHE DID.  
24 Q. DID SHE START IN THE FALL OF 1964? LET ME REASK  
25 THAT.  
26 A. SHE JUST -- JUST BEFORE THE AGE OF FIVE. SHE  
27 STARTED WHEN SHE WAS LEGALLY OLD ENOUGH TO START.  
28 I CAN REMEMBER WHEN THEY WERE BORN, LOTS OF OTHER  
2037 DATES, BUT I'M AFRAID I CAN'T SAY EXACTLY, BECAUSE I KNOW IF  
I SAID WRONG, IT WILL BE THERE.  
3 Q. DO YOU KNOW WHAT YEAR SHE GRADUATED HIGH SCHOOL?  
4 A. I THINK IT WAS 1976.  
5 Q. AND THAT WAS ONE YEAR EARLIER THAN SHE WOULD  
6 HAVE, HAD SHE COMPLETED ALL THREE YEARS OF HIGH SCHOOL?  
7 A. YES.  
8 Q. I THINK YOU TALKED ABOUT THE SMALL CHILDREN WOULD  
9 PLAY IN THE LAUNDRY?  
10 A. SHE WAS THE SMALL CHILD THAT PLAYED IN THE  
11 LAUNDRY.  
12 Q. WHAT TIME OF DAY DID YOU DO THE LAUNDRY?  
13 A. AFTER THE CHILDREN WENT TO SCHOOL, THE OLDER  
14 CHILDREN.  
15 Q. SO ONCE THE CHILDREN HAD GONE TO SCHOOL OR ONCE  
16 THEY REACHED SCHOOL AGE, THEY NO LONGER PLAYED IN THE  
17 LAUNDRY?  
18 A. THAT'S RIGHT.  
19 Q. ONCE LESLIE STARTED GOING TO SCHOOL, SHE DIDN'T  
20 PLAY IN THE LAUNDRY ANYMORE?  
21 A. IT WOULD BE HARD TO SAY SHE PLAYED IN THE  
22 LAUNDRY. LET'S SAY SHE ENTERTAINED HERSELF AND STAYED OUT  
23 FROM UNDER MY FEET.  
24 Q. SHE NO LONGER DID THAT ONCE SHE STARTED SCHOOL?  
25 A. OH, ABSOLUTELY NOT.  
26 Q. AND LESLIE NEVER HELPED WITH THE LAUNDRY?  
27 A. NO.  
28 MR. ROSSE: THANK YOU.  
2038  
1 THE COURT: I THINK IT'S YOUR TURN AGAIN, MR.  
2 BROWN.  
3 MR. BROWN: JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS, MRS.  
4 WHITTEKER.  
5  
6 REDIRECT EXAMINATION  
7 BY MR. BROWN: Q. YOUR BROTHER-IN-LAW AND YOUR  
8 FATHER THAT WERE REFERRED TO -- I'LL ASK IT SEPARATELY.  
9 YOUR FATHER HAD SMOKED FOR HOW LONG BY THE TIME  
10 HE DIED?  
11 A. AS FAR AS I CAN REMEMBER, HE WAS ABOUT 14, WHEN  
12 HE LIVED IN TEXAS THAT HE STARTED SMOKING.  
13 Q. AND HOW OLD WAS HE WHEN HE DIED?  
14 A. '68. HE DIED IN 1968.  
15 Q. AND YOUR BROTHER-IN-LAW, DO YOU KNOW HOW OLD HE

16 WAS WHEN HE DIED?  
17 A. I HAVE NO IDEA. I ONLY MET HIM TWICE.  
18 Q. OKAY. WITH RESPECT TO WHATEVER LESLIE DID IN THE  
19 CLOTHES, DO YOU REMEMBER WHICH YEAR SHE STARTED THE FIRST  
20 GRADE?  
21 A. WELL, COUNTING BACK --  
22 Q. 11 WOULD BE '75. 11 FROM '75 -- '65, I MEAN.  
23 A. YES. IT COULDN'T BE '75.  
24 Q. THAT WOULD BE HARD.  
25 A. YES.  
26 Q. OKAY. LET ME JUST ASK YOU ONE OTHER QUESTION  
27 THAT RELATES TO THE QUESTIONS THAT WERE ASKED YOU ABOUT WHAT  
28 YOU KNEW.

2039

1 DID YOU EVER SEE BILLBOARDS IN THE VENTURA AREA  
2 UP UNTIL SOMETIME IN THE '90S THAT SAID ANYTHING ABOUT  
3 SMOKING AND HEALTH?  
4 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.  
5 THE WITNESS: I --  
6 THE COURT: JUST A SECOND.  
7 MR. ESCHER: EXCUSE ME.  
8 THE COURT: LEGAL GROUNDS?  
9 MR. ESCHER: LABELING ACT PREEMPTION, YOUR  
10 HONOR.  
11 THE COURT: SUSTAINED. IT'S OVERBROAD. THE  
12 QUESTION IS OVERBROAD IN TIME.  
13 THE WITNESS: COULD YOU REPEAT THAT.  
14 MR. BROWN: I'D LIKE TO HAVE A CONFERENCE ON  
15 THAT, YOUR HONOR. I DON'T THINK THE QUESTION IS UNDERSTOOD  
16 BY MR. ESCHER.  
17 THE COURT: OKAY.  
18 (COURT AND COUNSEL CONFER OUTSIDE  
19 THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY)  
20 MR. BROWN: Q. LET ME QUALIFY THE QUESTION.  
21 OTHER THAN CIGARETTE COMPANY ADVERTISEMENTS THAT  
22 YOU MAY OR MAY NOT HAVE SEEN, IN ALL THE TIME THAT YOU LIVED  
23 IN VENTURA, DID YOU EVER SEE A BILLBOARD WHICH CONTAINED  
24 SOME KIND OF A HEALTH MESSAGE ABOUT SMOKING CIGARETTES?  
25 A. NO, I NEVER SAW A MESSAGE. THEY ALWAYS SHOWED  
26 HEALTHY PEOPLE.  
27 Q. ALL RIGHT.  
28 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR.

2040

1 THE COURT: THAT WASN'T RESPONSIVE TO THE  
2 QUESTION.  
3 I'M GOING TO STRIKE THE PORTION ABOUT "THEY  
4 ALWAYS SHOWED HEALTHY PEOPLE." YOU MUST DISREGARD THAT.  
5 MR. BROWN: Q. I WASN'T ASKING FOR  
6 ADVERTISEMENTS; YOU UNDERSTAND THAT?  
7 THE COURT: THAT WASN'T THE QUESTION THAT WAS  
8 ASKED, AND THAT ANSWER EXCEEDED THE SCOPE OF THE QUESTION.  
9 AND SO I'M STRIKING IT.  
10 THE WITNESS: SORRY.  
11 THE COURT: I WILL LEAVE IN THE BALANCE OF THE  
12 ANSWER UP UNTIL WHERE THERE WAS THAT REFERENCE.  
13 MR. BROWN: OKAY.  
14 Q. NOW, CAN YOU RECALL EVER HAVING A DISCUSSION WITH  
15 ANY PERSON ABOUT THE EFFECTS OF CIGARETTE SMOKING, IN A  
16 GENERAL WAY NOW?  
17 I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT THOSE CONVERSATIONS WE JUST  
18 REFERRED TO ON DIRECT.  
19 BUT PUTTING THOSE ASIDE, DO YOU RECALL EVER  
20 HEARING OR BEING INVOLVED IN ANY CONVERSATION UP UNTIL THE

21 '90S IN WHICH THE GENERAL SUBJECT WAS WHAT CIGARETTES COULD  
22 DO TO YOU IF YOU SMOKED THEM?  
23 A. NO.  
24 Q. ANY DISCUSSION AT ALL?  
25 A. NO, I DON'T RECALL ANY DISCUSSION LIKE THAT.  
26 Q. AND THAT'S WITH YOUR FAMILY, WITH YOUR FRIENDS,  
27 WITH PEOPLE YOU BARELY KNEW. NO DISCUSSION AT ALL?  
28 A. NO.

2041

1 MR. BROWN: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.  
2 THE COURT: ANYTHING FURTHER BY ANYBODY FOR  
3 MRS. WHITTEKER?  
4 MS. MASON: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
5 MR. ROSSE: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
6 THE COURT: YOU MAY STEP DOWN.  
7 (WITNESS EXCUSED)  
8 THE COURT: LET ME JUST TELL THE JURORS, I'M  
9 GOING TO GIVE YOU -- WHEN WE TAKE THE RECESS THIS MORNING,  
10 I'M GOING TO KEEP IT A LITTLE BIT SHORTER, LIKE MAYBE 15  
11 MINUTES.  
12 AFTER THE NOON HOUR, I WANT TO SPEND A FEW MORE  
13 MINUTES WITH THE LAWYERS, SEEING IF WE CAN CONTINUE TO  
14 EXPEDITE THE PROCESS BY WORKING ON SOME OF THE DOCUMENTS  
15 TOGETHER.  
16 SO I'M GOING TO ACTUALLY GIVE YOU AN EXTRA HALF  
17 HOUR FOR LUNCH TODAY, WITH THE ANTICIPATION THAT THAT WILL  
18 EXPEDITE MATTERS.  
19 SO I'M GOING TO GIVE YOU FROM 12:00 TO 2:00 FOR  
20 LUNCH. IF YOU WANT TO PLAN TO DO ANYTHING AT LUNCH, YOU'LL  
21 HAVE AN EXTRA HALF HOUR.  
22 WHO IS THE NEXT WITNESS?  
23 MS. CHABER: THE PLAINTIFF WOULD CALL TO THE  
24 STAND DR. RICHARD POLLAY.  
25 I WILL GO FIND HIM.  
26 THE COURT: OKAY.  
27 THE CLERK: PLEASE COME FORWARD. PLEASE STAND  
28 RIGHT HERE AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND.

2042

1 TESTIMONY OF  
2 RICHARD W. POLLAY, PH.D.,  
3 A WITNESS CALLED ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFFS, HAVING BEEN  
4 DULY SWORN, TESTIFIED AS FOLLOWS:  
5 THE CLERK: PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME.  
6 THE WITNESS: RICHARD W. POLLAY, P-O-L-L-A-Y.  
7 THE CLERK: THANK YOU. PLEASE TAKE THE STAND.  
8  
9 DIRECT EXAMINATION  
10 BY MR. CHABER: Q. GOOD MORNING, DR. POLLAY.  
11 A. GOOD MORNING.  
12 Q. ARE YOU A MEDICAL DOCTOR?  
13 A. I AM NOT. I'M A DOCTOR IN AN ACADEMIC SENSE.  
14 I'M A PROFESSOR OF BUSINESS.  
15 Q. AND WHERE DO YOU HAVE YOUR PROFESSORSHIP?  
16 A. AT THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA, FACULTY OF  
17 COMMERCE, WHICH IS OUR WAY OF SAYING THE SCHOOL OF BUSINESS.  
18 Q. AND CAN YOU TELL US -- WE'LL COME BACK TO YOUR  
19 TELLING US WHAT THAT WORK ENTAILS.  
20 WERE YOU BORN HERE IN THE UNITED STATES?  
21 A. I WAS. I WAS BORN AND RAISED IN CONNECTICUT.  
22 Q. AND YOU ATTENDED ALL YOUR SCHOOLING HERE IN THE  
23 UNITED STATES?  
24 A. I DID. I DID AN UNDERGRADUATE DEGREE AT AN  
25 ENGINEERING SCHOOL IN NEW YORK STATE.

26 AND THEN I DID BOTH A MASTER'S DEGREE AND A PH.D.  
27 DEGREE AT THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO.

28 Q. AND YOU ARE U.S. RESIDENT?

2043

1 A. RESIDENT?

2 Q. NO. EXCUSE ME. ARE YOU A U.S. CITIZEN?

3 A. I'M A U.S. CITIZEN AND A RESIDENT OF CANADA.

4 Q. BEING A U.S. CITIZEN, EVEN THOUGH YOU LIVE  
5 SOMEWHERE ELSE, MEANS YOU KEEP PAYING YOUR TAXES AND THAT  
6 KIND OF THING?

7 A. IT MEANS I HAVE TO FILE TAXES BOTH HERE AND  
8 THERE.

9 Q. OKAY. HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN AT THE UNIVERSITY  
10 OF BRITISH COLUMBIA?

11 A. I'VE BEEN THERE SINCE 1970. I'VE HAD SABBATICALS  
12 FROM TIME TO TIME. I HAVE HAD A YEAR OFF IN ORDER TO DO  
13 OTHER THINGS.

14 BUT IT'S ALMOST 30 YEARS NOW SINCE I STARTED AT  
15 THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA.

16 Q. TELL US A LITTLE BIT ABOUT YOUR SCHOOLING, THE  
17 DEGREES THAT YOU GOT, THE AREAS OF STUDY.

18 A. MY UNDERGRADUATE EDUCATION WAS IN A FIELD CALLED  
19 MANAGEMENT ENGINEERING, WHICH IS A MIXTURE OF GENERAL  
20 ENGINEERING PROGRAMS WITH BUSINESS STUDIES, IN ORDER TO  
21 TRAIN PEOPLE TO BECOME EXECUTIVES IN TECHNICAL INDUSTRIES.  
22 THIS WAS IN THE LATE 1950S, EARLY 1960S.

23 AND THEN, BECAUSE I ENJOYED THAT BUSINESS ASPECT,  
24 I WENT ON TO DO GRADUATE WORK AT THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO,  
25 WHERE I STUDIED MARKETING AND WORKED FOR AWHILE FOR GENERAL  
26 ELECTRIC.

27 AND AFTER THAT, I WENT BACK TO SCHOOL AND IN MY  
28 PH.D. WORK DID STUDIES IN CONSUMER BEHAVIOR, THE

2044

1 APPLICATIONS OF, PRIMARILY, PSYCHOLOGY, BUT SOME OTHER  
2 SOCIAL SCIENCES, LIKE ANTHROPOLOGY AND SOCIOLOGY, TO THE  
3 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT MAKES CONSUMERS BEHAVE THE WAY THEY DO  
4 AND HOW THE BUSINESS BEHAVIOR LIKE ADVERTISING INFLUENCES  
5 CONSUMERS.

6 Q. DID IT HAVE A TITLE, THE PROGRAM THAT YOU WERE  
7 IN?

8 A. IT WAS A BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES FOR BUSINESS PH.D.  
9 PROGRAM IN THE BUSINESS SCHOOL AT THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO.

10 Q. AND DID IT INCLUDE ISSUES OF THE ETHICS OF  
11 BUSINESSES WITH RESPECT TO CONSUMERS?

12 A. IT DOES. AS DOES, OF COURSE, THE TEACHING I HAVE  
13 BEEN ENGAGED IN EVER SINCE THEN. ITS ETHICAL ASPECTS ARE  
14 CONSTANT IN ALL BUSINESS STUDIES.

15 I MEAN, ALMOST ALL BUSINESS DECISIONS INVOLVE  
16 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS.

17 Q. YOU ARE NOT A PSYCHOLOGIST; IS THAT CORRECT?

18 A. WELL, I WAS A MEMBER OF THE AMERICAN  
19 PSYCHOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION FOR A WHILE. I TRAINED AS  
20 PSYCHOLOGIST, BUT I'M NOT A PSYCHOLOGIST IN THE SENSE OF A  
21 CLINICAL PSYCHOLOGIST TREATING PATIENTS ONE ON ONE.

22 Q. TO UNDERSTAND THE TYPE OF ISSUES THAT YOU LOOK  
23 AT, THOUGH, YOU DO NEED TO BE FAMILIAR WITH AND UNDERSTAND  
24 PSYCHOLOGICAL PRINCIPLES?

25 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

26 Q. AND WE'LL COME BACK TO YOUR TEACHING IN A FEW  
27 MINUTES, BUT I JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND.

28 IN ADDITION TO GETTING YOUR PH.D. AND THE OTHER

2045

1 DEGREES THAT YOU'VE DESCRIBED, DID YOU DO ANY CONTINUING

2 EDUCATION WORK AT OTHER INSTITUTIONS?

3 A. I DID. MY FIRST SABBATICAL IN 1976 I HAD THE  
4 OPPORTUNITY TO SPEND AT HARVARD, WHERE I DID POSTDOCTORAL  
5 STUDIES, MEANING A YEAR'S WORTH OF STUDIES AFTER COMPLETING  
6 THE DOCTORATE DEGREE.

7 Q. AND WHAT WAS THAT?

8 A. AND I DID THAT IN BUSINESS HISTORY.

9 Q. CAN YOU TELL US WHAT YOU MEAN BY "BUSINESS  
10 HISTORY."

11 A. I WAS INTERESTED IN THE HISTORY OF ADVERTISING.  
12 AND IT TURNS OUT HARVARD HAS THE WORLD'S FOREMOST PROGRAM IN  
13 THE HISTORY OF BUSINESS PRACTICES AND A PHENOMENALLY GOOD  
14 LIBRARY.

15 SO I WENT THERE, SPENT A YEAR STUDYING UNDER SOME  
16 OF THE SENIOR MEMBERS OF THE FACULTY, USING THE LIBRARY  
17 MATERIALS AND WORKING ON A BOOK OF MY OWN.

18 Q. AND IN THE COURSE OF THAT, DID YOU HAVE TO LEARN  
19 HOW TO DO HISTORICAL RESEARCH RELATING TO BUSINESSES?

20 A. YES.

21 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR.  
22 VAGUE AS TO THE TERMS BEING USED HERE.

23 THE COURT: WELL, YOU CAN ASK HIM WHAT HE'S  
24 REFERRING TO AND THAT WILL CLARIFY IT.

25 WHY DON'T YOU ASK HIM WHAT HE'S REFERRING TO WITH  
26 THE "YES" ANSWER.

27 MS. CHABER: Q. WHAT WERE YOU REFERRING TO  
28 WHEN YOU SAID "YES" TO "HISTORICAL RESEARCH"?

2046

1 A. WELL, IN THE COURSE OF STUDIES THERE, ONE READ  
2 THE LEADING AND BEST KINDS OF RESEARCH BEING DONE IN THE  
3 FIELD. SO ONE -- BY EXAMPLE, ONE IS EXPOSED TO THE BEST  
4 RESEARCH METHODS AND THE BEST PRACTITIONERS OF BUSINESS  
5 HISTORY RESEARCH.

6 IN ADDITION, I DID MY OWN RESEARCH IN THE  
7 LIBRARY, WITH SOME SUPERVISION FROM THE FACULTY THERE.

8 Q. HOW WOULD YOU DESCRIBE BUSINESS HISTORY RESEARCH?

9 A. PRIMARILY, IT'S THE ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION  
10 OF HISTORICAL DOCUMENTS. THAT IS, THE KIND OF DOCUMENTS  
11 GENERATED WITHIN A BUSINESS IN THEIR ROUTINE CONDUCT OF  
12 ACTIVITIES.

13 AND MANY OF THOSE BECOME ARCHIVED OR SAVED IN  
14 SOME WAY. SO THAT, YEARS LATER, WHEN ONE GETS ACCESS TO  
15 THESE DOCUMENTS, YOU CAN PUT TOGETHER A PICTURE OF WHAT WAS  
16 GOING ON, WHY PEOPLE WERE DOING WHAT THEY WERE DOING, WHAT  
17 THE RATIONALIZATIONS WERE FOR VARIOUS DECISIONS PEOPLE MADE,  
18 WHAT THE CONSEQUENCES OF THOSE DECISIONS WERE, AND  
19 RECONSTRUCT THE THINKING OF THE TIME.

20 Q. AND IS THIS AN ACCEPTED PRACTICE -- I MEAN,  
21 YOU'RE NOT THE ONLY PERSON WHO DOES THIS TYPE OF BUSINESS  
22 HISTORICAL RESEARCH, ARE YOU?

23 A. THAT'S CORRECT. I'M NOT THE ONLY PERSON THAT  
24 DOES BUSINESS HISTORY RESEARCH. I'M ONE OF FEW THAT DOES  
25 WORK ON THE HISTORY OF ADVERTISING.

26 Q. IN THE COURSE OF YOUR WORK ON THE HISTORY OF  
27 ADVERTISING, YOU'VE PUBLISHED?

28 A. YES, EXTENSIVELY.

2047

1 Q. AND YOU'VE I THINK YOU SAID YOU WROTE A BOOK.  
2 IS THERE MORE THAN ONE?

3 A. THE FIRST MAJOR WORK I DID WAS A REFERENCE BOOK  
4 CALLED "INFORMATION SOURCES FOR ADVERTISING HISTORY."

5 Q. OKAY. YOU HAVE WORKED ON SURGEON GENERAL  
6 REPORTS?

7 A. I HAVE, ON THREE SEPARATE OCCASIONS.  
8 Q. CAN YOU TELL US A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT.  
9 A. YES. AT THE REQUEST OF THE PEOPLE WHO PULL  
10 TOGETHER THE TEAMS WHO WRITE THE SURGEON GENERAL'S REPORTS,  
11 I HAD -- I WAS REQUIRED OR REQUESTED TO WRITE THE HISTORIES  
12 OF ADVERTISING WITH RESPECT TO THE TARGETING OF YOUTH, WOMEN  
13 AND ETHNIC MINORITIES.  
14 Q. WERE THOSE SEPARATE REPORTS?  
15 A. YES.  
16 Q. CAN YOU TELL US THE YEARS?  
17 A. THE SURGEON GENERAL'S REPORT ON YOUTH WAS  
18 PUBLISHED IN 1994. THE ONE ON ETHNIC MINORITIES WAS  
19 PUBLISHED IN 1998. AND THE ONE ON WOMEN IS FORTHCOMING,  
20 PROBABLY THIS YEAR.  
21 Q. PROBABLY IN 2000?  
22 A. YES.  
23 Q. AND THE TOPICS THAT YOU WORKED ON FOR THE 1994  
24 YOUTH SURGEON GENERAL'S REPORT WERE WHAT?  
25 A. VARIOUS ASPECTS OF THE INDUSTRY'S HISTORICAL  
26 RECORD WITH RESPECT TO THEIR APPARENT INTEREST IN THE YOUTH  
27 MARKET, THE NATURE OF THE MEDIA THAT THEY EMPLOY, THE NATURE  
28 OF THE ADVERTISING MESSAGES THAT THEY EMPLOY, THE  
2048  
1 CONSEQUENCES OF SMOKING RATES AMONG YOUTH, THE EFFORTS TO  
2 REGULATE THAT THROUGH VARIOUS MEANS, BOTH GOVERNMENTAL AND  
3 SELF-REGULATORY MEANS AND THE DIFFICULTIES OF THOSE  
4 PROCEDURES.  
5 AND IN GENERAL, A CHRONOLOGY OF THE HISTORICAL  
6 RECORD FROM ABOUT THE 1920S UP UNTIL THE 1990S WITH RESPECT  
7 TO THE IMPORTANCE OF THE YOUTH MARKET, INCLUDING ACCESS TO  
8 CORPORATE DOCUMENTS.  
9 Q. AND WAS THIS LIKE A WHOLE SECTION OF THE SURGEON  
10 GENERAL'S REPORT FOR 1994 AND YOUTH?  
11 A. IT WAS. IT WAS THE BULK OF A CHAPTER DEDICATED  
12 TO ADVERTISING AND PROMOTION.  
13 Q. AND WAS THAT A PEER-REVIEWED PORTION?  
14 A. YES, IT WAS.  
15 Q. CAN YOU DESCRIBE WHAT THAT ENTAILS.  
16 A. IT MEANS THAT AFTER AN INDIVIDUAL LIKE MYSELF AND  
17 THE MANY OTHERS WHO CONTRIBUTE TO THE SURGEON GENERAL'S  
18 REPORT HAVE WRITTEN THE DRAFT MATERIALS OF WHAT WE'RE  
19 CONTRIBUTING, THAT THOSE DRAFTS ARE CIRCULATED TO OTHER  
20 PEOPLE WHO ARE ALSO ACTIVE SCHOLARS IN THE FIELD FOR THEIR  
21 COMMENTS AND CRITICISMS AND SUGGESTED REVISIONS, AND MAYBE  
22 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION THAT THEY MIGHT HAVE.  
23 SO THAT THERE'S A PROCESS OF PEER REVIEW, "PEERS"  
24 MEANING THE EQUALS TO THE AUTHORS; THAT IS, THE PEOPLE WHO  
25 ALSO HAVE SIMILAR EXPERTISE.  
26 Q. AND THEN, THERE'S AN OVERALL REVIEW PROCESS?  
27 A. AND THEN, WHEN THE FINAL THING IS GATHERED, THEN  
28 THERE'S AN EDITORIAL TEAM -- A SENIOR SCIENTIFIC EDITOR AND  
2049  
1 EDITORIAL TEAM THAT VETS THE FINAL PRODUCT.  
2 Q. AND "VET" MEANS?  
3 A. JUST TO CLEAR IT, TO LOOK AT IT, TO CHECK IT, TO  
4 MAKE SURE IT'S INTERNALLY CONSISTENT, THERE'S NO MAJOR  
5 OMISSIONS, THAT THE MATERIALS THEY WANTED TO COVER WERE  
6 COVERED, AND SO ON.  
7 Q. AND WHAT ROLE DID YOU PLAY IN THE 1998 SURGEON  
8 GENERAL'S REPORT ON MINORITIES?  
9 A. IT'S A SIMILAR ROLE, IN THE SENSE THAT IT WAS  
10 LOOKING AT THE HISTORICAL RECORD OF USING BOTH CORPORATE  
11 DOCUMENTS AND TRADE SOURCES; THAT IS, WHAT WAS AVAILABLE TO

12 BE LEARNED FROM THINGS LIKE THE ADVERTISING MAGAZINES OF THE  
13 DAY WITH RESPECT TO THE TARGETING OF MINORITIES. AND MOST  
14 OF THE INFORMATION THERE WAS WITH RESPECT TO ADVERTISING.

15 MR. BARRON: YOUR HONOR, I HATE TO INTERRUPT.

16 COULD WE HAVE PERHAPS A LITTLE MORE DIRECT  
17 RESPONSE TO A LIMITED QUESTION, SO THAT WE CAN ANTICIPATE  
18 WHERE THE INQUIRY IS GOING?

19 THE COURT: I THINK THAT'S A GOOD IDEA.

20 WHY DON'T YOU JUST FOCUS YOUR ANSWER ON THE  
21 SPECIFIC QUESTION THAT'S GIVEN. BECAUSE IF YOU GET TOO  
22 EXPANSIVE, THEN THE LAWYERS ARE SAYING THEY DON'T KNOW WHAT  
23 ISSUE YOU'RE ADDRESSING. THEY NEED TO KNOW. YOU NEED TO  
24 FOCUS ON THE QUESTION.

25 MS. CHABER WILL ASK YOU THE NEXT QUESTION. IF  
26 YOU COULD JUST MAKE YOUR ANSWERS JUST A LITTLE MORE  
27 FOCUSED. OKAY.

28 MS. CHABER: Q. WITH RESPECT TO --

2050

1 THE COURT: WHEN I SAY "FOCUSED," I MEAN FOCUSED  
2 ON THE PARTICULAR QUESTION. OKAY.

3 MS. CHABER: Q. WITH RESPECT TO THE REPORT  
4 THAT'S TO BE PUBLISHED IN 2000 WITH RESPECT TO THE HEALTH  
5 CONSEQUENCES OF SMOKING AND WOMEN, WHAT WAS YOUR ROLE IN  
6 THAT REPORT?

7 A. MY ROLE WAS TO REVIEW THE HISTORICAL RECORD WITH  
8 RESPECT TO THE ADVERTISING PRACTICES AND EFFECTS THEREOF  
9 TOWARD WOMEN.

10 Q. AND AGAIN, WERE EACH OF THESE, THE 1998 REPORT ON  
11 MINORITIES AND THE REPORT THAT YOU WORKED ON ON WOMEN, WERE  
12 THEY PEER-REVIEWED IN A SIMILAR FASHION TO WHAT YOU  
13 DESCRIBED FOR 1994?

14 A. YES, THEY WERE.

15 Q. AND THE 2000 REPORT AND THE PORTION THAT YOU'VE  
16 DONE IS COMPLETED; IS THAT CORRECT?

17 A. YES, IT IS.

18 Q. AWAITING PUBLICATION?

19 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

20 Q. NOW, YOU ARE TEACHING AND HAVE BEEN FOR HOW MANY  
21 YEARS?

22 A. I'VE BEEN TEACHING FOR 34 YEARS.

23 Q. LET'S TALK ABOUT YOUR EARLY TEACHING CAREER.  
24 WHERE DID YOU DO THAT?

25 A. I TAUGHT FIRST AT THE UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS IN  
26 LAWRENCE, KANSAS FOR FOUR YEARS.

27 Q. AND WHAT WERE YOU TEACHING THERE?

28 A. I WAS TEACHING BUSINESS SCHOOL, TEACHING

2051

1 MARKETING TOPICS, MARKETING RESEARCH, CONSUMER BEHAVIOR,  
2 BASIC MARKETING PRINCIPLES.

3 Q. CAN YOU JUST GIVE US AN IDEA WHAT YOU MEAN WHEN  
4 YOU SAY "MARKETING" OR "MARKETING PRINCIPLES."

5 A. THE DOMAIN OF MARKETING AND THE BUSINESS LANGUAGE  
6 IS ALL OF THOSE ACTIVITIES WHICH INVOLVE WHAT CONSTITUTES  
7 THE OFFER TO THE CONSUMERS. SO IT'S THE NATURE OF THE  
8 PRODUCT, HOW IT'S PACKAGED, HOW IT'S PRICED, HOW IT'S  
9 DISTRIBUTED, HOW IT'S PROMOTED, OF COURSE, AND ADVERTISED.

10 AND THEN, ALONG WITH THAT, THE SUPPORTING  
11 ACTIVITIES, LIKE MARKETING RESEARCH, ADVERTISING RESEARCH,  
12 IN ORDER THAT THE FIRMS CAN FINE-TUNE THAT EFFORT TO  
13 MAXIMIZE ITS EFFICIENCY FOR THEM.

14 Q. AND IN THE COURSE OF YOUR TEACHING WORK, DID YOU  
15 TEACH OTHERS? WERE YOU TEACHING ON THE UNDERGRADUATE LEVEL?

16 A. BOTH -- WELL, ALL THREE LEVELS. UNDERGRADUATE,

17 AND THEN THERE'S THE MASTER'S LEVEL, WHICH TENDS TO BE  
18 PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION, PEOPLE BEING TRAINED TO BE  
19 EXECUTIVES.  
20 THEN THERE'S ALSO THE PH.D. LEVEL OF GRADUATE  
21 SCHOOL, WHICH ARE PEOPLE WHO ARE BEING TRAINED TO BECOME  
22 PROFESSORS.  
23 Q. ON ALL OF THOSE LEVELS, WERE ETHICS OF BUSINESS  
24 PART OF YOUR TEACHING?  
25 A. YES.  
26 Q. AND TELL ME AGAIN THE YEARS THAT YOU WERE AT THE  
27 UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS.  
28 A. I WAS AT THE UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS FROM 1966 TO  
2052 1970.  
2 Q. AND LET'S JUST TALK ABOUT THAT TIME PERIOD FOR A  
3 MINUTE.  
4 DID YOU SMOKE?  
5 A. I DID.  
6 Q. AND WERE YOU ONE OF THE ONLY PROFESSORS SMOKING?  
7 A. NO.  
8 Q. CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA OF HOW YOU COMPARED TO AT  
9 LEAST THE POPULATION THAT YOU KNEW AT THE UNIVERSITY WITH  
10 RESPECT TO SMOKING?  
11 MR. BARRON: YOUR HONOR, EXCUSE ME. I OBJECT.  
12 I DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW THIS CONNECTS TO ANYTHING RELEVANT.  
13 THE COURT: WHETHER YOU UNDERSTAND SOMETHING OR  
14 NOT IS NOT RELEVANT.  
15 BUT IF YOU HAVE LEGAL GROUNDS FOR THE OBJECTION,  
16 TELL ME WHAT IT IS AND I WILL RULE ON IT.  
17 MR. BARRON: AT THIS POINT, IT'S RELEVANCY, YOUR  
18 HONOR.  
19 THE COURT: SUSTAINED.  
20 MR. BARRON: THANK YOU.  
21 MS. CHABER: WE'LL COME BACK TO THESE ANOTHER  
22 TIME.  
23 THE COURT: YOU DON'T WANT TO COME BACK TO  
24 THAT. I WILL SUSTAIN.  
25 MS. CHABER: WE'LL COME BACK TO THAT AT ANOTHER  
26 TIME WHEN I THINK IT MAY BE RELEVANT.  
27 THE COURT: WELL, ONCE I SUSTAIN AN OBJECTION TO  
28 SOMETHING, YOU ARE NOT GOING TO ASK THE SAME QUESTION AGAIN.  
2053  
1 I HOPE WE'LL GO AHEAD AND SEE WHAT HAPPENS.  
2 YOU GO AHEAD.  
3 MS. CHABER: I SAID, WHEN I BELIEVE IT WILL BE  
4 RELEVANT, AND I WILL FRAME IT IN SUCH A FASHION, YOUR HONOR.  
5 BUT I'M MOVING ON IS THE PART THAT I THOUGHT YOU  
6 WOULD BE INTERESTED IN.  
7 THE COURT: OKAY. I WAS JUST A LITTLE  
8 TITILLATED BY YOUR STATEMENT THAT WE WERE MOVING ON BUT YOU  
9 WERE COMING BACK, BECAUSE WHEN I SUSTAIN AN OBJECTION, WE  
10 ARE NOT COMING BACK.  
11 BUT YOU GO AHEAD. WE'LL SEE WHAT HAPPENS. MAYBE  
12 YOU CAN FIND A WAY TO GET BACK.  
13 MS. CHABER: THAT WAS MY POINT, YOUR HONOR.  
14 THE COURT: YOU GO AHEAD.  
15 MS. CHABER: OKAY.  
16 THAT TOOK LONGER THAN WHAT MY NEXT QUESTION WAS.  
17 THE COURT: I'M SURE.  
18 MS. CHABER: Q. DURING THE COURSE OF THE TIME  
19 THAT YOU WERE TEACHING AT THE UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS, WERE  
20 THERE ANY SPECIFIC TYPES OF BUSINESSES THAT YOU LOOKED AT  
21 WITH RESPECT TO YOUR WORK?



22 A. MOST OF THE STUDIES IN THOSE DAYS WERE STUDIES OF  
23 CONSUMER PACKAGE GOODS. THAT IS, THE TEXTBOOKS USED  
24 EXAMPLES THAT WE WOULD BE FAMILIAR WITH FROM SUPERMARKETS.  
25 THAT'S THE KIND OF PRODUCTS THAT WE TYPICALLY SEE ADVERTISED  
26 ON TELEVISION AND FIND IN OUR SUPERMARKET, SHOPPING BASKETS,  
27 THE NATIONALLY DISTRIBUTED PACKAGED GOODS.

28 IN ADDITION TO THAT, I ALSO DID SOME WORK ON THE  
2054

1 APPLICATIONS OF MARKETING IN PUBLIC AND NONPROFIT  
2 INSTITUTIONS.

3 Q. OKAY. BUT WHEN YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT PACKAGED  
4 GOODS, THESE WOULD BE FOOD PRODUCTS?

5 A. FOOD PRODUCTS.

6 Q. WHAT ELSE?

7 A. PHARMACEUTICAL PRODUCTS, COSMETIC AND OTHER KINDS  
8 OF PERSONAL EFFECTS, PRODUCTS LIKE A TOOTHBRUSH, FOR  
9 EXAMPLE. ALMOST ANYTHING THAT WOULD BE IN A SUPERMARKET.

10 Q. IN THE COURSE OF YOUR TEACHING THERE, DID YOU DO  
11 TEACHING WITH RESPECT TO DOING HISTORICAL RESEARCH ON  
12 PRACTICES OF BUSINESSES IN RELATION TO MARKETING?

13 A. I HADN'T REALLY BEGUN ANYTHING THAT WAS  
14 PUBLISHED. I HAD BEGUN MY OWN INTEREST IN HISTORICAL  
15 ASPECTS AND HAD BEGUN TO DO SOME COLLECTING OF HISTORICAL  
16 MATERIALS AND USING THEM FOR ILLUSTRATIONS IN TEACHING, BUT  
17 HAD NOT YET BEGUN TO PUBLISH.

18 THAT BEGAN LATER, IN THE MID-1970S, WITH THE  
19 HARVARD EXPERIENCE.

20 Q. OKAY. AND YOU DID PUBLISH AFTER YOUR HARVARD  
21 EXPERIENCE?

22 A. I DID.

23 Q. AND WHAT DID YOU PUBLISH?

24 A. THE FIRST THING WAS A REFERENCE BOOK CALLED "THE  
25 INFORMATION SOURCES FOR ADVERTISING HISTORY."

26 Q. AND THIS WOULD HAVE LISTED ALL OF THE PLACES THAT  
27 ONE COULD GO TO TO GET THIS HISTORICAL DATA?

28 A. IT WAS A COMPILATION OF BOTH WHAT'S CALLED AN  
2055

1 ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY; THAT'S A LISTING OF ALL THE BOOKS  
2 AND MAGAZINES AND OTHER TRADE SOURCES OF INFORMATION, WITH A  
3 BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF WHAT THEY MIGHT -- WHAT THEY CONTAINED  
4 THAT MIGHT BE OF INTEREST TO OTHER RESEARCHERS.

5 AND ALSO ARCHIVAL SOURCES; THAT IS, THE NATURE OF  
6 THE DOCUMENTS HELD AT VARIOUS LIBRARIES AND OTHER KINDS OF  
7 INSTITUTIONS, LIKE HISTORICAL RESEARCH CENTERS.

8 Q. EXPLAIN WHAT "ARCHIVES" ARE.

9 A. AN ARCHIVE IS A SPECIALIZED KIND OF LIBRARY.  
10 IT'S A PLACE WHERE DOCUMENTS ARE KEPT FOR POSTERITY, AFTER  
11 THEY HAVE BEEN DONATED BY, USUALLY, AN INDIVIDUAL OR  
12 SOMETIMES A CORPORATION FOR THAT PURPOSE.

13 SO IT'S -- PHYSICALLY, IT LOOKS LIKE A LIBRARY,  
14 BUT IT DOESN'T HAVE THE NORMAL KIND OF PUBLISHED BOOKS. IT  
15 HAS COLLECTED PAPERS. THEY CAN BE PERSONAL PAPERS OF  
16 INDIVIDUALS, LIKE CORRESPONDENCE. IT CAN BE CORPORATE  
17 PAPERS. IT COULD BE COLLECTIONS OF OLD MAGAZINES, AND  
18 THINGS LIKE THAT.

19 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN YOU LEFT THE UNIVERSITY OF  
20 KANSAS, WHERE DID YOU GO?

21 A. I WENT TO THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA IN  
22 VANCOUVER, MY PRESENT EMPLOYER.

23 Q. JUST GIVE US A QUICK RUNTHROUGH THROUGH THE RANKS  
24 OF PROFESSORSHIP.

25 A. I WENT THERE AS AN ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR OF  
26 MARKETING AND WAS PROMOTED TO A FULL PROFESSOR IN

27 MID-1970S.  
28 SINCE THEN, I HAVE HAD VARIOUS RESPONSIBILITIES,  
2056  
1 INCLUDING BEING A CURATOR OF WHAT'S WAS CALLED THE HISTORY  
2 OF ADVERTISING ARCHIVES, OUR OWN COLLECTION OF MATERIALS  
3 WITH RESPECT TO ADVERTISING AND ITS HISTORY.  
4 AND I LEAD A TEACHING TEAM FOR THE MBA PROGRAM.  
5 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DOES THAT MEAN, LEADING A  
6 TEACHING TEAM FOR THE MBA PROGRAM?  
7 A. IT'S LIKE BEING A PLAYING CAPTAIN OF A SPORTS  
8 TEAM. I'M ONE OF SEVERAL TEACHERS WHO TEACH AS A TEAM. WE  
9 HAVE SOMETHING LIKE A BOOT CAMP. WE CALL IT OUR CORE  
10 EXPERIENCE, WHERE FOR FOUR MONTHS, ALL OF OUR GRADUATE  
11 STUDENTS ARE TOGETHER IN ONE ROOM AND A TEAM OF TEACHERS  
12 WORK WITH THEM ON MAJOR PROJECTS, ON LARGE COMPLICATED  
13 CASES, TAKING FIELD TRIPS TOGETHER, HAVING GUEST SPEAKERS,  
14 AND DISCUSSING ALL OF THESE THINGS.  
15 AND I CAPTAIN THAT TEAM.  
16 Q. WITH RESPECT TO YOUR TEACHING, DO YOU ALSO DO  
17 OUTSIDE LECTURING AT OTHER UNIVERSITIES?  
18 A. I DO FROM TIME TO TIME.  
19 Q. HAVE YOU BEEN A PEER REVIEWER?  
20 A. YES. QUITE FRANKLY, I AM, FOR OTHER ACADEMIC  
21 JOURNALS.  
22 Q. OKAY. AND CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA, JUST THE  
23 TYPES OF JOURNALS?  
24 A. PRIMARILY, JOURNALS IN THE FIELDS OF ADVERTISING  
25 AND MARKETING, LIKE THE JOURNAL OF CONSUMER RESEARCH, THE  
26 JOURNAL OF MARKETING, THE JOURNAL OF ADVERTISING.  
27 BUT ALSO, FOR SOME JOURNALS LIKE THE JOURNAL OF  
28 THE AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION, PUBLIC HEALTH JOURNALS,  
2057  
1 WHEN THEY GET MANUSCRIPTS THAT RELATE TO ADVERTISING OR  
2 CONSUMER BEHAVIOR.  
3 Q. DO YOU, IN THE ASPECT OF YOUR TEACHING, WRITING  
4 AND RESEARCH, DEAL WITH PUBLIC RELATIONS?  
5 A. I DO.  
6 Q. CAN YOU TELL US WHAT PUBLIC RELATIONS IS.  
7 A. PUBLIC RELATIONS IS A SET OF ACTIVITIES ENGAGED  
8 IN THE FIRM THAT'S PART OF ITS OVERALL CORPORATE  
9 COMMUNICATIONS EFFORTS.  
10 WHERE WE ARE MOST FAMILIAR WITH ADVERTISING,  
11 PUBLIC RELATIONS IS ACTIVITIES WHERE YOU DON'T PAY FOR THE  
12 PAGES IN WHICH YOUR MESSAGE APPEARS. USUALLY, IT'S BY  
13 WRITING STORIES THAT ARE DISTRIBUTED TO THE PRESS OR BY  
14 STAGING EVENTS THAT WILL GET PRESS COVERAGE OR BY AUTHORIZING  
15 MATERIALS FOR SPECIAL CIRCULATION TO TARGET AUDIENCES.  
16 BUT IT'S DIFFERENT FROM THE KINDS OF ADVERTISING  
17 WE ARE USED TO, BECAUSE YOU ARE NOT PAYING FOR THE TIME OR  
18 SPACE IN WHICH THE MESSAGE APPEARS.  
19 Q. NOW, HAVE YOU EVER WORKED FOR A PUBLIC RELATIONS  
20 COMPANY?  
21 A. NO, I HAVE NOT. I HAVE WORKED IN AN ADVERTISING  
22 AGENCY CONTEXT THAT DID PUBLIC RELATIONS WORK. AND THAT'S  
23 COMMON, THAT PUBLIC RELATIONS WILL BE DONE WITHIN AN  
24 ADVERTISING AGENCY.  
25 BUT I HAVEN'T WORKED FOR A FIRM THAT'S DEDICATED  
26 ITSELF TO PUBLIC RELATIONS.  
27 Q. IS THAT PART OF YOUR READING, WRITING AND  
28 RESEARCH, THAT YOU ANALYZE PUBLIC RELATIONS ACTIVITIES?  
2058  
1 A. IT IS. IT'S PART OF THE TEACHING. IT'S IN ALL  
2 THE TEXTBOOKS WE USE. IT'S A COMPONENT PART OF MY LIBRARY

3 IN MY OFFICE.  
4 Q. AND AS PART OF YOUR WORK IN LOOKING AT  
5 ADVERTISING AND THE HISTORY OF ADVERTISING, DO YOU LOOK AT  
6 THE SOCIAL AND CULTURAL EFFECTS OF THAT ADVERTISING ON THE  
7 CONSUMERS?  
8 A. I DO.  
9 Q. NOW, YOU HAVE PREVIOUSLY TESTIFIED AS AN EXPERT  
10 WITNESS ON THESE SAME TOPICS?  
11 A. I HAVE.  
12 Q. YOU'VE BEEN ACCEPTED AS AN EXPERT WITNESS ON  
13 THESE TOPICS IN OTHER COURTS?  
14 A. I HAVE.  
15 MR. BARRON: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. VAGUE AND  
16 AMBIGUOUS AS TO "THESE TOPICS."  
17 THE COURT: SUSTAINED.  
18 DO YOU WANT ME TO STRIKE THE ANSWER?  
19 MR. BARRON: I WASN'T QUICK ENOUGH. I'D  
20 APPRECIATE IT, YOUR HONOR.  
21 THE COURT: I'LL STRIKE THE ANSWER. IT'S VAGUE  
22 AS TO WHAT YOU MEAN BY "THESE TOPICS."  
23 MS. CHABER: Q. DR. POLLAY, HAVE YOU TESTIFIED  
24 AS AN EXPERT WITNESS WITH RESPECT TO ADVERTISING?  
25 A. YES, I HAVE.  
26 Q. THE HISTORY OF ADVERTISING?  
27 A. YES, I HAVE.  
28 Q. BUSINESS ETHICS?  
2059  
1 A. YES, I HAVE.  
2 Q. PUBLIC RELATIONS?  
3 A. YES.  
4 Q. CONSUMER RESEARCH?  
5 A. YES.  
6 Q. SOCIAL AND CULTURAL EFFECTS OF ADVERTISING?  
7 A. YES.  
8 Q. SOCIAL AND CULTURAL EFFECTS OF PUBLIC RELATIONS?  
9 A. YES.  
10 Q. CONSUMER BEHAVIOR AND PSYCHOLOGY?  
11 A. YES.  
12 Q. THE INFLUENCE ON THE MEDIA OF BUSINESSES?  
13 A. YES.  
14 Q. MARKETING?  
15 A. YES.  
16 Q. DID I MISS ANYTHING?  
17 A. I WASN'T KEEPING A CHECKLIST. IT SOUNDS PRETTY  
18 EXHAUSTIVE.  
19 Q. OKAY. NOW, FIRST, YOU TESTIFIED HERE IN SAN  
20 FRANCISCO A YEAR AGO, IN A CASE I WAS INVOLVED IN?  
21 A. YES, I DID.  
22 Q. OKAY. AND YOU BECAME INVOLVED IN CASES -- ONE OF  
23 THE FIRST CASES TO EVER GO TO TRIAL IN THE 1980S?  
24 A. YES.  
25 Q. AND IN THE COURSE OF ALL OF THIS TIME, HAVE YOU  
26 REMAINED CURRENT ON ISSUES WITH RESPECT TO ADVERTISING,  
27 PUBLIC RELATIONS, MARKETING AND ALL OF THAT OTHER LONG LIST  
28 THAT I GAVE WITH RESPECT TO THE CIGARETTE INDUSTRY?  
2060  
1 A. I HAVE.  
2 Q. HAS THAT BECOME A SPECIALTY OF YOURS?  
3 A. YES, IT HAS.  
4 Q. DO YOU KNOW OF ANYONE ELSE WHO HAS MORE EXPERTISE  
5 ON ISSUES RELATED TO CIGARETTE ADVERTISING, PUBLIC RELATIONS  
6 AND THE EFFECTS ON CONSUMERS THAN YOURSELF?  
7 I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT BRAGGING RIGHTS.

8 A. THERE ARE OTHER PEOPLE WHO HAVE SOME KNOWLEDGE OF  
9 SOME PARTS. I DON'T HAVE A MONOPOLY ON THIS INFORMATION.

10 BUT I DON'T KNOW OF ANYONE WHO HAS SPENT AS MUCH  
11 TIME OR HAS PUBLISHED AS MUCH ON THE TOPIC AS I HAVE.

12 Q. AND WITH RESPECT TO -- YOU INDICATED THAT YOU HAD  
13 AN ADVERTISING ARCHIVE?

14 A. YES.

15 Q. AND THAT'S KEPT AND MAINTAINED BY THE UNIVERSITY  
16 OF BRITISH COLUMBIA?

17 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

18 Q. AND THAT'S EXCLUSIVE TO CIGARETTE ADVERTISING?

19 A. IT'S NOT EXCLUSIVE TO CIGARETTE ADVERTISING, BUT  
20 THAT IS BY FAR AND AWAY THE LARGEST AND MOST HEAVILY USED  
21 COMPONENT PART OF IT.

22 Q. OKAY. AND CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA OF THE VOLUME  
23 THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THAT'S MAINTAINED IN THE ARCHIVES  
24 IN RELATION TO CIGARETTE ADVERTISING?

25 A. WELL, THE MATERIALS FILL A ROOM ROUGHLY THIS  
26 SIZE, FILLED WITH BOOKSHELVES AND CASES AND RACKS AND FILE  
27 CABINETS. IT HAS ABOUT 8,000 EXAMPLES OF CIGARETTE  
28 ADVERTISING. AND THAT'S A GROWING COLLECTION ITSELF.

2061

1 OF COURSE, MANY, MANY DOCUMENTS. NOW THERE ARE  
2 ELECTRONIC FORMS OF VARIOUS DOCUMENTS. SO CD-ROMS AND THE  
3 LIKE. SO AN EXTENSIVE COLLECTION OF MATERIALS.

4 LOTS OF NOTES, PARTICULARLY FROM TRADE SOURCES,  
5 THINGS LIKE ADVERTISING AGE, PRINTERS INK, OR PROFESSIONAL  
6 MAGAZINES IN THE ADVERTISING AND MARKETING PROFESSION.

7 Q. AND IN THE COURSE OF THE WORK THAT YOU DO, DO YOU  
8 LOOK AT MAGAZINES LIKE ADVERTISING AGE AND SOME OF THE OTHER  
9 ONES YOU JUST MENTIONED THAT WERE WRITTEN AT THE SAME TIME  
10 AS HISTORIC DOCUMENTS WITHIN COMPANIES TO UNDERSTAND THOSE  
11 DOCUMENTS?

12 A. YES, I DO.

13 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. VAGUE, YOUR HONOR.

14 THE COURT: IT WAS A GENERAL QUESTION. I'M  
15 GOING TO ALLOW IT.

16 MS. CHABER: Q. NOW, WHEN YOU'RE WORKING AS AN  
17 EXPERT WITNESS, SUCH AS YOU ARE IN THIS CASE, ARE YOU PAID  
18 FOR YOUR TIME?

19 A. I'M NOT PERSONALLY PAID, BUT MY TIME IS BILLED  
20 FOR.

21 THE UNIVERSITY RECEIVES THE MONEYS AND IT'S USED  
22 TO SUPPORT GRADUATE STUDENTS AND OTHER EXPENSES ASSOCIATED  
23 WITH THE ARCHIVES.

24 Q. AND I ASSUME THAT THE THREE DAYS THAT YOU'VE  
25 SPENT HERE WAITING IN THE HALLWAY TO GET ON THE WITNESS  
26 STAND, YOUR EXPENSES ARE BEING REIMBURSED BY MY OFFICE?

27 A. THAT'S CORRECT. I ASSUME SO TOO.

28 Q. OKAY.

2062

1 MS. CHABER: THIS WOULD BE A GOOD TIME.

2 DO YOU WANT TO TAKE THE BREAK?

3 THE COURT: JUDITH WANTS TO TAKE A BREAK.

4 JURORS, LET'S RECESS. LET'S TAKE A RECESS TO 20  
5 AFTER 11:00. PLEASE CONTINUE TO FOLLOW THE ADMONITION.  
6 WE'LL SEE YOU BACK AT 20 AFTER 11:00.

7 (RECESS TAKEN FROM 11:02 TO 11:25 A.M.)

8 THE COURT: WE'RE BACK ON THE RECORD.

9 MS. CHABER, YOU MAY PROCEED.

10 MS. CHABER: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.

11 Q. NOW, DR. POLLAY, WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE ISSUE OF  
12 THE AWARENESS OF THE CONSUMER TO ADVERTISING AND MEDIA AND

13 HEALTH MESSAGES, WHAT KINDS OF THINGS DO YOU LOOK AT?  
14 A. THERE'S MANY DIFFERENT THINGS. ONE WOULD BE THE  
15 PERVASIVENESS OF MEDIA AND THE FACT THAT THERE'S MULTIPLE  
16 TYPES OF MEDIA WHERE ONE MIGHT ENCOUNTER ADVERTISING OR  
17 REPRESENTATIONS OF ADVERTISING FOR SELLING, FOR THAT  
18 MATTER.  
19 SO THE VARIETY OF MEDIA, AND KNOWING HOW THE  
20 MEDIA SCHEDULES THE MEDIA ACTIVITIES WOULD HELP UNDERSTAND  
21 HOW FREQUENTLY PEOPLE WOULD LIKELY BE EXPOSED TO MESSAGES.  
22 ALSO, SOMETIMES YOU CAN EVALUATE THE DESIGN OF  
23 THE MEDIA, THAT IS, THE EXTENT TO WHICH THESE ARE VIVID, YOU  
24 KNOW, THINGS THAT ARE IN COLOR, THINGS THAT ARE IN LARGE  
25 FORMAT. BILLBOARDS REALLY HAVE FINE PRINT, IN CLASSIFIED  
26 NEWS ADVERTISEMENTS IN A NEWSPAPER, SOMETHING LIKE THAT.  
27 WE ALSO CONSIDER WHAT ARE CALLED DIRECT AND  
28 INDIRECT EFFECTS; THAT IS, THE KINDS OF ADVERTISING  
2063  
1 INFLUENCES OR PUBLIC RELATIONS INFLUENCES, BOTH DIRECTLY ON  
2 THE CONSUMER AND THROUGH INTERMEDIARIES.  
3 WHAT'S CALLED THE TWO-STEP FLOW OF INFLUENCE,  
4 THAT IF THE ADVERTISING MIGHT INFLUENCE A FRIEND OF MINE AND  
5 THEN THE FRIEND TELLS ME SOMETHING, THAT THAT WOULD STILL BE  
6 AN INFLUENCE BY THE ADVERTISING, BUT IT WOULD GO THROUGH OR  
7 CALLED BE MEDIATED BY THE PEER, A FRIEND OR THE NEIGHBOR OR  
8 THE FAMILY MEMBER, SOMETHING LIKE THAT.  
9 Q. WOULD YOU BE ABLE TO ILLUSTRATE OR DIAGRAM THIS  
10 MULTISTAGE PROCESS FOR INFLUENCING AND WHAT THE INFLUENCES  
11 ARE ON CONSUMER AWARENESS IN ANY KIND OF FASHION THAT WOULD  
12 BE HELPFUL TO THE JURY?  
13 A. I THINK SO. I CAN GIVE YOU A LITTLE DIAGRAM THAT  
14 WOULD AT LEAST HELP UNDERSTAND HOW ADVERTISING FITS WITH  
15 PUBLIC RELATIONS AND SALES PROMOTION AND OTHER KIND OF SALES  
16 SUPPORT ACTIVITIES, THINGS LIKE THAT, SO THAT YOU WOULD  
17 UNDERSTAND THE TOTALITY OF CORPORATE COMMUNICATIONS.  
18 Q. OKAY. WOULD YOU MIND STEPPING DOWN.  
19 MR. BARRON: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. COULD WE --  
20 BEFORE WE DO THIS, COULD WE ASK THE COURT TO HAVE THE  
21 WITNESS, THROUGH QUESTIONS, ESTABLISH MORE OF A FOUNDATION  
22 AS TO THE BASIS FOR WHAT HE'S NOW GOING TO OFFER.  
23 I THINK THAT IS PERMITTED.  
24 MS. CHABER: I THINK I DID.  
25 THE COURT: I DON'T KNOW WHAT HE'S GOING TO  
26 OFFER, SO I DON'T KNOW. I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE QUESTION IS  
27 GOING TO BE.  
28 MS. CHABER: THE QUESTION WAS THE INFLUENCE ON  
2064  
1 THE CONSUMER FROM THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT SOURCES THAT HE'S  
2 INDICATED, ADVERTISING, PUBLIC RELATIONS, TWO-STEP  
3 PROCESSES.  
4 THE COURT: YOU WANT DR. POLLAY TO BE ASKED MORE  
5 QUESTIONS ABOUT HIS BACKGROUND AND EXPERIENCE IN THIS AREA?  
6 MR. BARRON: NOT JUST THE GENERAL QUESTION.  
7 WHATEVER HE IS BASING HIS MULTISTEP, TWO-STEP,  
8 WHATEVER THEY CALL IT, PROCESS.  
9 THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. IF HE'S ABOUT TO  
10 DESCRIBE A PROCESS, WHY DON'T YOU LAY A FOUNDATION ABOUT THE  
11 INFORMATION IN THE PROCESS, IF THAT'S THE REQUEST.  
12 MS. CHABER: Q. I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO  
13 TAKE THAT LONG, SO YOU MIGHT NOT WANT TO SIT DOWN.  
14 DR. POLLAY, UPON WHAT DO YOU BASE THE ANALYSIS  
15 THAT YOU HAVE WITH RESPECT TO THE INFLUENCES ON THE  
16 CONSUMER?  
17 A. THE RESEARCH LITERATURE, AND THE REPRESENTATIONS

18 TYPICALLY MADE IN TEXTBOOKS, AND THE DIAGRAM I WAS INTENDING  
19 TO SKETCH OUT WOULD ALSO BE A WAY OF PORTRAYING THE NATURE  
20 OF THE BUDGETS I'VE SEEN FOR CORPORATE COMMUNICATIONS.

21 THE COURT: GO AHEAD AND ASK THE QUESTION. SEE  
22 IF THERE'S AN OBJECTION.

23 MS. CHABER: Q. DR. POLLAY, WOULD YOU  
24 ILLUSTRATE FOR US THE VARIOUS INFLUENCES ON THE CONSUMER  
25 THAT WE'VE JUST TALKED ABOUT.

26 A. I'D BE GLAD TO.

27 (PREPARING DIAGRAM)

28 WHAT I THINK IS IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND IS THAT

2065

1 THE INDIVIDUAL -- I MUST MAKE APOLOGIES FOR WHAT'S CALLED MY  
2 BOARD WORK. I HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THE COMPUTER FOR SO MANY  
3 YEARS THAT MY WRITING IS NOT GOOD -- THAT THE INDIVIDUAL IS  
4 IN A LARGER SOCIAL CIRCUMSTANCE SURROUNDED BY FAMILY, PEERS  
5 OR FRIENDS -- THE FANCY WORD FOR "FRIENDS" -- OR EQUALS, AND  
6 NEIGHBORS OR EXTENDED FAMILY.

7 Q. AND THAT'S WHAT'S IMMEDIATELY SURROUNDING THE  
8 INDIVIDUAL?

9 A. THAT'S A WAY OF PORTRAYING THE FACT, AS WITH THE  
10 CLICHE, THAT'S NO MAN IS AN ISLAND. NO WOMAN IS AN ISLAND,  
11 AS WE ALL EXIST IN A FAMILY CONTEXT, IN A COMMUNITY CONTEXT,  
12 WHERE WE HAVE FRIENDS AND ASSOCIATES.

13 AND PART OF OUR ATTITUDES, PART OF OUR KNOWLEDGE,  
14 IT COMES FROM NOT ONLY WHAT WE LEARN FROM MEDIA AND THE  
15 WORLD AROUND US, THE LARGER WORLD, BUT ALSO THROUGH THESE  
16 OTHERS.

17 Q. SO IN THIS INFLUENCE CIRCLE, THE IMMEDIATE  
18 INFLUENCES ARE THOSE WITH WHOM WE LIVE AND THOSE WITH WHOM  
19 WE GO TO THE GROCERY STORE, AND THINGS LIKE THAT?

20 A. WELL, AND THEY'RE IMMEDIATE, PARTICULARLY IN THE  
21 SENSE THAT THEY'RE FREQUENT; THAT IS, YOU'RE INTERACTING  
22 WITH YOUR FAMILY MEMBERS ON A FREQUENT BASIS, WHERE PART OF  
23 THE LARGER ENVIRONMENT WOULD INCLUDE OTHERS.

24 SO I'LL JUST SAY, YOU KNOW "OTHER PEOPLE" THAT WE  
25 ENCOUNTER MUCH LESS FREQUENTLY.

26 SO IT MIGHT BE CELEBRITIES, SALESMEN, OTHER  
27 PEOPLE LIKE, SAY, MINISTERS, PRIESTS AND THE LIKE, JUDGES.

28 SO PEOPLE WHO WE WOULD HAVE RESPECT FOR BUT WE

2066

1 DON'T ENCOUNTER RELATIVELY FREQUENTLY.

2 Q. SOME OF US ENCOUNTER THEM MORE FREQUENTLY.

3 THE COURT: THERE'S AN ASSUMPTION IN THAT  
4 TESTIMONY THAT I'M NOT SURE IS TOTALLY WARRANTED. THAT'S  
5 NOT A VIEW THAT'S UNIVERSALLY SHARED.

6 THE WITNESS: I HAVE PROFESSORS WHO SAY THE SAME  
7 THING.

8 DOCTORS, NURSES, SOME OTHER PROFESSIONALS. SO  
9 A VARIETY OF PEOPLE IN THE LARGER COMMUNITY THAT ONE  
10 ENCOUNTERS FROM TIME TO TIME BUT NOT VERY FREQUENTLY.

11 MS. CHABER: IN THEIR PROFESSIONAL CAPACITY?

12 A. TYPICALLY, IN THEIR PROFESSIONAL CAPACITY. YOU  
13 MIGHT IN A SMALL TOWN INTERACT ON A CASUAL BASIS WITH A  
14 DOCTOR OR A JUDGE OR SOMETHING, IF YOU RAN INTO THEM ON THE  
15 STREET. TYPICALLY, IN A LARGER CITY, IT'S IN A PROFESSIONAL  
16 CAPACITY.

17 NOW, THE INDIVIDUAL AND THE FAMILY AND THIS KIND  
18 OF INTIMATE SOCIAL WORLD ALSO EXISTS IN THE WORLD OF MEDIA.  
19 SO I'LL JUST WRITE "MEDIA" HERE.

20 CONVENTIONALLY, WE DEFINE MEDIA, WE DIVIDE IT IN  
21 HALF. WE HAVE BOTH THE PAGES OR TYPE OF MEDIA THAT'S  
22 ADVERTISING THAT'S BOUGHT AND PAID FOR.

23 AND THEN THERE'S WHAT'S CALLED THE EDITORIAL;  
24 THAT IS, THE PROGRAMMING ON THE TELEVISION STATION OR THE  
25 PAGES IN THE NEWSPAPER OR MAGAZINE THAT ARE THE STORIES AND  
26 THE EVENT.

27 Q. PRESUMABLY, NOT BOUGHT AND PAID FOR?

28 A. PRESUMABLY, NOT PAID AND PAID FOR.

2067

1 BUT THERE ARE SOME INFLUENCES HERE; THAT IS,  
2 THERE IS AN EFFECT OF THE ADVERTISING MONEY ON THE  
3 EDITORIAL.

4 AND THEN THE LAST BIG DOMAIN IS WHAT'S CALLED  
5 "THE STREET."

6 Q. WHAT DOES THAT MEAN?

7 A. WELL, IT REFERS TO THE FACT THAT THE ENVIRONMENT  
8 WE LIVE IN IS A VERY COMMERCIAL DENSE ENVIRONMENT; THAT  
9 IS, WE HAVE BILLBOARDS, WE HAVE BUS SHELTER ADVERTISING, WE  
10 HAVE ADS ON THE INSIDES AND OUTSIDES OF BUSES, ON TAXI TOPS.

11 WE HAVE AN INCREDIBLE VARIETY OF SOURCES. SO  
12 THIS IS WE'LL SAY "RETAIL" IN THE CASE OF TOBACCO. TOBACCO  
13 IS RETAILED IN DRUGSTORES, CANDY STORES, GAS STATIONS,  
14 CONVENIENCE STORES, SUPERMARKETS, ON AND ON. IT'S THE MOST  
15 WIDELY DISTRIBUTED PRODUCT IN OUR ECONOMY.

16 IN ALL OF THOSE RETAIL ACTIVITIES, THERE WILL BE  
17 COUNTLESS FORMS OF REPRESENTATIONS; THAT IS, THREE WILL BE  
18 NEON PLATES, PUSH PLATES ON THE DOOR. THERE WILL BE CHANGE  
19 TRAYS. THERE WILL BE CARRYING CASES. THERE WILL BE THINGS  
20 ON THE CHECKOUT COUNTER THAT DIVIDE THE CHECKOUT THING.  
21 THERE WILL BE PRICE SIGNS. THERE WILL BE SIGNS OUT IN THE  
22 STREET THAT SAY "CIGARETTES, COFFEE AND BEER AVAILABLE  
23 HERE," THINGS LIKE THAT.

24 SO QUITE A WIDE VARIETY HERE OF STORES, AND ALSO  
25 A VARIETY OF, I'LL SAY, ADS, JUST TO USE A GENERAL TERM;  
26 THAT IS, DIFFERENT TYPES OF SIGNS AND DISPLAYS AND ARTIFACTS  
27 AND MATERIALS.

28 SO IN THE STREET, THERE'S A WIDE VARIETY OF

2068

1 STREET MEDIA.

2 NOW, CORPORATE COMMUNICATIONS --

3 Q. WHERE WOULD THAT FIT IN?

4 A. WELL, IT ESSENTIALLY SURROUNDS THIS WHOLE THING.  
5 THAT IS, ALL OF THIS (INDICATING) WOULD BE ADVERTISING  
6 SPENDING -- THE TERMINOLOGY VARIES A BIT FROM TRADE TO  
7 TRADE -- BUT CERTAINLY ALL THE MONEY SPENT TO BUY PAGES IN  
8 NEWSPAPERS AND MAGAZINES, TO BUY BILLBOARDS, WOULD BE  
9 CONVENTIONALLY ADVERTISING MONEY.

10 THERE'S ALSO AN AREA CALLED "SALES," SALES  
11 PROMOTION. THIS IS MONEY, SOMETIMES ALSO KNOWN AS PUSH  
12 MONEY, GIVEN TO RETAILERS TO GET FAVORABLE DISPLAYS, TO GET  
13 THEM TO CARRY THE CLOCKS ON THE BACK OF THE WALL, TO HAVE  
14 THE DECALS ON THE WINDOWS, TO PUT UP THE SIGNS ABOUT THE  
15 CONTESTS AND EVENTS AND SO ON. SO THERE'S AN EFFORT TO  
16 INFLUENCE THE RETAIL ACTIVITY HERE.

17 THERE'S ANOTHER EVENT UP HERE WHICH IS CALLED  
18 "SPONSORSHIP." THIS IS WHERE YOU SPONSOR A PARTICULAR  
19 EVENT, AND IN SPONSORING AN EVENTS, SAY LIKE A TENNIS  
20 TOURNAMENT OR AN AUTOMOBILE RACE OR LIKE THAT, A FASHION  
21 SHOW, YOU CAN DO CONVENTIONAL FORMS OF ADVERTISING, BY  
22 BUYING ADS TO CALL ATTENTION TO THAT EVENT, AND THE EVENT  
23 WILL GET COVERAGE IN THE NEWSPAPER.

24 SO YOU DON'T EVEN HAVE TO PAY FOR IT. THE  
25 EVENING SPORTS NEWS WILL COVER THE X CUP RACING, SO THAT  
26 YOUR BRAND WILL GET MENTIONED AND YOU'LL GET THAT  
27 ADVERTISING EXPOSURE.

28 SO YOU CAN INFLUENCE THE EDITORIAL CONTENTS  
2069  
1 THROUGH SPONSORSHIP. SO THAT'S THIS DOMAIN HERE,  
2 "SPONSORSHIP."  
3 AGAIN, I APOLOGIZE FOR THE MESS I'M MAKING OF  
4 THIS.  
5 THEN THERE'S THE WHOLE OTHER DOMAIN OVER HERE  
6 CALLED "PUBLIC RELATIONS," WHICH IS SENDING MATERIALS TO THE  
7 MEDIA; THAT IS, TO THE NEWSPAPER PUBLISHERS, THE SCIENTIFIC  
8 EDITORS, THE MAGAZINES, IN HOPES THAT THEY'LL PUBLISH IT OR  
9 IT WILL INFLUENCE THE WAY THEY WRITE UP THEIR STORIES.  
10 AND ALSO SENDING OTHER PUBLIC RELATIONS MATERIALS  
11 TO PEOPLE, LIKE DOCTORS AND NURSES, TO LIBRARIES, TO OTHER  
12 INSTITUTIONS, SO THAT THEIR OPINIONS ARE INFLUENCED, AND  
13 THAT IN TURN WILL INFLUENCE WHAT THEY SAY TO THE FAMILY  
14 MEMBERS, AND AS I MENTIONED, THE TWO-STEP FLOW OF  
15 INFLUENCE.  
16 ALL OF THIS ADVERTISING ACTIVITY OR THE PUBLIC  
17 RELATIONS ACTIVITY CAN HAVE AN EFFECT, BOTH DIRECTLY ON THE  
18 INDIVIDUAL, IF THE INDIVIDUAL SEES THE AD OR SEES THE PUBLIC  
19 RELATIONS ACTIVITY, AND INDIRECTLY; THAT IS, THE ADVERTISING  
20 CAN INFLUENCE THE PEER GROUP, AND THEN THE PEER GROUP CAN  
21 INFLUENCE THE INDIVIDUAL.  
22 I MEAN, IT'S STILL AN EFFECT OF ADVERTISING, BUT  
23 IT'S THROUGH THE MECHANISM OF GETTING THE PEERS TO COURT THE  
24 IDEAS OF THE ADVERTISING.  
25 THE SAME THING HERE WITH PUBLIC RELATIONS  
26 ACTIVITIES CAN INFLUENCE DOCTORS AND NURSES, CAN INFLUENCE  
27 FAMILY MEMBERS, AND IN TURN, BE AN INFLUENCE ON THE  
28 INDIVIDUALS.  
2070  
1 SO IN THIS KIND OF PORTRAYAL, THE INDIVIDUAL IS  
2 AT THE CENTER OF A WIDE VARIETY OF ACTIVITIES. AND THE  
3 SALES PROMOTION, ADVERTISING, SPONSORSHIP AND PUBLIC  
4 RELATIONS ACTIVITY ESSENTIALLY TRIES TO SURROUND THE  
5 INDIVIDUAL, TO GAIN AS MUCH CONTROL AS POSSIBLE AS TO HOW  
6 THE INDIVIDUAL WILL PERCEIVE THE PRODUCT OR BRAND, BECAUSE  
7 THERE'S -- THE WHOLE ART OF MANAGEMENT OF THE COMMUNICATIONS  
8 IS TO GAIN CONTROL OVER HOW YOUR PRODUCT IS PERCEIVED.  
9 Q. OKAY. AND THE PUBLIC RELATIONS, THAT YOU HAVE  
10 GONE DOWN.  
11 HAVE WE LEFT ANY PORTIONS OFF THERE?  
12 A. NOT INTENTIONALLY. I MEAN, I GUESS, YOU KNOW,  
13 SALESMEN ARE -- IN THIS PARTICULAR CONTEXT, WE DON'T  
14 ENCOUNTER SALESMEN OVER CIGARETTES. SO IF WE ARE TALKING  
15 ABOUT CARS, IT MIGHT BE A DIFFERENT CASE. SO THAT'S NOT  
16 RELEVANT.  
17 SO THERE IS NO PUBLIC RELATIONS ACTIVITY THERE.  
18 THAT ACTIVITY WOULD BE CALLED SALES SUPPORT OR SALES  
19 TRAINING. THAT WOULD BE ANOTHER PART OF THE MARKETING  
20 COMMUNICATION; THAT IS, HOW YOU TRAIN SALESMEN.  
21 PUBLIC RELATIONS ACTIVITY ITSELF CAN BE QUITE  
22 EXTENSIVE. AS I SAY, THERE CAN BE EFFORTS TARGETING --  
23 MR. BARRON: EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR. AGAIN,  
24 COULD WE PROCEED BY QUESTION AND ANSWER.  
25 I THOUGHT THERE WAS JUST ONE QUESTION. I'M KIND  
26 OF LOST.  
27 THE COURT: THE QUESTION WAS BROAD AND  
28 OPEN-ENDED.  
2071  
1 IF YOU HAD OBJECTED TO IT AS BEING VAGUE, I WOULD  
2 HAVE SUSTAINED, BUT YOU DIDN'T OBJECT. THIS IS WITHIN THE  
3 QUESTION THAT WAS ASKED.



4 BUT LET'S GO AHEAD WITH THE NEXT QUESTION. IF  
5 YOU THINK THE QUESTIONS ARE BROAD, THEN YOU NEED TO OBJECT  
6 TO THE QUESTIONS.

7 MR. BARRON: I APOLOGIZE. I THOUGHT IT WAS  
8 NARROW. I THOUGHT IT WAS TO FILL IN THE RIGHT SIDE OF THAT  
9 CIRCLE. I GUESS I GOT LOST.

10 THE COURT: THAT'S ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO WITH THE  
11 NEXT QUESTION.

12 MS. CHABER: Q. ARE THERE ANY OTHER INFLUENCES  
13 THAT PUBLIC RELATIONS HAS, EITHER DIRECTLY OR INDIRECTLY?

14 A. WELL, THERE ARE INFLUENCES OF PUBLIC RELATIONS ON  
15 THE WHOLE REGULATORY PROCESS, THAT IS, ON GOVERNMENT AND  
16 WHAT GOVERNMENT DOES OR DOES NOT DO.

17 THAT WOULD INFLUENCE, IN TURN, HOW INDIVIDUALS  
18 FEEL ABOUT, YOU KNOW, IF A PARTICULAR PRODUCT IS HAZARDOUS  
19 OR NOT. IS GOVERNMENT DOING ANYTHING ABOUT IT?

20 SO YES, THAT WOULD BE AN AREA WE HAVEN'T YET  
21 TALKED ABOUT.

22 Q. OKAY. AND DOES THAT COMPLETE THE CIRCLE OF  
23 INFLUENCE?

24 A. YES. I MEAN, IT'S, AS I SAY, PRETTY MUCH OF A  
25 MESSY DIAGRAM, WHICH I WISH I HAD TIME TO DO IT BETTER.

26 BUT YES, THAT'S, I THINK, A GENERAL WHAT WE CALL  
27 A SCHEMATIC OR A DIAGRAM FOR HOW IT CAN BE PERCEIVED.

28 MS. CHABER: I HAVE BAD NEWS FOR YOU. IT'S  
2072

1 GOING TO GET MARKED AS AN EXHIBIT AND YOU DON'T GET TO DO IT  
2 OVER AGAIN.

3 I WOULD ASK DO HAVE IT MARKED, YOUR HONOR. WE  
4 DON'T HAVE TO DO IT RIGHT NOW IF YOU DON'T --

5 THE COURT: LET'S DO IT.

6 WHAT'S THE NEXT NUMBER, TATSUO?

7 MS. CHABER: THE NEXT NUMBER THAT I HAVE -- I  
8 BELIEVE 1890 WOULD BE THE NEXT NUMBER, BECAUSE WE HAVE  
9 PREMARKED SOME OTHER ONES THAT WE'LL BE USING.

10 THE COURT: LET'S HAVE THIS DIAGRAM MARKED AS  
11 1890 FOR IDENTIFICATION.

12 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
13 LISTED IN THE INDEX MARKED  
14 FOR IDENTIFICATION PLAINTIFFS'  
15 EXHIBIT # 1890)

16 MS. CHABER: Q. NOW, IN THE COURSE OF YOUR  
17 WORK, DR. POLLAY, AND YOUR TEACHING AND YOUR RESEARCH AND  
18 YOUR WRITING, YOU HAVE LOOKED AT THE HISTORY OF ADVERTISING  
19 OVER THE YEARS AND HOW IT HAS CHANGED?

20 A. I HAVE. PRIMARILY, IN THE 20TH CENTURY; THAT IS,  
21 IN THE LAST HUNDRED YEARS.

22 Q. OKAY. WAS THERE VERY MUCH ADVERTISING BEFORE THE  
23 TURN OF THE CENTURY?

24 A. NOT AS WE KNOW IT. THE MODERN ADVERTISING  
25 AGENCY, THAT IS, PROFESSIONAL APPLIED PSYCHOLOGY TO THE  
26 CREATION OF ADVERTISING AND PROFESSIONAL COPYWRITERS AND ART  
27 DIRECTORS IS PRETTY MUCH AN EARLY 20TH CENTURY DEVELOPMENT.

28 THERE WERE NEWSPAPERS THAT HAD SOME SORT OF  
2073

1 ADVERTISEMENTS IN THE 19TH CENTURY AS WELL. DEPENDING ON  
2 HOW YOU DEFINE "ADVERTISING," YOU CAN FIND SOME THINGS THAT  
3 YOU CAN ARGUE ARE ADVERTISING GOING BACK SEVERAL HUNDRED  
4 YEARS. BUT WHAT WE THINK OF AS ADVERTISING IS A 20TH  
5 CENTURY PHENOMENON.

6 Q. AND TELL US WHAT SOME OF THE DIFFERENT SOURCES OF  
7 ADVERTISING ARE.

8 AND I GUESS BY "SOURCES" -- MAYBE "SOURCES" IS

9 WRONG. TYPES -- TYPES OF, I GUESS. TELL US THE DIFFERENT  
10 TYPES OF ADVERTISING THERE ARE.

11 A. I GUESS I'M STILL NOT QUITE CLEAR ON YOUR  
12 QUESTION.

13 THERE ARE DIFFERENT TYPOLOGIES OF ADVERTISING  
14 WHICH ONE WOULD BREAK IT DOWN BY THE MEDIA TYPES.

15 Q. THAT'S SORT OF WHAT I MEANT, THE MEDIA TYPES.

16 A. THERE WILL BE BROADCAST ADVERTISING, WHICH  
17 HISTORICALLY WAS RADIO, THEN TV, AND NOW MIGHT INCLUDE  
18 INTERNET FORMS OF ADVERTISING. THERE'S PRINT ADVERTISING,  
19 PRIMARILY MAGAZINES AND NEWSPAPERS, BUT ALSO HANDBILLS AND  
20 FLYERS AND BROCHURES AND PAMPHLETS AND CATALOGS, THINGS LIKE  
21 THAT.

22 THERE'S RETAIL OR STREET ADVERTISING, WHICH WOULD  
23 BE BILLBOARDS, BOTH WITH WHAT ARE CALLED EIGHT-SHEET, WHICH  
24 ARE THE SMALLER SIZE BILLBOARDS THAT TYPICALLY ARE ON THE  
25 SIDES OF BUILDINGS AND RETAIL SITES IN CITIES, AND THEN THE  
26 LARGER 30-SHEET SIZES THAT ARE ON HIGHWAYS. SO BILLBOARDS  
27 OF VARIOUS KINDS.

28 SIGNAGE, TRANSIT ADVERTISING. TRANSIT

2074

1 ADVERTISING IS A LARGE CATEGORY, BECAUSE IT INCLUDES THINGS  
2 THAT ARE BOTH INSIDE AND OUTSIDE OF BUSES.

3 AND NOW YOU SEE THE ENTIRETY OF A BUS BEING  
4 COMPLETELY TRANSFORMED INTO A MOBILE BILLBOARD. BUT ALSO  
5 THINGS ON SUBWAYS OR TRAINS, COMMUTER TRAINS, THINGS LIKE  
6 THAT.

7 SHELTERS, THE SHELTERS WHERE PEOPLE WILL WAIT FOR  
8 A BUS WILL HAVE ADVERTISING ON THEM. SO THERE'S A VARIETY  
9 OF OUTDOOR FORMATS FOR ADVERTISING.

10 SO THAT GENERAL DOMAIN IS SOMETIMES KNOWN AS  
11 STREET OR OUTDOOR ADVERTISING.

12 AND THEN ANOTHER VERY IMPORTANT CATEGORY IS  
13 WHAT'S CALLED POINT OF SALE, POS FOR THE TRADE ABBREVIATION.

14 Q. AND WHAT'S THAT?

15 A. JUST THE INITIALS FOR POINT OF SALE.

16 SO IT'S THOSE THINGS I WAS MENTIONING EARLIER YOU  
17 MIGHT ENCOUNTER IN A RETAIL STORE; THAT IS, IT'S THE CLOCK  
18 ON THE WALL THAT HAS THE BRAND NAME AND DECAL ON THE DOOR,  
19 OR THE PLATE THAT YOU PUSH AND PULL TO KIND OF OPEN AND SHUT  
20 THE DOOR THAT HAS THE ADVERTISING OR THE SIGNS IN THE  
21 WINDOWS, OR THE SIGNS THAT INDICATE THE PRICES FOR THINGS OR  
22 THE SPECIAL COUPON OFFERS.

23 SO ALL OF THAT IS, YOU KNOW, SPECIAL DISPLAYS AND  
24 PROMOTIONS AT THE STORE LEVEL. AND END OF AISLE DISPLAYS  
25 AND CHECKOUT DISPLAYS.

26 THEN, THERE'S ANOTHER FORM WHICH IS CLOSELY  
27 RELATED TOO, WHICH WOULD BE SPECIAL FORMS OF PACKAGING. YOU  
28 PUT TOGETHER A SPECIAL PACKAGE AND APPLY TO GET ONE FREE, 50

2075

1 PERCENT EXTRA FOR NO EXTRA CHARGE, OR BUY TWO OF THESE, GET  
2 A BASEBALL CAP OR SOME OTHER PREMIUM ITEM IT'S CALLED. SO  
3 THE OFFER OF SPECIALTY ADVERTISING ITEMS AS AN INCENTIVE FOR  
4 THE SALE OF THE GOODS IS ANOTHER FORM OF ADVERTISING OR  
5 PROMOTION.

6 Q. LET ME ASK YOU: WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF  
7 ADVERTISING?

8 A. WELL, THE WORD ACTUALLY COMES FROM OLD LATIN WORD  
9 OR TERM. IT MEANS TO TURN TOWARD AND PROMOTE.

10 SO "ADVERTISING" MEANS TO TURN TOWARD, AND  
11 PROMOTE MEANS TO ADVANCE. IT'S TO CREATE SALES; THAT IS,  
12 IT'S TO TURN THE CONSUMER'S ATTENTION TOWARD A PRODUCT TO  
13 PROMOTE SALES.

14 AND, YOU KNOW, IN BUSINESS, THE BOTTOM LINE IS:  
15 ARE WE GOING TO MAKE ANY MONEY FROM DOING THIS? YOU DON'T  
16 SPEND ON ADVERTISING UNLESS YOU HAVE SOME FAITH THAT IT'S  
17 GOING TO CONTRIBUTE TO THE BOTTOM LINE BY INDUCING MORE  
18 SALES THAN WOULD OTHERWISE BE THE CASE.

19 Q. WITH RESPECT TO THE INDIVIDUAL OR THE CONSUMER,  
20 IS THE CONSUMER -- IS ADVERTISING SOMETHING THAT CONSUMERS  
21 ARE ALWAYS AWARE OF, THAT THEY'RE BUYING A PRODUCT BECAUSE  
22 OF AN INFLUENCE FROM THE ADVERTISING?

23 A. NO. JUST THE OPPOSITE.

24 Q. WHAT DO YOU MEAN?

25 A. WELL, THERE'S A VERY OLD SAYING THAT COMES FROM  
26 THE EARLY PART OF THE 20TH CENTURY THAT SAYS: "ADVERTISING  
27 IS THE ART OF INSTRUCTING CONSUMERS AND THEN CAUSING  
28 CONSUMERS TO FORGET WHERE THEY RECEIVED THEIR INSTRUCTION."

2076

1 THAT IS, WE'RE TYPICALLY NOT AWARE OF WHERE OUR  
2 ATTITUDES ARE SHAPED ABOUT VARIOUS PRODUCTS, EVEN WHERE WE  
3 LEARN ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WHAT PRODUCTS.

4 IF YOU HAVE A FLU AND YOU GO TO THE DRUGSTORE,  
5 YOU'RE CHOOSING FROM FLU REMEDIES. YOU KNOW, WE'RE UNCLEAR  
6 AS TO WHERE WE'VE LEARNED ABOUT THESE VARIOUS ALTERNATIVES  
7 AND WHAT ROLE ADVERTISING MIGHT PLAY IN DIRECTING OUR CHOICE  
8 FOR THE VARIOUS ALTERNATIVES THAT WE CHOOSE.

9 Q. NOW, THERE IS SOME ADVERTISING THAT IS DIRECT AND  
10 THE PERSON KNOWS THEY'RE RESPONDING TO IT AND BUYS A PRODUCT  
11 AS A RESULT OF IT.

12 FOR EXAMPLE, JEANS ARE ON SALE AT A PARTICULAR  
13 STORE THIS WEEK FOR \$19.

14 THERE'S THAT TYPE OF ADVERTISING THAT IS USUALLY  
15 TRACEABLE TO THE SALE?

16 A. THERE'S THAT FORM. ALTHOUGH EVEN IN THAT  
17 EXAMPLE, YOUR ATTITUDES TOWARDS A PARTICULAR BRAND OF JEANS  
18 WOULD HAVE BEEN COLORED BY A HISTORY OF HAVING BEEN EXPOSED  
19 TO ADVERTISING FOR THAT BRAND OVER THE YEARS. AND THE FACT  
20 THAT YOU KNOW YOU SAW IT, SAY, ADVERTISED AT 19.95, THAT  
21 WOULD JUST BE THE FINAL STRAW, YOU KNOW, THAT LED YOU TO  
22 MAKE THAT PURCHASE. BUT YOUR PURCHASE, IN FACT, WOULD HAVE  
23 BEEN INFLUENCED BY A WHOLE HISTORY OF ADVERTISING.

24 BUT THERE ARE CERTAINLY ADS WHICH ARE DIRECT  
25 ACTION ADS, WHERE YOU SEE AN AD ON THE TELEVISION AND  
26 THERE'S AN 800 NUMBER PROVIDED, AND YOU GET ENTHUSED AND YOU  
27 WRITE DOWN THE 800 NUMBER. YOU CALL THE 800 NUMBER AND GET  
28 THE INFORMATION AND SO ON.

2077

1 THERE ARE SOME FORMS OF ADVERTISING THAT ARE  
2 DIRECT RESPONSE, EVEN THOUGH MOST ADVERTISING IN OUR WORLD  
3 IS NOT THAT NATURE. IT'S MORE INDIRECT IN THE WAY IT WORKS.

4 Q. AND THE PURPOSE OF IT BEING INDIRECT IS WHAT?

5 A. TO SHAPE OUR OPINIONS, ATTITUDES, BELIEFS,  
6 GENERALLY OUR PERCEPTIONS ABOUT THE PRODUCTS AND HOW GOOD  
7 THEY ARE, HOW SAFE THEY ARE, HOW TRENDY THEY ARE. YOU KNOW,  
8 HOW WILL I BE PERCEIVED IF I'M SEEN WEARING OR USING OR  
9 DRIVING A PARTICULAR PRODUCT.

10 SO IT'S, SAY, WORKING AT A PSYCHOLOGICAL LEVEL TO  
11 INFLUENCE OUR PERCEPTIONS.

12 Q. CAN ADVERTISING FOR ONE BRAND INFLUENCE US TO BUY  
13 A DIFFERENT BRAND OF THE SAME PRODUCT?

14 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. VAGUE. LACK OF  
15 FOUNDATION, YOUR HONOR.

16 THE COURT: OVERRULED.

17 THE WITNESS: YES.

18 MS. CHABER: Q. HOW DOES THAT WORK?

19 A. WELL, WHEN YOU ADVERTISE A -- ANYTIME YOU  
20 ADVERTISE, YOU ARE ADVERTISING BOTH THE BRAND AND THE  
21 PRODUCT.  
22 SO, FOR EXAMPLE, IF YOU WERE TO GET IN YOUR CAR  
23 AT THE LUNCH BREAK AND HEAR A MCDONALD'S AD, YOU MIGHT END  
24 UP EATING A HAMBURGER. IT MIGHT NOT BE A MCDONALD'S  
25 HAMBURGER. MAYBE THAT'S NOT THE FIRST HAMBURGER PLACE YOU  
26 CAME ACROSS, BUT YOU MIGHT BE STIMULATED TO EAT A HAMBURGER  
27 BECAUSE OF THAT.  
28 SO THE AD BOTH CALLS OUR ATTENTION TO AND MAKES  
2078  
1 US CHANGE OUR PERCEPTIONS ABOUT THE PRODUCT CATEGORY AS WELL  
2 AS THE SPECIFICS OF THE BRAND.  
3 Q. OKAY. DO BUSINESSES HAVE MEANS OF COMMUNICATING  
4 WITH THE PUBLIC IN FORMS THAT ARE NOT ADVERTISING OR  
5 PROMOTION?  
6 A. SURE, THEY HAVE. THEY HAVE EVERY MEANS POSSIBLE  
7 TO COMMUNICATE WITH THE PUBLIC.  
8 Q. CAN YOU GIVE US SOME EXAMPLES.  
9 A. WELL, THEY CAN PRODUCE PAMPHLETS, BROCHURES,  
10 PACKAGE INSERTS. THEY CAN TAKE OUT PUBLIC INFORMATION  
11 ADVERTISING TO COMMUNICATE INFORMATION IN DETAIL TO THE  
12 PUBLIC.  
13 I MEAN, THE TYPES OF ADVERTISING WE SEE WHICH  
14 DON'T HAVE MUCH INFORMATION, THAT ARE MORE ROMANCING A  
15 PRODUCT THAN INFORMING ABOUT THE PRODUCT, THAT'S A STRATEGIC  
16 CHOICE AS TO HOW THAT WORKS.  
17 THEY HAVE THE CAPACITY, IF THEY WANTED TO, TO  
18 PROVIDE A LOT OF INFORMATION.  
19 Q. AND HAVE YOU LOOKED AT THE TIME PERIOD BEFORE --  
20 LET ME GO BACK A SECOND.  
21 YOU HAVE REVIEWED SOME INFORMATION ABOUT LESLIE  
22 WHITELEY?  
23 A. YES.  
24 Q. AND YOU KNOW SHE WAS BORN IN 1959?  
25 A. YES.  
26 Q. IN YOUR OPINION, WOULD ADVERTISING THAT HAD BEEN  
27 PRODUCED PRIOR -- COULD ADVERTISING THAT HAD BEEN PRODUCED  
28 PRIOR TO HER BIRTH HAVE SOME INFLUENCE ON HER?  
2079  
1 A. YES.  
2 Q. AND TELL US HOW THAT WOULD WORK.  
3 A. PRIMARILY BECAUSE THEY WOULD HAVE AFFECTED THE  
4 PERCEPTIONS, ATTITUDES OF HER FAMILY, AND THAT'S BOTH HER  
5 PARENTS AND ANY OLDER SIBLINGS; THAT IS, THE BROTHERS AND  
6 SISTER WHO ARE OLDER IN AGE, WHO HAD SEEN THOSE ADS, IN SOME  
7 CASES, IN OLD MAGAZINES THAT CAN LIE AROUND A HOUSE FOR  
8 AWHILE. THEY MIGHT STILL BE AVAILABLE FOR HER TO SEE.  
9 BUT EVEN WITHOUT THAT, THEY ARGUABLY HAVE BEEN AN  
10 INFLUENCE IN THE WAY IN WHICH CIGARETTES WERE PERCEIVED BY  
11 HER FRIENDS, NEIGHBORS AND PEERS.  
12 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. HE'S GONE  
13 BEYOND ANSWERING THE QUESTION.  
14 THE COURT: OVERRULED. THIS IS RESPONSIVE.  
15 MS. CHABER: Q. YOU WERE CUT OFF IN THE MIDDLE  
16 OF THE ANSWER.  
17 A. WELL, YOUR QUESTION WAS, YOU KNOW, WOULD  
18 ADVERTISING, SAY FROM EARLIER THAN THE 1950S, BEFORE HER  
19 BIRTH, STILL BE OF RELEVANCE TO HER AND --  
20 THE COURT: THE QUESTION WAS "COULD."  
21 MS. CHABER: "COULD."  
22 THE COURT: THE QUESTION WAS "COULD."  
23 THE WITNESS: RIGHT. AND IT'S MY OPINION THAT

24 IT COULD.  
25 MS. CHABER: Q. AND WOULD ADVERTISING THAT HER  
26 PARENTS HAD SEEN HAVE -- COULD ADVERTISING THAT HER PARENTS  
27 HAD SEEN HAVE AN IMPACT ON HER?  
28 A. YES.

2080  
1 Q. AND IN THE SAME FASHION?  
2 A. YES.  
3 MS. CHABER: I DON'T KNOW HOW MUCH TIME WE  
4 HAVE. I HAVE A SERIES OF EXHIBITS, YOUR HONOR, THAT HAVE  
5 BEEN PREMARKED, AND THESE ARE YOUR COPIES.  
6 THE COURT: OKAY.  
7 MS. CHABER: 1860, A MARLBORO AD; 1861, ANOTHER  
8 MARLBORO AD; 1862, MARLBORO; 1863, MARLBORO; 1864, A  
9 MARLBORO AD.  
10 I HAVE YOUR COPIES HERE.  
11 THE COURT: I KNOW. THANKS.  
12 MS. CHABER: I'M SORRY. I'M OFFERING THESE NOT  
13 QUITE IN ORDER. THERE'S LOGIC TO MY PRESENTATION.  
14 THE COURT: WHEN YOU SAY "YOU'RE OFFERING," YOU  
15 ARE NOT OFFERING THEM INTO EVIDENCE. YOU'RE JUST HAVING  
16 THEM MARKED?  
17 MS. CHABER: HAVING THEM MARKED, YES.  
18 THE COURT: OKAY.  
19  
20 MS. CHABER: 1854, WHICH IS A PORTION OF A LOOK  
21 MAGAZINE FROM JUNE 9TH, 1959. 1855, A PORTION OF A LOOK  
22 MAGAZINE FROM DECEMBER 31ST, 1963.  
23 THE CLERK: WE USED THOSE NUMBERS, 1854, 1855.  
24 MS. CHABER: OKAY. I HAVE TO CHANGE THOSE TWO.  
25 LET ME GO ON AND I'LL FIX THOSE.  
26 THE COURT: ARE THESE NUMBERS THAT YOU JUST GAVE  
27 GOING TO BE OUR NUMBERS?  
28 MS. CHABER: THE 1854 AND 1855, I'VE JUST BEEN

2081  
1 INFORMED ARE USED.  
2 THE COURT: YOU ARE GIVING THEM DIFFERENT  
3 NUMBERS THAN THAT?  
4 MS. CHABER: I WILL GIVE THEM DIFFERENT NUMBERS.  
5 THE COURT: DO YOU WANT TO TELL US THOSE NUMBERS  
6 NOW?  
7 MS. CHABER: I WANT TO DO THE OTHER ONES NOW. I  
8 KNOW WHAT'S LEFT. I DON'T WANT TO GIVE ANOTHER NUMBER THAT  
9 MAY HAVE BEEN USED.  
10 THE COURT: WE'RE NOT MARKING THE LOOK MAGAZINE  
11 YET?  
12 MS. CHABER: CORRECT.  
13 THE COURT: OKAY.  
14 MS. CHABER: 1858, LIFE MAGAZINE, JULY 21, 1967,  
15 PORTIONS OF THE MAGAZINE. 1859, PORTIONS OF THE SATURDAY  
16 EVENING POST FROM MARCH 23RD, 1968.  
17 THE COURT: MARCH WHAT?  
18 MS. CHABER: 23RD, 1968.  
19 THE COURT: OKAY.  
20 MS. CHABER: THE NUMBERS SKIP OVER.  
21 1888, A PORTION OF A LOOK MAGAZINE FROM MARCH  
22 22ND, 1966. AND 1889, A PORTION OF THE SATURDAY EVENING  
23 POST FROM JUNE 4TH, 1966.  
24 (DISCUSSION OFF THE RECORD)  
25 MS. CHABER: 1891, YOUR HONOR, WILL BE THE LOOK  
26 MAGAZINE FROM JUNE 9TH, 1959.  
27 THE COURT: AND 1892 IS THE LOOK MAGAZINE FROM  
28 DECEMBER 31, 1963?

2082

1 MS. CHABER: THAT'S CORRECT.  
2 THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.  
3 THOSE ARE ALL THE JUDGE'S COPIES.  
4 (DOCUMENTS MORE PARTICULARLY  
5 LISTED IN THE INDEX PRE-MARKED  
6 FOR IDENTIFICATION PLAINTIFFS'  
7 EXHIBIT #S 1860-1864, 1858-1859,  
8 1888-1892)  
9 MS. CHABER: DO YOU HAVE ANY OBJECTIONS TO USING  
10 THEM FOR DEMONSTRATIVE PURPOSES?  
11 MR. ESCHER: NOT FOR DEMONSTRATIVE PURPOSES.  
12 MR. BARRON: IF THERE'S A FOUNDATION LAID, NOT  
13 AT ALL.  
14 MS. CHABER: I WILL ESTABLISH THAT.  
15 Q. DR. POLLAY, IN THE COURSE OF YOUR LOOKING AT  
16 ADVERTISING, CIGARETTE ADVERTISING OVER THE YEARS, HAVE YOU  
17 LOOKED AT VARIOUS CAMPAIGNS OR VARIOUS ADVERTISING FOR  
18 DIFFERENT BRANDS OF CIGARETTES?  
19 A. I HAVE.  
20 Q. AND HAVE YOU LOOKED AT ADVERTISING FOR MARLBORO  
21 CIGARETTES?  
22 A. YES.  
23 Q. AND I'M HANDING YOU WHAT'S BEEN MARKED 1860, 61,  
24 62, 63 AND 64.  
25 CAN YOU LOOK AT THOSE ADS FOR A MOMENT.  
26 A. (EXAMINING)  
27 THE COURT: AFTER YOU DEAL WITH THIS GROUP,  
28 LET'S GO TO LUNCH.

2083

1 THE WITNESS: YES.  
2 MS. CHABER: Q. DO YOU RECOGNIZE THOSE ADS AS  
3 BEING ADS THAT YOU HAVE COLLECTED IN YOUR ARCHIVES OF THE  
4 HISTORY OF ADVERTISING?  
5 A. I DO.  
6 Q. AND DO THEY ALL PREDATE 1969?  
7 A. THEY DO.  
8 MS. CHABER: DO YOU WANT TO STOP THERE, YOUR  
9 HONOR?  
10 THE COURT: OKAY. AS I INDICATED TO YOU  
11 EARLIER, JURORS, I WANT TO SPEND A FEW MINUTES' TIME OVER  
12 THE NOON HOUR WITH THE LAWYERS, CONTINUING IN THIS PROCESS  
13 HOPEFULLY OF EXPEDITING THE PROCESS OF DEALING WITH THESE  
14 DOCUMENTS, SO BASICALLY WE DON'T GET BOGGED DOWN ON LEGAL  
15 ISSUES ABOUT THESE DOCUMENTS WHILE YOU HAVE TO WAIT FOR US  
16 TO DO OUR WORK.  
17 SO I'D RATHER GIVE YOU AN EXTRA HALF HOUR FOR  
18 LUNCH SO THAT YOU CAN ENJOY YOURSELVES, AND WE WILL DO THIS  
19 WORK.  
20 LET ME ASK COUNSEL. I'LL MEET YOU HERE, SAY, AT  
21 1:25. BUT FOR THE JURY, WE'LL START AGAIN AT 2:00 O'CLOCK  
22 THIS AFTERNOON.  
23 SO PLEASE CONTINUE TO FOLLOW ADMONITION. WE'LL  
24 SEE YOU BACK AT 2:00 O'CLOCK.  
25 (LUNCH RECESS TAKEN AT 12:00 NOON)

2084

1 AFTERNOON SESSION 2:07 P.M.  
2 WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 2, 2000  
3 THE COURT: WE ARE BACK ON THE RECORD.  
4 AND MS. CHABER, YOU MAY PROCEED.

5 MS. CHABER: THANK YOU. I HAVE A SERIES OF  
6 ADDITIONAL ADS THAT HAVE BEEN PREMARKED, YOUR HONOR.  
7 THE COURT: OKAY.  
8 MS. CHABER: PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1866. I'M JUST  
9 GOING TO IDENTIFY THEM BY NUMBER BECAUSE HE'S GOING TO GO  
10 THROUGH EACH OF THEM.  
11 THE COURT: THAT'S FINE.  
12 MS. CHABER: 1867, 1868, 1869, 1870, 1871, 1872,  
13 1873, 1875, 1876, 1877, 1878, 1879, 1880, 1881, 1882, 1883,  
14 1884, 1885, AND 1886.  
15 (DOCUMENTS MORE PARTICULARLY  
16 LISTED IN THE INDEX PREMARKED  
17 FOR IDENTIFICATION PLAINTIFFS'  
18 EXHIBITS # 1866-1873, 1875-1886)  
19  
20 DIRECT EXAMINATION (CONTINUED)  
21 BY MS. CHABER: Q. DR. POLLAY, I'VE HANDED YOU  
22 ALL OF THE EXHIBITS THAT WE MARKED BOTH BEFORE LUNCH AND  
23 AFTER LUNCH, AS WELL AS EXHIBITS 1857 AND 1874 THAT WERE  
24 OFFERED DURING PATSY WHITTEKER'S TESTIMONY.  
25 AND I'D ASK YOU TO TAKE A QUICK LOOK AT ALL OF  
26 THESE ADS. AND I'M JUST GOING TO ASK YOU SOME GENERAL  
27 QUESTIONS ABOUT THEM, AND THEN WE CAN TALK MORE  
28 SPECIFICALLY.  
2085  
1 A. (EXAMINING)  
2 Q. DID I WALK AWAY WITH SOME OF THEM?  
3 I DID.  
4 MS. CHABER: YOUR HONOR, I WOULD WITHDRAW 1882.  
5 (PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT NO. 1882 WITHDRAWN)  
6 THE WITNESS: YES, I HAVE REVIEWED THESE.  
7 MS. CHABER: Q. DOCTOR, ARE YOU FAMILIAR WITH  
8 ALL OF THESE ADS?  
9 A. I AM.  
10 Q. AND ARE THERE ANY ADS THAT YOU HAVE BEEN PROVIDED  
11 THAT ARE AFTER 1969?  
12 A. I DON'T THINK SO. I THINK THEY ALL PREDATE 1969.  
13 Q. AS WE GO THROUGH THEM, IF YOU CAN HELP US WITH  
14 EITHER A DATE OR A TIME FRAME, WOULD YOU DO SO?  
15 A. GLADLY.  
16 Q. NOW, DO THEY REPRESENT ADS THAT ARE OF MORE THAN  
17 ONE CIGARETTE MANUFACTURER?  
18 A. THEY DO.  
19 Q. AND DO THEY REPRESENT ADS OVER A HISTORICAL TIME  
20 PERIOD?  
21 A. THEY REPRESENT ADS FROM THE LATE '50S AND 1960S.  
22 Q. OKAY. AND ARE THERE DIFFERENT SORT OF CATEGORIES  
23 OF ADS AS OPPOSED TO DIFFERENT BRANDS OF ADS?  
24 A. YES. THERE'S SOME ADS WHICH ARE ENDORSEMENTS,  
25 FOR EXAMPLE. THAT WOULD BE A CATEGORY OF AD.  
26 Q. OKAY.  
27 A. THEY ARE NOT ALL CELEBRITY ENDORSEMENTS.  
28 Q. WHAT DIFFERENT CATEGORIES OF ADS DO YOU HAVE UP  
2086  
1 THERE?  
2 A. WELL, I HAVEN'T GOT A TALLY OF THEM, BUT THERE  
3 ARE SOME --  
4 MR. BARRON: EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR. I'M NOT  
5 FOLLOWING.  
6 VAGUE AND AMBIGUOUS AS TO THE CONCEPT OF  
7 "CATEGORIES OF ADS."  
8 THE COURT: SUSTAINED.  
9 MS. CHABER: Q. ARE THERE ADS THAT HAVE

10 CERTAIN CONSISTENT THEMES, ALTHOUGH NOT NECESSARILY THE SAME  
11 BRAND?

12 A. YES. AND ALSO CONSISTENCY OF INSTITUTIONAL  
13 STYLES.

14 Q. OKAY. AND ARE THERE ADS THAT, WITHIN CERTAIN  
15 TIME PERIODS, WERE CHARACTERISTIC OF ADS THAT APPEARED  
16 DURING THOSE TIME PERIODS ONLY?

17 A. YES.

18 Q. CAN YOU TELL US WHAT TYPES OF ADS FOR WHICH THERE  
19 WERE SPECIFIC TIME PERIODS, SORT OF THE GENERAL NATURE,  
20 WITHOUT GOING SPECIFICALLY INTO EACH AD AT THE MOMENT?

21 MR. BARRON: AGAIN, YOUR HONOR, VAGUE AND  
22 AMBIGUOUS.

23 I'M NOT SURE THE WITNESS IS BEING ASKED TO  
24 TESTIFY OR INTERPRET THE ADS.

25 IF SO, I WOULD OBJECT ON THE BASIS OF  
26 INAPPROPRIATE OPINION RATHER THAN BEING A MATTER OF COMMON  
27 KNOWLEDGE, WHICH CAN BE DECIDED WITHOUT OPINION.

28 THE COURT: HOLD ON.

2087

1 I GUESS YOU'RE SAYING IT'S VAGUE AS TO WHAT'S  
2 MEANT BY "WHAT TYPES OF ADS"?

3 MR. BARRON: EXACTLY.

4 THE COURT: I'LL SUSTAIN. SHE CAN CLARIFY THAT.

5 MR. BARRON: THANK YOU.

6 MS. CHABER: Q. DR. POLLAY, WE WERE TALKING  
7 ABOUT THE INFLUENCES ON THE INDIVIDUAL AND HOW ADVERTISING  
8 AND PROMOTIONAL AND PUBLIC RELATIONS WOULD HAVE THEIR  
9 EFFECTS. YOU LISTED THINGS DOWN LIKE CELEBRITIES, FOR  
10 EXAMPLE.

11 ARE THERE ADS THAT ARE THERE THAT ARE WHAT YOU  
12 WOULD CALL CELEBRITY ADS?

13 A. YES. THERE ARE SEVERAL TYPES WITHIN THAT GENERAL  
14 CATEGORY AS WELL.

15 Q. CAN YOU PICK A FEW OUT AND I'LL PUT THEM ON THE  
16 OVERHEAD, AND WE CAN TALK ABOUT THEM.

17 THE COURT: I TAKE IT THERE'S NO OBJECTION TO  
18 THESE BEING SHOWN?

19 MR. BARRON: NO OBJECTION.

20 MR. ESCHER: THE ONLY OBJECTION WE HAVE IS THE  
21 RELEVANCE OBJECTION WE DISCUSSED EARLIER.

22 THE COURT: THE OBJECTION IS NOT FOUNDATIONAL.  
23 IT'S RELEVANCE?

24 MR. ESCHER: THAT'S RIGHT.

25 THE COURT: OVERRULED.

26 MR. BARRON: FOR THE RECORD, I SUPPOSE I SHOULD  
27 STATE WE DID JOIN IN THAT OBJECTION.

28 THE COURT: I THINK WHEN ANY DEFENDANT MAKES AN

2088

1 OBJECTION, IT'S DEEMED THAT ALL HAVE MADE IT OR WHEN NOBODY  
2 MAKES ANY.

3 MR. BARRON: I STATED "NO OBJECTION" BEFORE HE  
4 SPOKE.

5 THE COURT: SO YOU JOIN IN THAT. OKAY.

6 LET ME JUST TALK TO THE LAWYERS FOR MINUTE.

7 MS. CHABER: YOU KEEP SORTING, DOCTOR, WHILE WE  
8 DO THAT.

9 (COURT AND COUNSEL CONFER OUTSIDE  
10 THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY)

11 THE COURT: WE ARE BACK ON THE RECORD.

12 MS. CHABER.

13 MS. CHABER: Q. FIRST OF ALL, DR. POLLAY, LET  
14 ME JUST ASK YOU THIS QUESTION: IS THE ENVIRONMENT WITH



15 RESPECT TO SMOKING ATTITUDES AND AWARENESS DIFFERENT TODAY  
16 THAN IT WAS IN THE 1940S, '50S, '60S, '70S?  
17 A. VERY DIFFERENT.  
18 Q. OKAY. AND IS THE ADVERTISING THAT WE'RE LOOKING  
19 AT FROM THE TIME PERIOD IN THE 1940S, 1950S AND 1960S?  
20 A. YES.  
21 Q. AND WHEN I ASK YOU QUESTIONS ABOUT THESE ADS, I'M  
22 ASKING YOU AS A HISTORIAN, AS A PERSON WHO DEALS WITH  
23 ADVERTISING AND THE HISTORY OF ADVERTISING, AND THE EFFECT  
24 ON THE CONSUMER.  
25 WILL YOU CONFINE YOUR ANSWERS TO THE CONSUMER  
26 AWARENESS OF THE TIME WHEN THE ADS WERE AVAILABLE?  
27 A. OKAY.  
28 Q. DR. POLLAY, WERE THESE ALL COMMERCIALLY AVAILABLE  
2089  
1 ADS THAT WE HAVE BEFORE US?  
2 A. YES, I BELIEVE SO. IF THERE IS ANY EXCEPTION TO  
3 THAT, LIKE A TRADE AD, I'LL CALL IT TO YOUR ATTENTION, IF IT  
4 SHOULD ARISE.  
5 I DIDN'T SCAN THE WHOLE SET WITH THAT QUESTION IN  
6 MIND. I BELIEVE THEY ARE.  
7 Q. AND YOU'LL KNOW THEM, IF AND WHEN ONE COMES UP?  
8 A. YES.  
9 Q. OKAY. NOW, I BELIEVE WE WERE SEPARATING THEM  
10 INTO CATEGORIES.  
11 WHAT'S THE FIRST CATEGORY?  
12 A. THESE ARE SPORT CELEBRITIES AND THESE ARE  
13 NONSPORT CELEBRITIES.  
14 Q. LET'S START WITH THOSE. LET'S START WITH THE  
15 SPORTS CELEBRITIES, SINCE I THINK BY --  
16 THE COURT: IF YOU ARE GOING TO SHOW SOMETHING  
17 THAT'S NOT IN EVIDENCE, I NEED TO ASK WHETHER THERE IS ANY  
18 OBJECTION TO IT BEING SHOWN.  
19 MR. BARRON: PROBABLY NOT. I DON'T KNOW WHICH  
20 ONES.  
21 THE COURT: WHY DON'T YOU TELL HIM THE NUMBER.  
22 MS. CHABER: I WILL GIVE THEM THE NUMBERS IN A  
23 GROUP. MAYBE THAT WAY --  
24 MR. BARRON: SO WE ARE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE,  
25 COULD WE HAVE THE DATE ALSO, YOUR HONOR, AND WHATEVER THE  
26 PUBLICATION IS?  
27 THE COURT: WHY DON'T YOU DO THIS, MS. CHABER.  
28 BEFORE YOU SHOW SOMETHING TO THE JURY, ASK THE WITNESS WHAT  
2090  
1 THE DATE OF IT IS, AND IF HE KNOWS ANYTHING ABOUT ITS  
2 DISSEMINATION OR PUBLICATION.  
3 AND THEN EITHER YOU CAN OFFER IT INTO EVIDENCE OR  
4 YOU CAN ASK WHETHER YOU CAN DISPLAY IT. I CAN ASK THE  
5 DEFENSE WHETHER THEY OBJECT TO IT. THIS IS THE ORDERLY WAY  
6 TO PROVIDE.  
7 IS THAT ALL RIGHT?  
8 MS. CHABER: THE ONLY PROBLEM IS THE DISTANCE  
9 BETWEEN ME AND HIM, AND THIS BEING THE COPIES. I CAN DO IT  
10 UP THERE, AND THEN I'LL SHOW THEM AFTER.  
11 THE COURT: OKAY.  
12 MS. CHABER: Q. 1866.  
13 A. THESE ARE THE SPORTS CELEBRITIES IN THE ORDER OF  
14 THE EXHIBIT NUMBER, WHATEVER YOU CALL IT, IDENTIFICATION  
15 NUMBERS.  
16 Q. THESE ARE SOMEWHAT IN ORDER OF DATE BUT NOT  
17 NECESSARILY.  
18 I'M TRYING TO SEE IF THERE IS A SHORT-CIRCUITED  
19 WAY TO DO IT OTHER THAN ONE BY ONE.

20 THE COURT: THAT'S FINE.  
21 IF YOU CAN PUT THEM IN GROUPS IN SOME WAY, THAT'S  
22 FINE.  
23 MS. CHABER: THEY ARE IN GROUPS.  
24 THE COURT: WHATEVER. YOU PROCEED THE WAY YOU  
25 WANT.  
26 MS. CHABER: YES. I AM TRYING TO NOT HAVE TO  
27 RUN BACK AND FORTH. OKAY.  
28 I THINK I HAVE A SOLUTION, YOUR HONOR, THAT'S  
2091  
1 GOING TO WORK.  
2 THE COURT: OKAY.  
3 MS. CHABER: Q. OKAY. DR. POLLAY, WE'RE  
4 LOOKING AT THE CATEGORY OF SPORTS CELEBRITIES; CORRECT?  
5 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
6 Q. OKAY. AND CAN YOU TELL US WHAT THE EARLIEST  
7 ADVERTISEMENT YOU HAVE THERE, AND IDENTIFY IT BY EXHIBIT  
8 NUMBER.  
9 A. EXHIBIT 1869.  
10 Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU KNOW WHAT PUBLICATION THAT IT'S  
11 FROM?  
12 A. I BELIEVE IT'S FROM LIFE MAGAZINE. AND THIS  
13 CAMPAIGN RAN IN COMPARABLE MAGAZINES, WHICH WOULD BE LIFE,  
14 LOOK, COLLIER'S, SATURDAY EVENING POST.  
15 THAT IS, THE LARGE FORMAT, COLOR, PRINTED  
16 MAGAZINES.  
17 MS. CHABER: ANY OBJECTION TO SHOWING 1869?  
18 THE COURT: CAN WE GET THE PERIOD OF TIME?  
19 MR. BARRON: THE DATE.  
20 MS. CHABER: I'M SORRY.  
21 THE WITNESS: 1949.  
22 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?  
23 YOU'RE ASKING NOW TO SHOW IT?  
24 MS. CHABER: YES.  
25 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION TO IT BEING SHOWN?  
26 MR. ESCHER: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
27 MR. BARRON: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
28 THE COURT: OKAY. YOU MAY SHOW IT.  
2092  
1 MS. CHABER: Q. DOCTOR, WE HAVE AN AD, "ALWAYS  
2 BUY CHESTERFIELD. THEY SATISFY"?  
3 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
4 Q. AND THEN IT'S IDENTIFIED AS "THE BASEBALL MAN'S  
5 CIGARETTE"?  
6 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
7 Q. AND CAN YOU IDENTIFY WHO SOME OF THOSE PEOPLE  
8 ARE?  
9 THAT WAS THE YEAR I WAS BORN, SO I DON'T KNOW.  
10 A. THERE ARE A FEW NAMES THAT REMAIN FAMOUS. THERE  
11 WERE SUCH STARS, THEY'RE STILL WELL-KNOWN. TED WILLIAMS,  
12 JOE DIMAGGIO AND STAN MUSIAL ARE THE THREE UP AT THE TOP,  
13 AND OVER AT THE RIGHT, SORT OF AT 11:00 O'CLOCK, 1:00  
14 O'CLOCK AND 3:00 O'CLOCK, IF YOU KNOW WHAT I MEAN.  
15 AND THE OTHERS ARE ALSO BASEBALL STARS OF THE  
16 TIME.  
17 Q. AND WHAT WOULD THE CONSUMER COME AWAY WITH FROM  
18 LOOKING AT THIS AD?  
19 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. LACK OF  
20 FOUNDATION.  
21 THE COURT: OVERRULED.  
22 THE WITNESS: I THINK THE CONSUMER'S CONCLUSION  
23 WOULD BE THAT IF A PROFESSIONAL ATHLETE FELT COMFORTABLE  
24 SMOKING, BEING THAT THEIR PHYSICAL PERFORMANCE IS THE HEART

25 OF THEIR INCOME-EARNING CAPACITY, THERE IS NO REASON WHY THE  
26 AVERAGE CITIZEN SHOULDN'T FEEL COMFORTABLE.

27 MS. CHABER: Q. WHAT'S THE NEXT EXHIBIT NUMBER  
28 BY DATE?

2093

1 A. 1885.

2 Q. AND WHAT'S THE DATE ON THAT?

3 A. 1950.

4 Q. AND WOULD THIS HAVE BEEN IN A COMMERCIAL  
5 PUBLICATION?

6 A. YES. I DON'T RECALL THE SPECIFIC ONE, BUT IT  
7 WOULD HAVE BEEN, I THINK, LIFE MAGAZINE.

8 THAT'S ACTUALLY WHERE IT'S -- THOSE TYPES OF  
9 MAGAZINES ARE PRIMARILY THE SOURCES FROM WHICH OUR ARCHIVES  
10 HAVE BEEN ASSEMBLED. THAT'S TEARING APART OLD MAGAZINES OF  
11 THAT NATURE.

12 MS. CHABER: YOUR HONOR, JUST SO WE DO THIS AS  
13 WE GO ALONG, I'M OFFERING 1869 IN EVIDENCE.

14 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION TO 1869?

15 MR. ESCHER: OTHER THAN THE RELEVANCE OBJECTION  
16 WE HAD EARLIER.

17 THE COURT: OVERRULED. 1869 IS RECEIVED.

18 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
19 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
20 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
21 EXHIBIT # 1869)

22 MS. CHABER: I'LL OFFER 1885 INTO EVIDENCE AND  
23 SEEK TO DISPLAY IT.

24 THE COURT: ANY OBJECTION?

25 FIRST -- I GUESS THERE ARE TWO QUESTIONS.

26 ANY OBJECTION TO IT BEING DISPLAYED?

27 MR. ESCHER: NO, YOUR HONOR.

28 MR. BARRON: NO, YOUR HONOR.

2094

1 THE COURT: THERE IS NO OBJECTION TO 1885 BEING  
2 SHOWN.

3 MR. BARRON: OR IT GOING INTO EVIDENCE.

4 THE COURT: WHAT?

5 MR. BARRON: OR IT GOING INTO EVIDENCE.

6 THE COURT: 1885 IS RECEIVED.

7 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
8 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
9 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
10 EXHIBIT # 1885)

11 MS. CHABER: Q. DR. POLLAY, THIS ADVERTISEMENT  
12 FOR LUCKY STRIKE, THERE'S SOME LANGUAGE ON THE  
13 ADVERTISEMENT. LET ME ASK YOU JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS,  
14 GENERAL QUESTIONS IN CONNECTION WITH THIS.

15 WHEN YOU'RE LOOKING AT ADVERTISING AND ANALYZING  
16 IT WITH RESPECT TO ITS CONTENT, IS THERE BOTH IMPLICIT  
17 CONTENT AND EXPLICIT CONTENT?

18 A. YES.

19 Q. AND CAN YOU TELL THE JURY WHAT THAT MEANS AND  
20 WHAT THE DISTINGUISHMENT IS?

21 A. WELL, WHETHER THINGS ARE SAID OUTRIGHT OR WHETHER  
22 THEY'RE IMPLIED IN THE LANGUAGE OR CONVEYED THROUGH THE  
23 NATURE OF THE IMAGERY OR THE TONE OF THE ADVERTISING OR THE  
24 NATURE OF THE TOPOGRAPHY, SOMETHING LIKE THAT, THE LATTER  
25 WOULD BE IMPLICIT COMMUNICATIONS, WHEREAS IF IT'S SOMETHING  
26 SAID POINT BLANK, THAT WOULD BE EXPLICIT.

27 Q. AND THIS "L.S./M.F.T." AT THE BOTTOM, WHAT IS  
28 THAT?

2095

1 A. THAT WAS A SLOGAN PHRASE THAT THEY USED IN ALL OF  
2 THEIR RADIO COMMERCIALS. IT WAS THE INITIALS OR ACRONYM OR  
3 THE PHRASE THAT FOLLOWS: "LUCKY STRIKE MEANS FINE  
4 TOBACCO."

5 Q. AND WHO IS THAT THERE ENDORSING THIS LUCKY  
6 STRIKE?

7 A. THAT'S JESSE OWENS, FAMOUS TRACK STAR.

8 Q. AND WHAT WOULD THE CONSUMER COME AWAY WITH  
9 LOOKING AT THIS AD BACK AT THE TIME THAT THE AD EXISTED?

10 A. THAT CIGARETTES WOULDN'T GET YOU WINDED, AMONG  
11 OTHER THINGS. IF A TRACK STAR WHOSE LUNG CAPACITY IS  
12 ESSENTIAL TO HIS PERFORMANCE IN HIS SPORT FELT COMFORTABLE  
13 SMOKING, THE AVERAGE CITIZEN COULD FEEL COMFORTABLE SMOKING.

14 Q. AND JESSE OWENS IS QUOTED AS SAYING, "I SMOKE  
15 LUCKIES REGULARLY - THEY TASTE SO MILD AND SMOOTH"?

16 A. YES. THE COPY GOES ON TO SAY, "THERE'S NEVER A  
17 ROUGH PUFF."

18 Q. AND THEN, AT THE TOP, THERE'S SOME LANGUAGE THAT  
19 SAYS: "THESE SCIENTIFIC TESTS CONFIRMED BY INDEPENDENT  
20 CONSULTING LABORATORIES PROVE LUCKY STRIKE MILDEST OF THE  
21 SIX MAJOR BRANDS TESTED."

22 WHAT DOES THAT LANGUAGE -- WHAT EFFECT WOULD THAT  
23 HAVE ON AN INDIVIDUAL LOOKING AT IT?

24 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. LACK OF FOUNDATION,  
25 YOUR HONOR.

26 THE COURT: OVERRULED.

27 THE WITNESS: IT WOULD SUGGEST THAT SCIENTIFIC  
28 RESEARCH HAS BEEN EMPLOYED TO VALIDATE THE CLAIMS IN THE

2096

1 ADVERTISEMENT.

2 MS. CHABER: Q. ARE YOU AWARE OF ANY  
3 SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH DONE AT THE TIME THAT VALIDATES THE  
4 CLAIM?

5 A. I'M NOT, NO.

6 Q. AND WHAT'S THE NEXT EXHIBIT IN TIME?

7 A. 1884.

8 Q. AND WHAT IS THE TIME PERIOD?

9 A. THIS ONE, I'M APPROXIMATING. I DON'T HAVE THE  
10 EXACT DATE. BECAUSE OF THE NATURE OF THE CAMPAIGN, I  
11 BELIEVE IT TO BE FROM 1952 OR '53.

12 Q. YOU BELIEVE IT'S IN THE EARLY 1950S, BUT YOU  
13 CAN'T SAY PRECISELY WHAT DATE?

14 A. THAT'S CORRECT. IT'S DEFINITELY, I THINK, BEFORE  
15 1955, BECAUSE BY THAT TIME CHESTERFIELD HAD A FILTERED  
16 VERSION AND WAS ADVERTISING BOTH IN THE ADS.

17 Q. AND THIS ONLY ADVERTISES --

18 A. THIS ONLY ADVERTISES THE REGULAR.

19 MS. CHABER: I WOULD OFFER 1884 AND SEEK TO  
20 DISPLAY IT.

21 THE COURT: LET'S JUST FIND OUT, BEFORE I ASK IF  
22 THERE IS AN OBJECTION, WHERE IT APPEARS.

23 MS. CHABER: Q. DO YOU KNOW, DR. POLLAY, WHERE  
24 IT APPEARED?

25 A. NO, NOT WITH SPECIFIC CERTAINTY, EXCEPT THAT IT  
26 WOULD HAVE COME FROM A MASS CIRCULATION MAGAZINE LIKE LIFE  
27 OR SATURDAY EVENING POST.

28 Q. THIS ISN'T THE TYPE OF ADVERTISEMENT THAT WOULD

2097

1 TEND TO BE IN A TRADE MAGAZINE?

2 A. NO. NO. THIS IS NOT A TRADE AD. THIS IS A  
3 CONSUMER-DIRECTED AD.

4 MS. CHABER: WITH THAT CLARIFICATION, I WOULD  
5 OFFER 1884 AND SEEK TO DISPLAY IT.

6 THE COURT: TWO QUESTIONS.  
7 MR. ESCHER: WE HAVE NO OBJECTION TO IT BEING  
8 DISPLAYED, YOUR HONOR. WE HAVE THE CONTINUING OBJECTION ON  
9 THE RELEVANCE ISSUE.  
10 I DON'T SEE THAT IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE TO KEEP  
11 MAKING THAT OBJECTION.  
12 THE COURT: OKAY. DO YOU HAVE A PROBLEM WITH MY  
13 GIVING A CONTINUING LINE OF OBJECTION?  
14 AS I UNDERSTAND IT, JUST SO THE RECORD IS CLEAR,  
15 THE CONTINUING LINE OF OBJECTION IS TO THE ADMISSION INTO  
16 EVIDENCE OF EACH OF THESE ADS THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED, THE  
17 OBJECTION BEING RELEVANCE.  
18 BUT IN NO CASE IS THERE AN OBJECTION TO IT BEING  
19 TO THE SHOWN TO THE JURY.  
20 DO I HAVE THAT RIGHT OR DOES IT EXTEND TO IT  
21 BEING SHOWN TO THE JURY?  
22 MR. ESCHER: THE OBJECTION EXTENDS TO IT BEING  
23 SHOWN TO THE JURY, YOUR HONOR.  
24 THE COURT: OKAY. ALL RIGHT.  
25 I'LL OVERRULE IT AS TO 1884. I'M GOING TO HAVE  
26 TO TAKE THESE ON A ONE-BY-ONE BASIS, BUT I WILL ALWAYS  
27 ASSUME THAT YOU HAVE MADE THAT OBJECTION TO IT, SO YOU DON'T  
28 NEED TO STAND UP AND REPEAT IT, IF THAT'S YOUR PREFERENCE.

2098

1 MR. ESCHER: WOULD THE SAME BE THE CASE FOR THE  
2 FOUNDATION OBJECTIONS TO THE FOLLOW-UP QUESTIONS WITH  
3 RESPECT TO THESE DOCUMENTS THAT ARE THE SAME AS THE ONES  
4 WE'VE ALREADY DONE?  
5 THE COURT: I THINK THE QUESTION BEING -- WHY  
6 DON'T YOU IDENTIFY THE QUESTION THAT YOU'RE OBJECTING TO.  
7 MAYBE WE CAN GET A CONTINUING LINE OF OBJECTION.  
8 MR. ESCHER: IT'S THE QUESTION RELATING TO HIS  
9 OPINION AS TO HOW CONSUMERS WOULD HAVE INTERPRETED OR WHAT  
10 IMPRESSION THEY WOULD HAVE HAD FROM THE AD.  
11 THE COURT: IS THERE ANY OBJECTION TO MY GIVING  
12 A CONTINUING LINE OF OBJECTION?  
13 MS. CHABER: NO, YOUR HONOR.  
14 THE COURT: OKAY.  
15 MR. ESCHER: THANK YOU.  
16 THE COURT: THEN YOU HAVE THOSE CONTINUING LINES  
17 OF OBJECTIONS.  
18 MR. BARRON: JUST FOR CLARITY'S SAKE, I BELIEVE  
19 THE OBJECTION THAT HE WAS MAKING, AS I UNDERSTOOD IT, WAS  
20 LACK OF FOUNDATION, AND WHAT ELSE WAS DISCUSSED, WHICH IS  
21 EVIDENCE CODE SECTION 8014.  
22 THE COURT: UNDERSTOOD.  
23 1884 IS RECEIVED.

24 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
25 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
26 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
27 EXHIBIT # 1884)

28 MS. CHABER: Q. DOCTOR, WHO IS ADVERTISING

2099

1 CHESTERFIELD IN THIS ADVERTISEMENT?  
2 A. A BASEBALL STAR BY THE NAME OF JACKIE ROBINSON.  
3 Q. AND WAS JACKIE ROBINSON A FAMOUS BASEBALL STAR?  
4 A. YES, HE WAS VERY FAMOUS. NOT ONLY WAS HE THE  
5 MOST VALUABLE PLAYER, HE WAS THE ONE THAT BROKE THE COLOR  
6 BAR INTO BASEBALL, BEING THE FIRST IDENTIFIED AS NEGRO  
7 ADMITTED INTO PROFESSIONAL SPORTS.  
8 Q. IT HAS HIM QUOTED IN THE AD AS WELL AS DISPLAYING  
9 HIM: "TAKE MY TIP. SMOKE CHESTERFIELD. MUCH Milder"?  
10 A. IT DOES.

11 Q. AND WHAT WOULD THE CONSUMER AT THAT TIME PERCEIVE  
12 THIS AD -- OR HOW WOULD THE CONSUMER AT THE TIME PERCEIVE  
13 THIS AD?

14 A. THAT SMOKING WAS COMPATIBLE WITH BEING A  
15 PROFESSIONAL ATHLETE, SO IT WAS COMPARABLE WITH BEING AN  
16 EVERYDAY CITIZEN.

17 Q. WHAT IS THE NEXT EXHIBIT IN POINT OF TIME?

18 A. 1873.

19 Q. AND WHAT IS THE TIME FRAME?

20 A. I BELIEVE THIS IS 1956.

21 Q. AND IS THIS AN ADVERTISEMENT THAT WOULD HAVE  
22 APPEARED IN A COMMERCIAL PUBLICATION -- I MEAN CONSUMER  
23 PUBLICATION?

24 A. YES, IT IS.

25 MS. CHABER: I'D MOVE 1873 INTO EVIDENCE, AND  
26 DISPLAY.

27 THE COURT: IT'S RECEIVED.

28 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY

2100

1 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
2 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
3 EXHIBIT # 1873)

4 MS. CHABER: Q. NOW, A LOT OF THINGS ARE  
5 HAPPENING HERE.

6 FIRST OF ALL, WHO ARE THE CELEBRITIES, THE SPORTS  
7 FIGURES THAT ARE DISPLAYED?

8 A. THERE'S ONLY ONE CELEBRITY DISPLAYED THAT'S BOTH  
9 IN UNIFORM AND PLAYING, AND ALSO SHOWN OUT OF UNIFORM AND  
10 SMOKING, AND THAT WAS NORM VAN BROCKLIN OF THE LOS ANGELES  
11 RAMS.

12 Q. AND BY BEING THE LOS ANGELES RAMS, WE KNOW IT'S  
13 CERTAINLY NOT CURRENT.

14 A. THAT'S CORRECT.

15 Q. AND WAS HE A FAMOUS FOOTBALL PLAYER?

16 A. HE WAS VERY FAMOUS.

17 Q. AND WITHOUT GOING ON TO THE OTHER PARTS OF THIS  
18 AD, JUST THE BASIS OF THE SHOWING HIM BOTH KICKING THE  
19 FOOTBALL AND THEN IN CIVILIAN CLOTHES SMOKING, WHAT WOULD  
20 THE CONSUMER -- HOW WOULD THE CONSUMER PERCEIVE THIS AD AT  
21 THE TIME?

22 A. WELL, LIKE PREVIOUS ADS, IT WOULD INDICATE THAT  
23 IF SMOKING WAS APPROPRIATE, AN ACTIVITY COMPATIBLE WITH  
24 BEING A PROFESSIONAL ATHLETE, IT WAS PROBABLY COMPATIBLE  
25 WITH BEING AN AVERAGE CITIZEN.

26 I THINK THERE'S MORE GOING ON IN THIS AD THAN IN  
27 THE PREVIOUS EXAMPLES WE SAW.

28 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT DO YOU MEAN BY THAT?

2101

1 A. WELL, THE ILLUSTRATION ON THE RIGHT-HAND PICTURE  
2 WITH THE KIND OF CUTAWAY CHART, AND THE REFERENCE TO "20,000  
3 FILTERS" UP THERE, AND THEN SIMILAR ILLUSTRATIONS ALONG THE  
4 BOTTOM, COMPARING THE VICEROY ADVERTISED BRAND TO UNNAMED  
5 BRANDS B AND C AND SIMILAR CUTAWAYS, PRESENTS A KIND OF  
6 SCIENTIFIC -- APPARENTLY SCIENTIFIC DEMONSTRATION OF THE  
7 FILTER'S SUPERIORITY.

8 THIS WAS A TIME WHEN FILTERS WERE FAIRLY NEW IN  
9 THE MARKETPLACE AND WERE BEING SOLD TO THE PUBLIC AS A  
10 TECHNOLOGICAL SOLUTION TO THE HEALTH CONCERNS.

11 Q. AND WHEN YOU SAY "TECHNOLOGICAL SOLUTION TO THE  
12 HEALTH CONCERNS," WHAT HEALTH CONCERNS?

13 A. WELL, THE EARLY 1950S, 1953, IN PARTICULAR '52  
14 AND '53, THERE HAD BEEN SOME OF THE EARLY STUDIES OF MEDICAL  
15 RESEARCH THAT STARTED TO LEAK INTO THE POPULAR PRESS,

16 PARTICULARLY THROUGH READER'S DIGEST, CREATING WHAT THE  
17 INDUSTRY CALLED A HEALTH SCARE.  
18 AND SO TO PROVIDE REASSURANCE, FILTERS WERE  
19 INTRODUCED. I MEAN, THAT WAS JUST ONE OF SEVERAL  
20 STRATEGIES, BUT THE INTRODUCTION OF FILTERS WAS PART OF THE  
21 OVERALL STRATEGY OF RESPONSE.  
22 Q. AND WAS THIS WHAT'S COME TO BE KNOWN AS A FRANK  
23 STATEMENT TO CIGARETTE SMOKERS, PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 363  
24 (INDICATING), WAS THAT ALSO A RESPONSE BY THE TOBACCO  
25 COMPANIES TO THE HEALTH SCARE OF THE EARLY 1950S?  
26 MR. BARRON: EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR. I THINK YOU  
27 RULED ON THAT KIND OF A QUESTION.  
28 THE COURT: I HAVE. SUSTAINED.  
2102  
1 MS. CHABER: Q. WAS THE FRANK STATEMENT TO  
2 CIGARETTE SMOKERS AN ADVERTISEMENT?  
3 A. YES.  
4 Q. AND APPROXIMATELY HOW MANY -- FIRST OF ALL, WHAT  
5 DID IT APPEAR IN, WHAT MEDIUM?  
6 A. NEWSPAPERS, FULL-PAGE ADS, TYPICALLY FULL-PAGE,  
7 IN MAJOR METROPOLITAN DAILIES, NEWSPAPERS ACROSS THE NATION.  
8 Q. DO YOU KNOW APPROXIMATELY HOW MANY CITIES OR HOW  
9 MANY PAPERS?  
10 A. I'M NOT SURE OF THE CITIES. I THINK IT WAS 454  
11 PAPERS, SOMETHING LIKE THAT. JUST SHY OF 500 PAPERS.  
12 Q. AND DO YOU KNOW HOW MUCH WAS SPENT ON THE  
13 ADVERTISING BUDGET FOR THE FRANK STATEMENT?  
14 A. YES. \$250,000, A QUARTER OF A MILLION DOLLARS,  
15 IN ESSENTIALLY 24 HOURS.  
16 I MEAN, ALL OF THE ADS APPEARED IN A DAY OR SO.  
17 Q. AND THAT WAS IN JANUARY OF 1954?  
18 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
19 Q. AND IN 19 -- WELL, I GUESS I CAN'T SAY 1999  
20 DOLLARS ANYMORE. IN 2000 DOLLARS, CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA  
21 OF WHAT WOULD BE COMPARABLE?  
22 MR. BARRON: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. LACK OF  
23 FOUNDATION.  
24 THE COURT: YOU MEAN IN TERMS OF DOLLARS?  
25 MS. CHABER: IN TERMS OF DOLLARS OR IN TERMS OF  
26 ADVERTISING.  
27 Q. WHAT WOULD BE THE EQUIVALENT IN TERMS OF AN  
28 ADVERTISING BUDGET?  
2103  
1 THE COURT: SUSTAINED.  
2 MS. CHABER: Q. WHAT COULD YOU BUY FOR \$250,000  
3 IN CURRENT TIMES?  
4 THE COURT: TODAY?  
5 MS. CHABER: ACTUALLY, I ASKED THAT BACKWARDS.  
6 THE COURT: HOW WOULD YOU ASK IT IF YOU WERE TO  
7 ASK IT FORWARD?  
8 MS. CHABER: WELL, IT DEPENDS WHERE YOU'RE  
9 STANDING WHETHER IT'S FORWARD OR BACKWARDS.  
10 I THINK SOMEBODY SAID THAT IN "ALICE IN  
11 WONDERLAND."  
12 Q. DOCTOR, TODAY, AN AD, FOR EXAMPLE, A TWO OR  
13 THREE-MINUTE AD -- OR SECOND AD ON THE SUPERBOWL,  
14 APPROXIMATELY HOW MUCH WOULD THAT COST?  
15 MR. BARRON: OBJECTION. RELEVANCY.  
16 THE COURT: SUSTAINED.  
17 MS. CHABER: Q. IN 1994, WAS THERE A LOT OF  
18 MONEY TO SPEND ON ADVERTISING?  
19 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. I THINK YOU MISSPOKE.  
20 YOU SAID "1994."

21 MS. CHABER: EXCUSE ME. YOU'RE CORRECT.  
22 THANK YOU, MR. ESCHER.  
23 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. VAGUE, WITH THAT  
24 CORRECTION.  
25 MS. CHABER: IN 1954.  
26 THE COURT: IT IS VAGUE.  
27 YOU NEED TO REWORD IT. YOU NEED TO DO MORE THAN  
28 CHANGE THE DATE.  
2104  
1 MS. CHABER: Q. IN 1954, \$250,000 FOR A  
2 24-HOUR ADVERTISING CAMPAIGN, HOW WOULD YOU RATE THAT IN  
3 TERMS OF BUYING; HIGH, LOW, MEDIUM?  
4 A. IT WAS AWESOME, AN UNPRECEDENTED AMOUNT OF MONEY  
5 TO SPEND ON ADVOCACY ADVERTISEMENTS LIKE THAT.  
6 Q. WHAT'S THE NEXT ADVERTISEMENT THAT YOU HAVE WITH  
7 A CELEBRITY ENDORSEMENT BY TIME?  
8 A. 1867.  
9 Q. AND APPROXIMATELY WHAT YEAR IS THAT?  
10 A. 1961.  
11 Q. DO YOU KNOW WHERE THIS AD APPEARED, OR WHAT TYPE  
12 OF MEDIUM?  
13 A. I DO. THIS APPEARED IN LIFE MAGAZINE.  
14 MS. CHABER: OKAY. AND I'D MOVE IT IN EVIDENCE  
15 AND DISPLAY IT TO THE JURY.  
16 THE COURT: 1867?  
17 MS. CHABER: YES.  
18 THE COURT: OKAY. 1867 IS RECEIVED.  
19 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
20 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
21 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
22 EXHIBIT # 1867)  
23 MS. CHABER: Q. 1961, IS WHAT YOU SAID?  
24 A. 1961.  
25 Q. THIS IS A MARLBORO ADVERTISEMENT?  
26 A. YES, IT IS, BEFORE THE DAYS OF THE COWBOY  
27 CAMPAIGN.  
28 Q. AND WHO IS ADVERTISING -- I REALIZE IT'S NOT THE  
2105  
1 BEST COPY -- WHO IS ADVERTISING THE MARLBORO IN THIS AD?  
2 A. A PROFESSIONAL BASEBALL STAR BY THE NAME OF  
3 MINNIE MINOSO. MINNIE, BECAUSE HE WAS QUITE SHORT.  
4 Q. AND WAS HE FAMOUS IN HIS TIME?  
5 A. HE WAS AN ALL-STAR PLAYER.  
6 Q. AND IN 1961, WHAT WOULD THE -- HOW WOULD THE  
7 CONSUMER PERCEIVE THIS ADVERTISEMENT?  
8 A. THAT SMOKING WAS OKAY WITH BEING A PROFESSIONAL  
9 ATHLETE.  
10 Q. WHAT'S THE NEXT ONE IN TIME?  
11 A. 1871.  
12 Q. OKAY. AND WHAT YEAR IS THAT?  
13 A. 1962.  
14 Q. AND DID THIS APPEAR -- DO YOU KNOW WHERE THIS  
15 APPEARED?  
16 A. I BELIEVE THIS WAS ALSO LIFE MAGAZINE.  
17 MS. CHABER: I MOVE IT INTO EVIDENCE AND TO SHOW  
18 IT.  
19 THE COURT: 1871 IS RECEIVED.  
20 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
21 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
22 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
23 EXHIBIT # 1871)  
24 MS. CHABER: Q. NOT THE BEST PICTURE, BUT  
25 THAT'S MICKEY MANTLE?



26 A. IT IS.  
27 Q. AND HE WAS A NEW YORK YANKEE?  
28 A. HE WAS.  
2106  
1 Q. AND A FAMOUS ONE?  
2 A. FAMOUS, PARTICULARLY FOR HIS HOME RUN HITTING.  
3 Q. OKAY. AND IN THIS TIME PERIOD, HE WAS ACTUALLY  
4 AN ATHLETE AND PLAYING SPORTS AT THE TIME OF THIS AD?  
5 A. HE WAS. HE WAS AN ACTIVE ATHLETE, YES.  
6 Q. HE'S HOLDING A VICEROY CIGARETTE?  
7 A. HE IS.  
8 Q. AND WHAT WOULD THE CONSUMER -- HOW WOULD THE  
9 CONSUMER PERCEIVE THIS AD AT THE TIME?  
10 A. THAT IF A PROFESSIONAL ATHLETE CAN SMOKE, SO CAN  
11 EVERYBODY.  
12 Q. WHAT'S THE NEXT ONE IN TIME?  
13 A. THE NEXT ONE I HAVE IS -- LET ME SEE -- 1872.  
14 Q. OKAY. WHAT YEAR IS THAT?  
15 A. SAME YEAR, 1962.  
16 Q. AND IN 1962, DO YOU KNOW WHERE THIS APPEARED?  
17 A. I BELIEVE IT'S FROM LIFE MAGAZINE. I DON'T HAVE  
18 CERTAIN RECALL ON THAT.  
19 IT'S CERTAINLY FROM A CONSUMER MAGAZINE, A MASS  
20 CIRCULATION CONSUMER MAGAZINE.  
21 Q. AGAIN, THIS WOULDN'T BE AN ADVERTISEMENT THAT  
22 WOULD BE THE TYPE THAT WOULD APPEAR IN TRADE JOURNALS?  
23 A. NO, IT WAS NOT A TRADE AD.  
24 MS. CHABER: I'D MOVE IT INTO EVIDENCE.  
25 THE COURT: 1872 IS RECEIVED.  
26 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
27 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
28 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
2107  
1 EXHIBIT # 1872)  
2 MS. CHABER: SHOW IT TO THE JURY?  
3 THE COURT: YES.  
4 MS. CHABER: Q. NOW, AT THE TOP, IT'S VERY  
5 HARD TO READ, BUT THERE'S A PICTURE OF THE HANDS, AND I TAKE  
6 IT HE'S HOLDING A BAT IN HIS HANDS?  
7 A. YES.  
8 Q. CAN YOU READ WHAT IT SAYS?  
9 A. NO. MY COPY IS EVEN MORE WASHED OUT THAN THAT.  
10 Q. I THINK WHAT IT SAYS IS -- I'M SURE COUNSEL WILL  
11 TELL ME IF I'M WRONG -- BUT IT SAYS "REACHING FOR THE RECORD  
12 BOOK"?  
13 A. YES. HE AND MICKEY MANTLE WERE IN COMPETITION  
14 FOR HOME RUN HITTING.  
15 Q. AND HE ALSO WAS A NEW YORK YANKEE?  
16 A. YES.  
17 Q. AND AGAIN, HE'S GOT AN ACTIVELY LIT CIGARETTE IN  
18 HIS HAND?  
19 A. HE DOES.  
20 Q. YOU CAN SEE SMOKE COMING OFF THE CIGARETTE?  
21 A. YOU CAN.  
22 Q. AND IS THAT CHARACTERISTIC OF THE TIME?  
23 A. YES, IT IS, ALTHOUGH NOT SINCE. YOU DON'T SEE  
24 SMOKING CIGARETTES IN CIGARETTE ADVERTISING NOW.  
25 Q. AND IT'S A CAMEL ADVERTISEMENT?  
26 A. YES.  
27 Q. AND THERE'S A COMMENT ABOUT "SMOKING MORE NOW BUT  
28 ENJOYING IT LESS? CHANGE TO CAMEL"?  
2108  
1 A. YES.

2 Q. WHAT WOULD THE -- HOW WOULD THE CONSUMER PERCEIVE  
3 THIS ADVERTISEMENT?  
4 A. WELL, THE DOMINANT MESSAGE WOULD BE THAT IF A  
5 PROFESSIONAL ATHLETE WHO IS FAMOUS, DEPENDED UPON HIS  
6 PERFORMANCE AS AN ATHLETE, AND HIS INCOME, WAS SMOKING, THAT  
7 IT WOULD BE OKAY FOR ANY INDIVIDUAL TO SMOKE.  
8 Q. IS THERE A SUBTEXT?  
9 A. WELL, THERE IS A CONTEXT, LET'S SAY; THAT IS, THE  
10 "SMOKING MORE NOW BUT ENJOYING IT LESS," AT THIS POINT OF  
11 HISTORY, A LOT OF PEOPLE HAD SWITCHED TO FILTERED CIGARETTES  
12 AND WERE -- HAD INCREASED THE AMOUNT THEY WERE SMOKING AND  
13 WERE STILL FINDING IT UNSATISFYING.  
14 SO I THINK THERE'S REALLY AN INTENT HERE --  
15 MR. BARRON: YOUR HONOR --  
16 THE COURT: NO TESTIMONY, PLEASE, ABOUT THE  
17 INTENT.  
18 THE WITNESS: OKAY. I THINK --  
19 MS. CHABER: Q. WHAT WOULD THE PERCEPTION BE?  
20 A. CONSUMERS WHO WERE SMOKING MORE NOW AND ENJOYING  
21 IT LESS MIGHT FIND ENCOURAGING -- MIGHT FIND THIS AD  
22 ENCOURAGING TO REVERT TO SMOKING CAMELS.  
23 Q. AND THAT LEAVES US 1886?  
24 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
25 Q. AND WHAT TIME PERIOD IS THAT?  
26 A. IT'S THE SAME TIME PERIOD, 1962.  
27 Q. AND THIS IS TWO YEARS BEFORE THE FIRST SURGEON  
28 GENERAL'S REPORT ON THE HEALTH CONSEQUENCES OF SMOKING?  
2109  
1 A. IT IS.  
2 THE COURT: HOLD IT.  
3 MS. CHABER: I'M SORRY.  
4 Q. AND WHERE DID THIS AD APPEAR, IF YOU KNOW?  
5 A. LIFE MAGAZINE.  
6 MS. CHABER: OKAY. AND I WOULD OFFER 1886 INTO  
7 EVIDENCE.  
8 THE COURT: IT'S RECEIVED.  
9 MS. CHABER: AND I'LL SHOW IT TO JURY.  
10 (DOCUMENT MORE PARTICULARLY  
11 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
12 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
13 EXHIBIT # 1886)  
14 MS. CHABER: Q. AND WE HAVE: "GET LUCKY. THE  
15 TASTE TO START WITH, THE TASTE TO STAY WITH."  
16 WHO IS THAT THAT IS ADVERTISING LUCKY STRIKE  
17 CIGARETTES?  
18 A. KATHY LEE GIFFORD'S HUSBAND, FRANK.  
19 Q. HE WAS NOT MARRIED TO HER AT THE TIME?  
20 A. NOT AT THE TIME. IN FACT, THERE'S A TELEVISION  
21 AD IN THIS SAME CAMPAIGN WHERE HE HAS A DIFFERENT WIFE.  
22 Q. AND HE WAS THEN AN ATHLETE WHO WAS ACTUALLY  
23 PERFORMING SPORTS?  
24 A. YES.  
25 Q. AND AGAIN, HE'S SHOWN, BOTH IN ACTION AND IN  
26 LIFE, CIVILIAN CLOTHES, SHALL WE SAY?  
27 A. NOT JUST IN CIVILIAN CLOTHES AS A SPOKESPERSON,  
28 BUT WITH A CIGARETTE; THAT IS, IN THE ACT OF ACTIVE SMOKING.  
2110  
1 Q. AGAIN, WOULD THE MESSAGE THAT THE CONSUMER WOULD  
2 COME AWAY FROM THIS AD WITH BE SIMILAR TO WHAT YOU'VE  
3 DESCRIBED FOR THE OTHERS?  
4 A. YES.  
5 Q. NOW, DURING THIS SAME TIME PERIOD, DR. POLLAY,  
6 WAS THE MEDIUM OF TELEVISION BECOMING MORE AND MORE POPULAR

7 IN THE 1950S AND 1960S?  
8 A. YES.  
9 Q. AND WAS THERE ADVERTISING FOR CIGARETTES ON  
10 TELEVISION?  
11 A. THERE WAS A VERY LARGE AMOUNT OF IT. IN FACT,  
12 THAT WAS ABOUT 10 PERCENT OVERALL OF THE INCOME FOR  
13 TELEVISION NETWORKS.  
14 Q. AND, YOU KNOW, TODAY, WE CAN GET -- I DON'T  
15 KNOW -- 122 CHANNELS BY SATELLITE OR WHATEVER.  
16 HOW MANY CHANNELS WERE AVAILABLE TO THE CONSUMER  
17 BACK IN THE -- LET'S JUST TALK ABOUT THE LATE 1950S, EARLY  
18 1960S?  
19 A. THERE WERE THREE NATIONAL NETWORKS.  
20 Q. AND THOSE WERE?  
21 A. ABC -- THEY STILL SURVIVE -- ABC, CBS AND NBC.  
22 Q. OKAY. AND IT WAS BEFORE REMOTE CONTROLS; RIGHT?  
23 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
24 Q. HAVE YOU LOOKED AT TV ADVERTISING FOR CIGARETTES  
25 TO LOOK AT THE QUANTITY OF IT?  
26 A. YES, I HAVE.  
27 Q. HAVE YOU LOOKED AT TV ADVERTISING FOR CIGARETTES  
28 TO LOOK AT THE TIME FRAMES THAT IT APPEARED IN?  
2111  
1 A. YES, I HAVE.  
2 Q. AND THE PROGRAMS THAT ADVERTISED?  
3 A. YES.  
4 Q. AND HAVE YOU LOOKED AT IT FOR ANY PARTICULAR YEAR  
5 THAT WOULD ILLUSTRATE YOUR TESTIMONY WITH RESPECT TO WHAT  
6 THE AVERAGE CONSUMER COULD SEE IF THEY HAD THEIR TELEVISION  
7 ON IN THE EVENING?  
8 A. YES, I HAVE, IN SOME DETAIL.  
9 Q. AND WHAT YEAR?  
10 A. FOR 1963.  
11 MS. CHABER: OKAY. AND COUNSEL, ANY OBJECTION  
12 TO ME USING THIS --  
13 THE REPORTER: PLEASE REPEAT THAT.  
14 MR. ESCHER: NO, BUT YOU NEED TO SAY YOUR LAST  
15 STATEMENT. THE COURT REPORTER DIDN'T GET IT.  
16 MS. CHABER: I WAS ASKING YOU OFF THE RECORD  
17 FIRST.  
18 MR. ESCHER: OKAY.  
19 MR. BARRON: YOUR HONOR, WHILE SHE IS DOING  
20 THAT, WE WOULD PROBABLY JUST NOTE FOR THE RECORD THAT, AS TO  
21 THIS PARTICULAR EXHIBIT, THE YEAR 1963, WE WOULD OBJECT ON  
22 RELEVANCE AND 352.  
23 THE COURT: IF YOU ARE GOING TO DO THAT, I NEED  
24 TO LOOK AT THE DOCUMENT.  
25 LET ME GIVE THE JURY THE AFTERNOON RECESS. I'M  
26 GOING TO HAVE TO LET YOU GO AT 4:30 TODAY, BECAUSE I HAVE  
27 ANOTHER MATTER ON THE CALENDAR ANYWAY.  
28 SO LET'S TAKE A 20-MINUTE RECESS NOW UNTIL 3:30.  
2112  
1 THEN WE'LL COME BACK FOR ONE MORE HOUR.  
2 PLEASE CONTINUE TO FOLLOW THE ADMONITION. WE'LL  
3 SEE YOU BACK AT 3:30.  
4 (RECESS TAKEN FROM 3:10 TO 3:30 P.M.)  
5 THE COURT: OKAY. WHERE DO WE STAND?  
6 MR. BARRON: WELL, YOUR HONOR, IN LIGHT OF OUR  
7 MEETING AND REPRESENTATIONS ABOUT MS. WHITELEY'S TELEVISION  
8 WATCHING IN CERTAIN YEARS, I WOULD WITHDRAW MY OBJECTION TO  
9 THIS CHART FOR 1963.  
10 THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. AND I'LL ALLOW IT TO BE  
11 WITHDRAWN SUBJECT TO A MOTION TO STRIKE, DEPENDING ON

12 WHETHER WE HEAR SUCH TESTIMONY AS HAS BEEN REPRESENTED OR  
13 NOT.

14 MS. CHABER: FOR THE RECORD, THE CHART THAT WE  
15 ARE TALKING ABOUT IS 1902, AND THE BLOWUP IS 1902-A.  
16 AND I THINK I GAVE THE COURT A COPY.

17 THE COURT: YES.

18 MS. CHABER: Q. AND WE'LL GET TO THAT IN A  
19 MOMENT. I JUST WANT TO ASK YOU ABOUT ANOTHER CATEGORY OF  
20 ADS.

21 IS THERE A CATEGORY OF ADS THAT YOU WOULD CALL  
22 HEALTH ADS?

23 A. YES.

24 Q. AND CAN YOU TELL US WHICH EXHIBIT NUMBERS THAT WE  
25 HAVE AS EXAMPLES -- FIRST OF ALL, STRIKE THAT FOR A SECOND.  
26 ACTUALLY, NOT STRIKE IT, BUT LET ME JUST JUMP  
27 BACK FOR A SECOND.

28 THE CELEBRITY SPORTS ADS THAT WE LOOKED AT, ARE  
2113

1 THOSE REPRESENTATIVE OF ADS DURING THE TIME PERIODS YOU  
2 IDENTIFIED OR ARE THOSE LIKE EXCEPTIONAL ADS?

3 A. NO, THERE ARE MANY OTHERS LIKE THOSE; THAT IS, IT  
4 WAS COMMON TO USE SPORTS CELEBRITIES.

5 BUT I WOULD ADMIT THAT THERE WERE OTHER NONSPORT  
6 CELEBRITIES USED AS WELL.

7 Q. MOVIE STARS?

8 A. MOVIE STARS PARTICULARLY, YES.

9 Q. NOW, JUMPING BACK TO WHERE I WAS ON THESE HEALTH  
10 ADS.

11 WOULD YOU IDENTIFY THE NUMBERS OF THE EXHIBITS  
12 THAT WE'VE PICKED AS HEALTH ADS.

13 A. YES. 1874, 1875, 1876, 1878, AND 1880 ARE THE  
14 ONES I HAVE IN FRONT OF ME.

15 Q. OKAY. AND WERE ALL OF THOSE ADS, THE NUMBERS  
16 THAT WE JUST IDENTIFIED, WERE THOSE ALL PRIOR TO 1969?

17 A. THEY WERE.

18 Q. OKAY. AND WERE THESE ALL ADS THAT APPEARED IN  
19 COMMERCIAL PUBLICATIONS; THAT IS, PUBLICATIONS INTENDED FOR  
20 A CONSUMER AUDIENCE?

21 A. THEY WERE.

22 MS. CHABER: 1874 IS ALREADY IN EVIDENCE.  
23 I WOULD MOVE 1875 IN EVIDENCE, 1876, 1878 AND  
24 1880.

25 AND WHEN WE DISPLAY THEM, TO THE EXTENT WE CAN,  
26 WE'LL POINT OUT THE YEARS.

27 THE COURT: OKAY. THE STANDING OBJECTION  
28 APPLIES.  
2114

1 AND THE COURT OVERRULES THAT, AND RECEIVES 1875,  
2 1876, 1878 AND 1880.

3 (DOCUMENTS MORE PARTICULARLY  
4 LISTED IN THE INDEX RECEIVED  
5 IN EVIDENCE AS PLAINTIFFS'  
6 EXHIBIT #S 1875-1876, 1878 & 1880)

7 MS. CHABER: Q. IF WE COULD HAVE THE LIGHTS,  
8 PLEASE.

9 1874 IN EVIDENCE, PREVIOUSLY MARKED, CAN YOU --  
10 WHAT IS THIS AN AD FOR?

11 A. IT'S AN AD FOR CAMEL CIGARETTES.

12 Q. AND DO YOU KNOW THE APPROXIMATE TIME PERIOD OF  
13 THIS AD?

14 A. I CAN ONLY APPROXIMATE IT, BECAUSE THIS CAMPAIGN  
15 RAN FOR SEVERAL YEARS. SO IT'S FROM THE PERIOD 1946 TO  
16 ABOUT 1950, '51.

17 Q. OKAY. AND THE STATEMENT: "ACCORDING TO A RECENT  
18 NATIONWIDE SURVEY, MORE DOCTORS SMOKE CAMELS THAN ANY OTHER  
19 CIGARETTE"; DO YOU KNOW HOW THAT WAS VERIFIED?

20 A. I KNOW FROM SOME OF THE DOCUMENTS IN THE HILL &  
21 KNOWLTON PAPERS WHAT THEY THOUGHT HAD BEEN THE PROCEDURE FOR  
22 GENERATING THAT DATA.

23 Q. AND WE ARE GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE HILL &  
24 KNOWLTON PAPERS LATER.

25 BUT JUST BRIEFLY, WHO WERE HILL & KNOWLTON, OR  
26 WHAT WAS HILL & KNOWLTON?

27 A. WELL, IT'S STILL HILL & KNOWLTON.

28 Q. IT STILL IS.

2115

1 A. A PUBLIC RELATIONS FIRM, A VERY MAJOR PUBLIC  
2 RELATIONS FIRM, AT THE TIME, THE LARGEST IN THE WORLD.

3 Q. AND WAS THAT A PUBLIC RELATIONS FIRM THAT WAS  
4 HIRED BY THE CIGARETTE COMPANIES?

5 A. YES. THEY WERE THE ONES RESPONSIBLE FOR THE  
6 FRANK STATEMENT DEPLOYMENT.

7 Q. AND WITH RESPECT TO HOW THIS WAS VERIFIED, THAT  
8 "MORE DOCTORS SMOKE CAMELS THAN ANY OTHER CIGARETTE," HOW  
9 WAS IT?

10 A. THEY BELIEVED IT WAS BASED UPON A SURVEY DONE AT  
11 A MEDICAL CONVENTION, ASKING DOCTORS AT THE END OF THE  
12 CONVENTION WHAT PACKS OF CIGARETTES THEY HAD IN THEIR  
13 POCKET.

14 Q. AND PRESUMABLY, THE DOCTORS THAT HAD CIGARETTES  
15 IN THEIR POCKETS WERE SMOKERS?

16 A. YES.

17 Q. DURING THIS TIME PERIOD WHEN THIS AD RAN, WAS  
18 THAT A TIME PERIOD THAT DOCTORS WERE SMOKING?

19 A. YES, DEFINITELY.

20 Q. AND IS THE 1950'S A TIME PERIOD WHEN DOCTORS WERE  
21 SMOKING?

22 A. YES.

23 MR. ESCHER: Q. OBJECTION. VAGUE, YOUR  
24 HONOR. SOME DOCTORS?

25 THE COURT: YES, IT'S VAGUE AS TO WHETHER YOU  
26 MEAN SOME DOCTORS, ALL DOCTORS OR MANY OR FEW.

27 I'LL SUSTAIN, AND STRIKE THE ANSWER.

28 MS. CHABER: OKAY.

2116

1 Q. CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA, THE APPROXIMATE  
2 DESCRIPTION OF THE NUMBERS OF DOCTORS THAT WERE SMOKING IN  
3 THE 1950S?

4 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. LACK OF FOUNDATION,  
5 YOUR HONOR.

6 THE COURT: SUSTAINED. I DON'T KNOW WHETHER  
7 THIS WITNESS HAS A FOUNDATION FOR THAT. IT HASN'T BEEN  
8 SHOWN YET.

9 MS. CHABER: Q. DR. POLLAY, HAVE YOU LOOKED AT  
10 THE ISSUE OF WHO -- WHAT GROUPS OF PEOPLE WERE SMOKING  
11 CIGARETTES AT WHAT POINTS IN TIME?

12 A. YES.

13 Q. IS THAT PART OF THE WORK AND THE RESEARCH AND THE  
14 STUDY THAT YOU HAVE DONE OVER THE YEARS?

15 A. YES.

16 Q. AND DID YOU LOOK AT THE ISSUE OF WHETHER AND WHEN  
17 DOCTORS WERE A GROUP THAT WAS MORE THAN INFREQUENT OR  
18 OCCASIONALLY SMOKERS?

19 A. YES.

20 Q. AND CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA WHAT THE TIME FRAME  
21 WAS WHEN DOCTORS WERE MORE THAN AN OCCASIONAL DOCTOR

22 SMOKING?  
23 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. VAGUE, YOUR HONOR.  
24 THE COURT: YES. "MORE THAN AN OCCASIONAL  
25 DOCTOR."  
26 SUSTAINED.  
27 MS. CHABER: Q. CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA OF  
28 WHETHER THERE WAS A POINT IN TIME THE MAJORITY OF DOCTORS  
2117 WERE SMOKING?  
1 A. YES, I CAN.  
2 Q. AND WHAT TIME FRAME WOULD THAT BE?  
3 A. THROUGHOUT THE '40S AND '50S, AND INTO THE EARLY  
4 '60S.  
5 Q. AND IN FACT, ONE OF THE BIGGEST STUDIES THAT WAS  
6 DONE IN ENGLAND IN THE EARLY 1950S WAS THE BRITISH DOCTOR  
7 STUDY?  
8 A. THAT'S CORRECT. THE DOCTORS WERE THE SUBJECTS OF  
9 THE STUDY.  
10 Q. AND THESE WERE SMOKING DOCTORS?  
11 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
12 Q. AND THIS AD, 1874, GOES AND IDENTIFIES EVERY  
13 DOCTOR IN PRIVATE PRACTICE WAS ASKED, AND IDENTIFIED FAMILY  
14 PHYSICIANS, SURGEONS, SPECIALISTS, DOCTORS IN EVERY BRANCH  
15 OF MEDICINE.  
16 IS THIS WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT IN TERMS OF THE  
17 DOCTORS AS A CATEGORY SMOKING?  
18 A. YES.  
19 Q. OKAY. AND WE TALKED BEFORE ABOUT EXPLICIT  
20 CONTENT AND IMPLICIT CONTENT.  
21 WHAT DOES THIS AD HAVE?  
22 A. WELL, THAT'S A SPECTRUM OF -- IN MY VIEW, THIS IS  
23 A FAIRLY EXPLICIT AD; THAT IS, THE FACT OF DOCTORS SMOKING  
24 IS ESSENTIALLY A HEALTH PREMISE. THAT IS, IF DOCTORS ARE  
25 SMOKING, PRESUMABLY DOCTORS DON'T DO THINGS THAT ARE  
26 DESTRUCTIVE OF THEIR OWN HEALTH.  
27 Q. AND IN FACT, THE PICTURES ARE ACTUALLY SHOWING  
28 DOCTORS IN THE COURSE OF TREATING PATIENTS?  
2118 1 DOCTORS IN THE COURSE OF TREATING PATIENTS?  
2 A. YES. SMOKING WHILE PRACTICING.  
3 Q. AND WHILE DOING SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH WITH A  
4 MICROSCOPE SHOWING?  
5 A. YES.  
6 Q. AND I GUESS THIS GUY IS LOOKING AT A THERMOMETER  
7 IS WHAT IT KIND OF LOOKS LIKE?  
8 A. YES. I DON'T HAVE AN EXAMPLE. I'M HAVING TO  
9 READ IT OFF THE SCREEN.  
10 BUT YES, IT SEEMS TO BE SOMETHING LIKE THAT.  
11 Q. AND THIS IS AN R.J. REYNOLDS AD?  
12 A. IT IS.  
13 Q. AND THERE'S A LOT OF TEXT AS WELL IN THIS AD.  
14 CAN YOU JUST ORIENT US?  
15 WHEN A CONSUMER SEES AN ADD LIKE THIS, ARE THERE  
16 CERTAIN PLACES THAT PEOPLE TEND TO LOOK FIRST, OR HOW DOES  
17 THAT WORK, BECAUSE THERE'S A LOT GOING ON HERE?  
18 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. VAGUE. LACK OF  
19 FOUNDATION, YOUR HONOR.  
20 THE COURT: OVERRULED.  
21 THE WITNESS: YES. IN ADVERTISING LAYOUT, THERE  
22 ARE VARIOUS PRINCIPLES ABOUT THE OPTICAL CENTER OF THE AD,  
23 WHICH IS ACTUALLY ABOVE THE LITERAL CENTER OF THE AD.  
24 THE SIZE OF THE TYPE WOULD DETERMINE WHAT ARE THE  
25 HEADLINES VERSUS WHAT ARE THE SUBHEADS OR THE BODY COPY;  
26 THAT IS, THE FINE PRINT.

27 AND WE KNOW THAT MOST OF THE FINE PRINT IS NOT  
28 READ BY THE AVERAGE CONSUMER; THAT IS, MOST CONSUMERS READ  
2119  
1 AN AD BY LOOKING AT THE HEADLINE AND TAKING IN THE IMAGE AND  
2 NOT MUCH MORE.  
3 SO THAT IT'S ONLY MAYBE 10 PERCENT OF THE  
4 POPULATION THAT WOULD TAKE THE TIME TO READ THE FINE PRINT  
5 OF AN AD.  
6 MS. CHABER: Q. OKAY. AND THE PART OF THE  
7 POPULATION THAT WOULD READ THE FINE PRINT OF THIS AD -- IS  
8 YOUR COPY LEGIBLE, DOCTOR?  
9 A. I DON'T HAVE A COPY IN FRONT OF ME.  
10 Q. WELL, THEN, I GUESS IT'S NOT VERY LEGIBLE.  
11 LET ME SEE IF I CAN HELP YOU. POINTING OVER HERE  
12 (INDICATING), "THE T-ZONE TEST WILL TELL YOU." WAS THAT A  
13 PART OF CAMEL ADVERTISING FOR ANY TIME PERIOD?  
14 A. IT WAS FOR SEVERAL YEARS. AT FIRST, IT WAS A  
15 SUBORDINATE PART OF THIS CAMPAIGN. THEN IT ELEVATED TO BE A  
16 MORE CENTRAL PART AS THE CAMPAIGN EVOLVED, YOU KNOW, "TEST  
17 YOUR CIGARETTE IN THE T-ZONE," THE THROAT.  
18 Q. WHEN I SAY "FINE PRINT," WE NEED THE GLASSES.  
19 IT SAYS: "THE 'T-ZONE,' T FOR TASTE AND T FOR  
20 THROAT IS YOUR OWN LABORATORY, YOUR PROVING GROUND FOR ANY  
21 CIGARETTE, FOR ONLY YOUR TASTE AND YOUR THROAT CAN DECIDE  
22 WHICH CIGARETTE TASTES BEST TO YOU AND HOW IT AFFECTS YOUR  
23 THROAT. ON THE BASIS OF THE EXPERIENCE OF MANY MILLIONS OF  
24 SMOKERS, WE BELIEVE CAMELS WILL SUIT YOUR 'T-ZONE TO A T."  
25 WHAT IS THE MESSAGE THAT THE CONSUMER WOULD GET  
26 FROM THAT?  
27 A. THAT THIS PARTICULAR BRAND OF CIGARETTES WOULD  
28 NOT BE IRRITATING TO THE THROAT, THE NOTION BEING THAT  
2120  
1 THROAT IRRITATION MIGHT BE SYMPTOMATIC OF A MEDICAL HARM  
2 THAT THE CIGARETTES WERE CAUSING, AND THIS WOULD LACK THAT  
3 HARM.  
4 Q. 1875. DO YOU HAVE A COPY OF THAT ONE UP THERE?  
5 A. I DO.  
6 Q. AND WHAT TIME PERIOD IS THIS IN?  
7 A. THIS IS 1948 OR 1949. I BELIEVE '49.  
8 Q. OKAY. AND THIS IS A CIGARETTE, EMBASSY  
9 CIGARETTES?  
10 A. YOU NEED TO PULL IT DOWN (REFERRING TO SCREEN).  
11 THERE YOU GO.  
12 Q. DO YOU KNOW WHO MANUFACTURED EMBASSY?  
13 A. I DON'T. ACTUALLY, I DON'T RECALL THE  
14 MANUFACTURER.  
15 Q. THERE WERE SOME BRANDS THAT HAVE COME AND GONE?  
16 A. YES. AND THIS IS ONE. I DON'T EVEN THINK THIS  
17 SURVIVED OUT OF THE '50S.  
18 Q. IT SAYS: "INHALE TO YOUR HEART'S CONTENT"?  
19 A. YES.  
20 Q. AND WHAT'S THE MESSAGE THE CONSUMER WOULD COME  
21 AWAY FROM THAT WITH?  
22 A. THE MESSAGE FROM THAT HEADLINE WOULD BE, YOU  
23 COULD RELAX AND ENJOY THE CIGARETTE, FIND IT SATISFYING  
24 WITHOUT THE NEED FOR ANY ANXIETY OR CONCERN.  
25 Q. AND THE VISUAL IMAGE; WHAT WOULD THE CONSUMER  
26 COME AWAY WITH FROM THE VISUAL IMAGE?  
27 A. I THINK THE VISUAL IMAGE IS MORE ONE OF GLAMOR  
28 RATHER THAN ONE OF HEALTHFULNESS, A SUGGESTION THAT PEOPLE  
2121  
1 WHO ARE QUITE AFFLUENT, VERY WELL DRESSED, WITH A LOT OF  
2 JEWELS, A FANCY STRAPLESS GOWN AND GLOVES AND SO ON, ARE

3 SMOKING THIS BRAND.  
4 Q. SOPHISTICATION?  
5 A. SOPHISTICATION, GLAMOR, AFFLUENCE.  
6 Q. UNLIKE ALL THE OTHER SPORTS ADS THAT WE JUST  
7 LOOKED AT, THIS HAS A WOMAN AT THE CENTER?  
8 A. YES, IT DOES.  
9 Q. AND AT THIS TIME PERIOD, WERE WOMEN BEGINNING TO  
10 SMOKE MORE FREQUENTLY?  
11 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. VAGUE. LACK OF  
12 FOUNDATION.  
13 THE COURT: WHEN AND WHERE?  
14 MS. CHABER: Q. IN THE UNITED STATES, WERE  
15 WOMEN BEGINNING TO SMOKE MORE FREQUENTLY THAN THEY HAD IN  
16 PREVIOUS TIME PERIODS?  
17 THE COURT: I'LL OVERRULE THE OBJECTION.  
18 THE WITNESS: YES. SMOKING AMONG WOMEN WAS  
19 STILL ON THE INCREASE. IT HAD BEEN INCREASING FOR SOME  
20 TIME, BUT IT INCREASED THROUGHOUT THE WAR INTO THE POSTWAR  
21 PERIOD. AND THEY WERE, CONSISTENT WITH THIS ADVERTISEMENT,  
22 AMONG THE PIONEERS IN SWITCHING OVER TO FILTERS.  
23 MS. CHABER: Q. AND 1876.  
24 THIS IS AN ADVERTISEMENT FOR KENT?  
25 A. YES.  
26 Q. AND WHAT IS THE HEALTH MESSAGE THE CONSUMER WOULD  
27 GET FROM THIS AD?  
28 A. THIS IS THE LAUNCH CAMPAIGN FOR KENT, WHICH  
2122  
1 CONVEYED AT LEAST THE HEALTH IMPLICATION THAT THE AMERICAN  
2 MEDICAL ASSOCIATION --  
3 MR. BARRON: EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR. THE DATE?  
4 MS. CHABER: DID I MISS THE DATE?  
5 MR. BARRON: YOU JUST MISSED THE DATE.  
6 THE WITNESS: 1953. 1953.  
7 MR. BARRON: THANK YOU.  
8 THE COURT: OKAY. A FAIR INTERRUPTION.  
9 MS. CHABER: Q. I THINK WE ESTABLISHED THAT  
10 ALL OF THESE WERE ONES THAT WERE IN CONSUMER MAGAZINES?  
11 A. THAT'S CORRECT. THIS PARTICULAR CAMPAIGN WOULD  
12 HAVE RUN IN BOTH MAGAZINES AND NEWSPAPERS. THIS WAS THE  
13 LARGEST PRODUCT LAUNCH IN HISTORY AT THE TIME. IT WAS  
14 BROUGHT OUT IN THE EARLY 1950S.  
15 Q. AND IN FACT, DID THESE KENT ADS, SIMILAR ADS,  
16 APPEAR IN MEDICAL JOURNALS?  
17 A. THEY DID, AND ON TELEVISION AS WELL.  
18 Q. OKAY. I THINK YOU WERE EXPLAINING WHAT HEALTH  
19 IMPLICATIONS THE CONSUMER WOULD COME AWAY WITH.  
20 A. YES. THE TEXT AT THE TOP, PARTICULARLY THE PART  
21 THAT'S IN SLIGHTLY BOLDER LETTERS, SAYS: "THE AMERICAN  
22 MEDICAL ASSOCIATION TESTS PROVE THE MOST EFFECTIVE FILTER IS  
23 USED BY KENT."  
24 SO IT'S A PRODUCT SUPERIORITY CLAIM BASED UPON AN  
25 APPARENT ENDORSEMENT OF THE AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION.  
26 Q. IN FACT, WAS THIS THE KENT MICRONITE FILTER THAT  
27 HAD ASBESTOS IN IT?  
28 A. IT WAS.  
2123  
1 Q. AND WERE THERE OTHER HEALTH REPRESENTATIONS THAT  
2 WERE MADE IN THIS AD?  
3 A. YES. THE GENERAL THEME OF THE WHOLE CAMPAIGN WAS  
4 THAT IT WAS OFFERING PROTECTION, THE GREATEST PROTECTION OF  
5 ANY FILTER CIGARETTE, THAT THE FILTER -- THE WHOLE POINT OF  
6 THE FILTER WAS HEALTH PROTECTION.  
7 Q. AND 1878, CAN YOU DATE THAT, APPROXIMATELY?



8 A. YES, 1958.  
9 Q. OKAY. AND THAT'S A PARLIAMENT AD?  
10 A. YES, IT IS.  
11 Q. WHO MAKES PARLIAMENT?  
12 A. PHILIP MORRIS.  
13 Q. AND WHAT'S THE HEALTH IMPLICATION OF THIS AD THAT  
14 THE CONSUMER WOULD COME AWAY WITH?  
15 A. THIS IS ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF IMPLIED ENDORSEMENT  
16 HERE. IT LOOKS LIKE IT MEETS SOME GOVERNMENT TESTING  
17 BECAUSE OF THE SEAL AND REFERENCES TO THE STANDARDS OF THE  
18 UNITED STATES TESTING COMPANY.  
19 Q. THAT'S NOT A GOVERNMENT COMPANY?  
20 A. IT'S NOT A GOVERNMENT AGENCY. IT'S SIMPLY, YOU  
21 PAY YOUR MONEY, YOU GET YOUR TEST AND GET YOUR SEAL.  
22 IT'S A COMMERCIAL CONTRACT FIRM.  
23 Q. LIKE THE GOOD HOUSEKEEPING SEAL OF APPROVAL?  
24 A. THAT'S CORRECT. WITHOUT THE MAGAZINE OF GOOD  
25 HOUSEKEEPING.  
26 Q. OKAY. AND WHEN IT SAYS "NEW HI-FI FILTER,"  
27 WHAT'S THE REFERENCE TO "HI-FI"?  
28 A. WELL, "HI-FI" WAS THE STATE-OF-THE-ART SOUND

2124

1 REPRODUCTION TECHNOLOGY, HIGH FIDELITY.  
2 AND WHEN IN REFERENCE TO MUSIC, THIS IS AT A TIME  
3 WHEN WE DIDN'T EVEN HAVE STEREO RECORDS. THEY WERE JUST  
4 BEGINNING TO COME IN. SO THAT WAS THE STATE-OF-THE-ART WAY  
5 OF PLAYING RECORDS. 33 RPM RECORDS WERE JUST BEGINNING TO  
6 BE A NEW MODE. THAT WAS SORT OF CUTTING-EDGE TECHNOLOGY.  
7 AND THEY USED "HI-FI" IN THIS SENSE TO SUGGEST A  
8 CUTTING-EDGE TECHNOLOGY FOR FILTRATION, FOR HIGH FILTRATION.  
9 Q. THERE'S A LOT OF INFORMATION GIVEN, AGAIN, FOR  
10 SOMEBODY WHO MIGHT READ THE FINE PRINT ABOUT WHAT HAD BEEN  
11 PROVED?  
12 A. YES. THERE'S THREE "PROVED, PROVED, PROVED," AND  
13 WITH REFERENCE TO THE NUMBER OF FILTER TRAPS, THE MOST  
14 EFFECTIVE FILTERING MATERIALS AND THE LACK OF LEAKAGE OF  
15 TARS AND NICOTINE FROM FILTER TO MOUTH AND SO ON.  
16 Q. AND THE NEXT ONE IS 1880?  
17 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
18 Q. AND WHAT YEAR IS THAT?  
19 A. 1959.  
20 Q. AND THIS IS AN ADVERTISEMENT FOR VICEROY?  
21 A. YES, IT IS.  
22 Q. "THE MAN WHO THINKS FOR HIMSELF KNOWS"?  
23 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
24 Q. YOU PUT THIS IN THE CATEGORY OF HEALTH  
25 IMPLICATIONS; IS THAT CORRECT?  
26 A. I DID. IT'S NOW MOVING INTO AN ERA WHERE THE  
27 HEALTH MESSAGES ARE BEING COMMUNICATED IN A MORE IMPLIED  
28 RATHER THAN EXPLICIT MANNER.

2125

1 HERE, THE PERSON BEING PORTRAYED IS A PERSON WHO  
2 WORKS AT A NEWSPAPER. AND YOU CAN SEE THE NEWSPAPER'S TITLE  
3 IN THE LETTERING ON THE WINDOW. IT'S ALSO ECHOED BY THE  
4 NEWSPAPER BOY YOU CAN SEE BY HIS CHEEK.  
5 THE GENERAL IDEA HERE WAS PORTRAYING PEOPLE WHO  
6 HAD RESPONSIBLE POSITIONS THAT DEMANDED INTELLIGENCE BEING A  
7 SMOKER. WE SAW IN ADS PROFESSORS SMOKING, SCIENTISTS  
8 SMOKING, JUDGES SMOKING, EDITORS SMOKING.  
9 SO THIS IS A SUGGESTION THAT INTELLIGENT PEOPLE  
10 MAKING INTELLIGENT CHOICES WERE CHOOSING VARIOUS BRANDS AND  
11 CHOOSING FILTERED PRODUCTS.  
12 Q. AND WAS THAT CONSISTENT WITH THE TIME PERIOD?

13 A. YES, IT WAS.  
14 Q. DID THAT REMAIN CONSISTENT UP TO AND THROUGH THE  
15 1960S?  
16 A. YES.  
17 Q. AT THE TIME PERIOD WHEN YOU WERE TEACHING AT THE  
18 UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS AND WERE A PROFESSOR, WERE YOU ALLOWED  
19 TO SMOKE IN YOUR CLASSROOM?  
20 A. I NOT ONLY WAS ALLOWED TO, THERE WERE ASHTRAYS  
21 PROVIDED. AND I DID.  
22 Q. WERE YOU THE ONLY ONE OF YOUR PEERS WHO DID THAT?  
23 A. NO. AND THE STUDENTS SMOKED IN THE CLASSROOM AS  
24 WELL.  
25 Q. AND IN THIS AD, BEHIND THE THINKING MAN, WE HAVE  
26 A VILLAGE SCENE?  
27 A. YES. LOOKING OVER HIS SHOULDER, WE CAN SEE OUT  
28 THROUGH THE WINDOW TO THE COURTHOUSE ACROSS THE STREET AND  
2126  
1 THE NEWSPAPER BOY THROWING A NEWSPAPER.  
2 Q. AND THE SCHOOL BUS GOING BY?  
3 A. YES.  
4 Q. AND I GUESS THAT SAYS "COURTHOUSE"?  
5 A. YES.  
6 Q. AND WERE THESE UNUSUAL ADS FOR THE TIME PERIOD?  
7 A. NO, THEY WERE NOT.  
8 Q. WERE THEY REPRESENTATIVE OF OTHER SIMILAR ADS  
9 THAT APPEARED REGULARLY IN CONSUMER MAGAZINES AND  
10 PUBLICATIONS?  
11 A. YES. AS I MENTIONED, THIS ONE HAPPENS TO SHOW AN  
12 EDITOR. OTHER EXAMPLES WOULD SHOW SCIENTISTS AND PROFESSORS  
13 AND JUDGES AND THE LIKE.  
14 Q. WE WERE GOING TO TALK ABOUT TELEVISION AND THINGS  
15 THAT WERE TV COMMERCIALS FOR CIGARETTES DURING THE 1960S?  
16 A. THAT'S RIGHT.  
17 Q. I BELIEVE YOU SAID YOU HAD ANALYZED THIS ISSUE  
18 AND HAD RESEARCHED AND WRITTEN AND TAUGHT ABOUT ISSUES OF TV  
19 ADVERTISING OF CIGARETTE SMOKING; IS THAT CORRECT?  
20 A. THAT'S CORRECT. I HAD ACCESS TO A GREAT DEAL OF  
21 DATA FOR 1963.  
22 Q. IN 1963, I THINK YOU HAD ALREADY INDICATED THAT  
23 THERE WERE THREE MAJOR STATIONS?  
24 A. THREE NATIONAL NETWORKS; ABC, CBS AND NBC.  
25 Q. AND IN ANALYZING 1963 -- FIRST OF ALL, WHAT DID  
26 YOU DO?  
27 A. WELL, THE DATA I HAD AVAILABLE TO ME WAS MATERIAL  
28 THAT I FOUND IN THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION'S LIBRARIES AND  
2127  
1 ARCHIVES.  
2 AND IT WAS A DETAILED LISTING OF ALL OF THE SHOWS  
3 ADVERTISED BY THE TOBACCO FIRMS AND ALL OF THE AUDIENCE  
4 CHARACTERISTICS OF THOSE SHOWS.  
5 SO I DID A NUMBER OF THINGS TO IDENTIFY THE  
6 SCHEDULING; THAT IS, TO LOOK AT THE PATTERN OF HOW THE SHOWS  
7 APPEARED OVER TIME ACROSS THE WEEK, ACROSS THE DAYS OF THE  
8 PRIME TIME, ACROSS THE DAYS OF THE WEEK, ACROSS THE HOURS OF  
9 PRIME TIME.  
10 AND I THEN LOOKED AT THE AUDIENCE  
11 CHARACTERISTICS, AND LOOKED AT HOW MUCH MONEY WAS BEING  
12 SPENT AND HOW MUCH TELEVISION WAS CAPTURING OF THEIR TOTAL  
13 PROMOTIONAL SPENDING AND THINGS LIKE THAT.  
14 SO I TRIED TO UNDERSTAND THIS DATA, AND IN THE  
15 LARGER CONTEXT OF THE ADVERTISING ACTIVITY OF THAT YEAR.  
16 MS. CHABER: OKAY. AND PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBIT 1902  
17 AND 1902.01, WHICH IS THE BLOWUP OF IT, I WOULD SEEK TO USE

18 AT THIS POINT FOR DEMONSTRATIVE PURPOSES.  
19 THE COURT: IT DOESN'T MATTER TO ME, BUT THE WAY  
20 I SAW IT, 1902 HAD A CHANGE IN IT? I DON'T CARE.  
21 MS. CHABER: SOMEBODY CHANGED IT ON ME.  
22 THE COURT: I DON'T CARE WHAT IT IS.  
23 MS. CHABER: OKAY.  
24 THE COURT: WHAT IS IT, 1902?  
25 MS. CHABER: LET'S MAKE IT 1902-A AND I WILL FIX  
26 IT ON THE BOARD.  
27 THE COURT: OKAY.  
28 MS. CHABER: Q. DR. POLLAY, WOULD IT HELP, FOR  
2128

1 THE JURY TO UNDERSTAND THIS, FOR YOU TO ILLUSTRATE YOUR  
2 TESTIMONY WITH RESPECT TO TV ADVERTISING BY CIGARETTE  
3 COMPANIES? RIGHT NOW, WE'RE SPECIFICALLY TALKING ABOUT  
4 1963.

5 A. YES, DEFINITELY.  
6 Q. WOULD YOU MIND STEPPING DOWN HERE.  
7 AND MAYBE, IF YOU DON'T MIND BEING BLOCKED, YOUR  
8 HONOR, I CAN MOVE THIS IN FRONT OF THE JURY, CLOSER TO THE  
9 JURY.

10 THE COURT: I DON'T MIND BEING BLOCKED. YOU MAY  
11 NEED TO CLIP THAT ON.

12 (DISCUSSION OFF THE RECORD)

13 MS. CHABER: Q. FIRST OF ALL, CAN YOU  
14 ILLUSTRATE FOR US HOW -- I GUESS, FIRST EXPLAIN WHAT THIS  
15 CHART IS.

16 JUROR NO. 6: LIGHTS.

17 MS. CHABER: LIGHTS.

18 THE WITNESS: THESE ARE THE HALF-HOUR TIME SLOTS  
19 OF WHAT'S CALLED PRIME TIME, FROM 7:30, 7:30 TO 8:00, 8:00  
20 TO 8:30, 8:30 TO 9:00 AND SO ON, ALL THE WAY UP TO 11:00  
21 O'CLOCK, FOR THE SEVEN DAYS OF THE WEEK. AND THEN IN EACH  
22 ROW HERE, THE THREE NETWORKS.

23 SO THIS ALLOWS US TO IDENTIFY, YOU KNOW, WHERE  
24 CIGARETTE ADVERTISING WAS OCCURRING, WHAT DAYS OF THE WEEK,  
25 AND WHAT PATTERN THERE MIGHT HAVE BEEN TO IT, AND WAS THERE  
26 A LOT OR A LITTLE, THINGS LIKE THAT.

27 MS. CHABER: Q. OKAY. AND IS THERE A WAY YOU  
28 CAN ILLUSTRATE FOR US THE PATTERNS OF WHEN IT WAS

2129  
1 OCCURRING? AND THEN WE'LL GET MORE SPECIFIC AS TO WHOSE  
2 ADVERTISING IT WAS.

3 A. I THINK SO. BUT I THINK MAYBE IT WOULD BE BEST  
4 IF WE BUILT IT UP FIRM BY FIRM.

5 Q. OKAY. WHO WAS DOING CIGARETTE ADVERTISING ON TV  
6 IN THIS TIME PERIOD, 1963?

7 A. WELL, ESSENTIALLY, ALL OF THE TOBACCO FIRMS,  
8 THERE BEING SIX AT THE TIME.

9 THE DEFENDANTS, PHILIP MORRIS AND R.J. REYNOLDS,  
10 AND THEN THERE'S LORILLARD, LIGGETT & MYERS, BROWN &  
11 WILLIAMSON AND AMERICAN TOBACCO.

12 Q. OKAY. SO WHO SHALL WE START WITH?

13 A. WELL, I HAVE GOT ALL KINDS OF COLOR THINGS.  
14 LET'S START WITH PHILIP MORRIS, SINCE I'VE GOT RED OR PINK  
15 IN MY HAND. IT'S NOT EXACTLY MARLBORO RED, BUT IT WILL  
16 BE --

17 MR. BARRON: WE'LL ACCEPT IT.

18 THE WITNESS: I'LL SHADE IN THE BLOCKS THAT  
19 PHILIP MORRIS WAS ADVERTISING.

20 I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE I DO THIS RIGHT HERE,  
21 BECAUSE I CAN'T ERASE ANY OF THIS.

22 (MARKING ON BOARD)

23 MS. CHABER: Q. WE HAVE TO GET INTO COLOR  
24 THEORY IF YOU MESS UP ON YOUR COLORS THERE.  
25 A. LET ME SEE. THERE'S ONE MORE HERE.  
26 SO THAT WOULD REPRESENT PHILIP MORRIS' SCHEDULE.  
27 Q. I THINK YOU ARE BLOCKING ONE OF THE JURORS.  
28 A. I'M SORRY.

2130  
1 Q. OKAY. AND JUST FOR THE RECORD, WE'VE GOT MONDAY,  
2 CBS FROM 10:00 TO 11:00, THURSDAY; AM I READING THIS RIGHT?  
3 A. THERE'S ONE I MISSED.  
4 Q. OKAY.  
5 A. THERE'S YET ANOTHER ONE.  
6 THE RED SKELTON SHOW, TUESDAY ON CBS FROM 8:00 TO  
7 9:00.  
8 SO A TOTAL OF 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11,  
9 12, 13 HALF-HOUR SLOTS.  
10 Q. IS THIS TIME FRAME -- IS ANY PORTION OF THIS TIME  
11 FRAME DESIGNATED FAMILY HOUR?  
12 A. WELL, THE EARLIER IN THE EVENING, THE HIGHER THE  
13 PROPORTION OF YOUNG CHILDREN THERE WOULD BE, BUT THERE WOULD  
14 BE CHILDREN AT ALL HOURS.  
15 I MEAN, THERE COULD BE CERTAINLY TEENAGERS AT ALL  
16 HOURS. I THINK THE LATER YOU GET INTO THE EVENING, THE  
17 FEWER YOUNG CHILDREN YOU HAVE, BECAUSE THEY'VE BE SENT OFF  
18 TO BED, I THINK, BUT -- IN MANY FAMILIES, AT LEAST.  
19 BUT WE KNOW THERE ARE LITERALLY MILLIONS OF  
20 CHILDREN STILL WATCHING TELEVISION AT MIDNIGHT. SO IT'S NOT  
21 A RIGID THING, YOU KNOW. IT'S JUST THE CHANGING PROPORTIONS  
22 OF HOW MANY CHILDREN AND HOW MANY ADULTS WE SEE.  
23 WE HAD THIS SPECIFIC DATA FOR THE NUMBER OF  
24 CHILDREN FOR EACH OF THESE SHOWS.  
25 Q. OKAY. WE'LL COME BACK TO THAT AFTER.  
26 SO THIS HAS PHILIP MORRIS TIME SLOTS IN PINK?  
27 A. YES.  
28 Q. AND WHAT IS --

2131  
1 A. I'LL DO THE R.J. REYNOLDS TIME SLOTS IN BLUE  
2 HERE.  
3 OKAY. SO THAT'S THE R.J. REYNOLDS TIME SLOTS IN  
4 BLUE.  
5 I THINK MAYBE IF WE HAD JUST ONE OTHER COLOR, WE  
6 COULD JUST DO ALL OF THE REST IN ONE THIRD COLOR.  
7 Q. YELLOW. I'M GOING TO PUT A KEY UP HERE SO THAT  
8 WE REMEMBER (MARKING EXHIBIT).  
9 A. YES. SO THAT'S "PM" FOR PHILIP MORRIS. I'LL DO  
10 THAT.  
11 Q. STICK THAT ON THAT SIDE, SINCE YOU'RE OVER THERE.  
12 THAT'S IN BLUE. THEN YOU'RE GOING TO YELLOW.  
13 THAT WILL BE THE REMAINDER.  
14 A. I WILL JUST USE YELLOW FOR THE OTHERS. I HAVE  
15 THAT DETAIL, BUT I DON'T THINK IT'S NECESSARY FOR THIS  
16 CASE.  
17 SO MAYBE I'LL -- LIGGETT & MYERS, BROWN &  
18 WILLIAMSON, LIGGETT & MYERS, AMERICAN TOBACCO AND LORILLARD  
19 BOTH.  
20 TUESDAY, AMERICAN TOBACCO, AMERICAN TOBACCO,  
21 BROWN & WILLIAMSON, BROWN & WILLIAMSON.  
22 WEDNESDAY, DR. BEN CASEY, BROWN & WILLIAMSON, AND  
23 MORE BROWN & WILLIAMSON HERE. DICK VAN DYKE AT 9:30.  
24 LET'S SEE. AT 8:00 THERE, DR. KILDARE, THE JIMMY  
25 DEAN SHOW, THE NURSES.  
26 Q. YOU'RE GETTING GOOD EXERCISE.  
27 A. YES. THIS IS ACTUALLY MORE DIFFICULT THAN IT

28 SEEMS HERE.

2132

1 I HAVE ANOTHER HALF-HOUR THERE. AND TWILIGHT  
2 ZONE ON SATURDAY.

3 AND SUNDAY NIGHT, ED SULLIVAN. OKAY. THAT I  
4 THINK PRETTY WELL DOES IT.

5 ALTHOUGH I SHOULD POINT OUT, THIS DOES NOT  
6 INCLUDE SPECIAL EVENTS OR SPORTS.

7 Q. WHAT DO YOU MEAN?

8 A. WELL, R.J. REYNOLDS SPONSORED SIX MAJOR LEAGUE  
9 BASEBALL TEAMS. NONE OF THAT IS SHOWN HERE.

10 PHILIP MORRIS SPONSORED THE NATIONAL FOOTBALL  
11 LEAGUE. AGAIN, THAT'S NOT SHOWN HERE. THESE ARE JUST THE  
12 SEASON-LONG COMMITMENTS FOR THE NETWORK FOR THESE PROGRAMS.

13 THERE ARE OTHER KINDS OF SPECIAL EVENTS, LIKE THE  
14 OLYMPICS. THE WINTER OLYMPICS IN '64 WERE SPONSORED BY  
15 TOBACCO.

16 YOU MAY NEED TO ASK SOME QUESTIONS HERE.

17 Q. JUST NOW AS A GENERAL PRINCIPLE, IF YOU WERE  
18 WATCHING TELEVISION FROM 7:30 TO 11:00 P.M., WHAT WAS THE  
19 LIKELIHOOD THAT YOU'D SEE A CIGARETTE AD?

20 A. 100 PERCENT. I MEAN, THERE ARE MANY  
21 CIRCUMSTANCES HERE WHERE THERE'S CREATED SOMETHING WHICH IS  
22 CALLED A ROADBLOCK.

23 Q. WHAT'S THAT?

24 A. A TERM IN ADVERTISING MEDIA, BUYING OR  
25 ESSENTIALLY COVERING ALL THE EXITS, LIKE YOU'RE TRYING TO  
26 PREVENT SOMEONE FROM GETTING OUT, YOU BLOCK -- PUT A  
27 ROADBLOCK AT EVERY ROAD OUT OF TOWN.

28 YOU COVER EVERY NETWORK. THOSE CONSTITUTE

2133

1 ROADBLOCKS. NO MATTER WHICH CHANNEL YOU TURN TO, YOU SEE  
2 CIGARETTE ADS.

3 THE TERM FOR THAT IS A "ROADBLOCK." THERE ARE  
4 EIGHT ROADBLOCKS IN THIS OVERALL SCHEDULE, AND THE OVERALL  
5 SCHEDULE COVERS THESE 42 DIFFERENT SHOWS THAT ARE  
6 ADVERTISED -- 55 PERCENT OF ALL THE AVAILABLE TIME SLOTS ARE  
7 ADVERTISED BY TOBACCO.

8 SO MORE THAN HALF OF THE TIME, YOU HAVE A  
9 CIGARETTE SPONSOR.

10 SO IF YOU JUST TURN ON AT RANDOM, IF YOU'RE JUST  
11 WATCHING SHOWS, HALF OF THE TIME YOU'D SEE A SHOW THAT WAS  
12 SPONSORED BY A CIGARETTE COMPANY, SLIGHTLY MORE THAN HALF  
13 THE TIME.

14 Q. OKAY. AND THERE WOULD BE BOTH THE NAME OF THE  
15 CIGARETTE COMPANY, BROUGHT TO YOU BY SO-AND-SO, AS WELL AS  
16 THE ADVERTISEMENTS THEMSELVES?

17 A. THERE WOULD BE SPOTS. THAT IS THE KIND OF  
18 30-SECOND AD WE NOW KNOW, ALTHOUGH IN THIS DAY YOU WOULD  
19 HAVE ALSO SEEN 60-SECOND ADS.

20 IN ADDITION, THERE WOULD BE THE SIGNOFFS,  
21 SIGNONS, THE TITLE, THE SEGUE SOMETIME BETWEEN SHOWS OR  
22 BETWEEN HALF HOURS, "STAY TUNED FOR THE NEXT SECTION," AND  
23 SO ON. "WE'LL BE BACK IN A FEW MINUTES," THAT KIND OF  
24 THING.

25 SO THERE WOULD BE REPEATED MENTIONS OF THE  
26 SPONSOR.

27 Q. OKAY. AND CAN YOU GIVE US AN IDEA WHAT SHOWS,  
28 FOR EXAMPLE, PHILIP MORRIS WAS SPONSORING?

2134

1 A. FROM HERE, FROM THIS LIST, EAST SIDE/WEST SIDE,  
2 THE RED SKELTON HOUR. THAT'S HERE (INDICATING).

3 Q. DO YOU WANT TO JUST JOT THAT IN?

4 A. (MARKING EXHIBIT))  
5 RED SKELTON, WHO WAS A COMEDIAN WHO HAD A COMEDY  
6 SKETCH HOUR.  
7 Q. AND IN LOOKING AT THIS, HAVE YOU LOOKED AT WHAT  
8 PERCENTAGE OF THE AUDIENCE WOULD BE CHILDREN WITH RESPECT TO  
9 SOME OF THESE SHOWS?  
10 MR. BARRON: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. VAGUE AND  
11 AMBIGUOUS AS TO THE PHRASE "CHILDREN" WITHOUT RELATING TO A  
12 PARTICULAR AGE GROUP.  
13 THE COURT: WHY DON'T YOU CLARIFY THE QUESTION.  
14 THE WITNESS: I HAVE --  
15 THE COURT: WHEN I SUSTAIN AN OBJECTION, YOU  
16 DON'T JUST GO AHEAD AND ANSWER.  
17 I'M TELLING COUNSEL TO CLARIFY THE QUESTION, NOT  
18 YOU TO CLARIFY THE ANSWER.  
19 MS. CHABER: HE HAD HIS BACK TO YOU.  
20 IN FAIRNESS, I THINK HE THOUGHT YOU WERE ASKING  
21 HIM TO CLARIFY.  
22 THE COURT: I WAS ASKING COUNSEL TO RESTATE THE  
23 QUESTION. ALL RIGHT.  
24 MS. CHABER: Q. IS THERE AN ANALYSIS OF THE  
25 AGES OF THE AUDIENCE FOR CERTAIN OF THE SHOWS?  
26 A. YES. THE ANALYSIS PERCEIVES TO CALCULATE THE  
27 NUMBER OF EXPOSURES THAT CHILDREN UNDER THE AGE OF 13 WOULD  
28 HAVE SEEN, THE NUMBER OF EXPOSURES THAT TEENAGERS WOULD HAVE  
2135  
1 SEEN, THE NUMBER OF EXPOSURES THAT ADULTS WOULD HAVE SEEN.  
2 THAT'S THE BREAKOUT OF THE AVAILABLE DATA.  
3 Q. OKAY. SO IT'S 13 OR UNDER?  
4 A. YES. IT'S GENERALLY 12 OR UNDER. TEENAGE YEARS  
5 ARE 13 THROUGH 17.  
6 Q. OKAY. AND THEN THE ADULT AUDIENCE?  
7 A. ADULT.  
8 Q. WHAT OTHER SHOWS DID PHILIP MORRIS SPONSOR?  
9 A. PHILIP MORRIS ALSO HAD RAWHIDE, WHICH WAS A  
10 COWBOY SHOW, AND PERRY MASON, WHICH WAS A COURTROOM DRAMA.  
11 ROUTE 66.  
12 Q. I KNOW, BUT OTHERS MAY NOT.  
13 WHAT TYPE OF SHOW WAS THAT?  
14 A. ACTUALLY, I DON'T REMEMBER.  
15 Q. ALL I REMEMBER IS "COOKIE, COOKIE, LEND ME YOUR  
16 COMB."  
17 MR. BARRON: THAT'S 77 SUNSET STRIP. THE WRONG  
18 SHOW.  
19 TWO GUYS IN A CORVETTE DRIVING DOWN ROUTE 66 WITH  
20 A LOT OF EXPERIENCES.  
21 THE WITNESS: 77 SUNSET STRIP.  
22 MR. BARRON: IN A CONVERTIBLE CORVETTE, RED.  
23 THE WITNESS: SO COOKIE BURNS WAS SPONSORED BY  
24 R.J. REYNOLDS.  
25 (ATTORNEYS CONFER)  
26 THE COURT: I'M NOT SURE JUDITH GOT ALL THAT,  
27 BUT I GUESS IT DOESN'T MATTER.  
28 MR. BARRON: TRIVIA. ROUTE 66 ISN'T EVEN AROUND  
2136  
1 ANYMORE.  
2 THE COURT: WE CAN ADJOURN EARLY AND DISCUSS  
3 THIS.  
4 MS. CHABER: YOUR HONOR, WE ARE GOING TO WATCH  
5 TELEVISION BEFORE WE LEAVE TODAY.  
6 THE WITNESS: ALFRED HITCHCOCK. THIS ONE IS  
7 JACKIE GLEASON.  
8 MS. CHABER: Q. AND WHAT TYPE OF SHOW WAS

9 JACKIE GLEASON?  
10 A. A VARIETY SHOW. MUSIC AND HUMOR PRIMARILY. A  
11 DANCE TROUPE THAT SANG AND DANCED AND A NICE ORCHESTRA. OF  
12 COURSE, A LOT OF HUMOR.  
13 Q. AND WHAT OTHER SHOWS DID YOU HAVE R.J. REYNOLDS  
14 SPONSORING; 77 SUNSET STRIP?  
15 A. THEY DID.  
16 Q. WHAT ELSE DID THEY SPONSOR?  
17 A. WAGON TRAIN.  
18 JUROR NO. 12: THAT'S SUNSET BOULEVARD  
19 (INDICATING).  
20 THE COURT: JURORS, I NEED YOU NOT TO PITCH IN,  
21 PLEASE.  
22 THE COURT: HOLD ON. LET ME JUST --  
23 MS. CHABER: WE LOST CONTROL HERE.  
24 THE COURT: I'M SURE THE JURY WAS TRYING TO BE  
25 HELPFUL. I NEED THE JURY TO STAY OUT OF THE TESTIMONY,  
26 PLEASE.  
27 MS. CHABER: Q. YOU CORRECTED THAT TO 77  
28 SUNSET STRIP, WHICH TAKES PLACE ON SUNSET BOULEVARD, BUT  
2137  
1 THAT'S A DIFFERENT MOVIE.  
2 Q. SO YOU HAVE WAGON TRAIN, TO TELL THE TRUTH. AND  
3 THAT WAS A QUIZ SHOW?  
4 A. TO TELL THE TRUTH, YES.  
5 AND HERE'S THE BEVERLY HILLBILLIES. AND THE  
6 BEVERLY HILLBILLIES, YOU KNOW, IS A COMEDY BASED UPON PEOPLE  
7 FROM THE OZARKS MIGRATING TO CALIFORNIA.  
8 Q. THEY STRUCK OIL AND ENDED UP IN BEVERLY HILLS?  
9 A. GOT RICH AND CAME HERE TO SPEND THEIR MONEY.  
10 Q. WHAT WAS THE ONE THAT YOU PUT BEFORE; GLYNIS?  
11 A. GLYNIS.  
12 Q. WHAT'S THAT?  
13 A. I DON'T RECALL.  
14 ACTUALLY, BEVERLY HILLBILLIES WAS BY FAR THE MORE  
15 SUCCESSFUL SHOW. IT WAS ONE OF THE BIGGEST SHOWS OF THE  
16 WHOLE SEASON.  
17 THIS WAS SATURDAY NIGHT AT THE MOVIES. GARRY  
18 MOORE.  
19 Q. AND THAT WAS A VARIETY SHOW AS WELL?  
20 A. YES.  
21 CAROL BURNETT. THE COMEDIENNE, CAROL BURNETT,  
22 LAUNCHED HER CAREER ON THAT SHOW.  
23 Q. I DON'T WANT YOU TO GO THROUGH AND PUT IN ALL THE  
24 OTHER SHOWS, BUT I THINK YOU HAD MENTIONED THAT THERE WERE A  
25 COUPLE OF DOCTOR AND NURSE SHOWS.  
26 A. BEN CASEY. THREE THAT HAD A MEDICAL THEME.  
27 BEN CASEY WAS A DOCTOR.  
28 Q. WOULD YOU JUST STICK THAT ONE IN.  
2138  
1 A. THAT WAS HERE (MARKING EXHIBIT).  
2 Q. DID HE ACTUALLY SMOKE ON THE SHOW?  
3 A. YES.  
4 DR. KILDARE. WHERE WAS DR. KILDARE? HERE, I  
5 BELIEVE. THURSDAY ON ABC.  
6 DR. KILDARE AND HIS BOSS, DR. GILLESPIE, BOTH  
7 SMOKED AND --  
8 Q. DR. GILLESPIE PLAYED THE HEAD OF THE DEPARTMENT  
9 OR THE HEAD OF THE HOSPITAL?  
10 A. THAT'S CORRECT.  
11 AND THE NURSES WAS ALSO ON THURSDAY. THIS WAS  
12 ANOTHER MEDICAL THEME SHOW SPONSORED BY TOBACCO.  
13 Q. NOW, WERE THERE ANY SHOWS THAT YOU HAVEN'T PUT IN

14 THERE, THE TITLE OF THE SHOW, WHICH HAD AN AUDIENCE THAT  
15 INCLUDED CHILDREN 12 AND UNDER?  
16 A. YES.  
17 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. VAGUE, YOUR HONOR.  
18 YOU MEAN ONE -- I DON'T MEAN TO ARGUE. I THINK  
19 THAT IT'S VAGUE AS TO THE QUANTITY.  
20 THE COURT: YES, IT IS.  
21 I'M GOING TO STRIKE THE ANSWER.  
22 YOU NEED TO LET US KNOW WHEN GET TO A LOGICAL  
23 BREAKING POINT FOR THE DAY.  
24 I DO HAVE ANOTHER MATTER. IF YOU CAN FINISH WITH  
25 THIS CHART IN THE NEXT COUPLES OF MINUTES, YOU CAN.  
26 MS. CHABER: I THOUGHT WE WERE GOING TO 4:30.  
27 THE COURT: I'M GOING TO QUIT A LITTLE BIT  
28 EARLY. I HAVE SOME PEOPLE THAT ARE PATIENTLY WAITING.  
2139  
1 IF CAN YOU FINISH WITH THE CHART IN THE NEXT FEW  
2 MINUTES.  
3 MS. CHABER: I WAS GOING TO FINISH THE VIDEO.  
4 IT'S VERY SHORT. IT DOESN'T NEED TO BE REPORTED.  
5 THE COURT: LET'S DO THE CHART. WE'LL DO THE  
6 VIDEO TOMORROW.  
7 ANYWAY, I STRUCK THAT LAST ANSWER, BECAUSE YOUR  
8 QUESTION WAS VAGUE, WITHOUT PREJUDICE.  
9 MS. CHABER: Q. HAS THERE BEEN AN ANALYSIS OF  
10 THE PERCENTAGE OF CHILDREN IN THE CATEGORIES THAT YOU DEFINE  
11 AS UNDER 12 AND OVER 12?  
12 A. YES. AND -- YES, AND THE NUMBER OF EXPOSURES  
13 THOSE CHILDREN HAVE SEEN, THE AVERAGE CHILD WOULD HAVE SEEN  
14 IN THE AVERAGE WEEK OR MONTH OR YEAR.  
15 Q. OKAY. SO IT'S NOT NECESSARILY SPECIFIC TO SHOW  
16 BY SHOW?  
17 A. IT'S NOT SHOW BY SHOW, ALTHOUGH THAT DETAIL OF  
18 DATA WAS AVAILABLE AND IS WHAT WAS CONVERTED INTO  
19 CALCULATING THE ESTIMATES.  
20 Q. AND IN TERMS OF DEALING WITH WORKING ON THE 1994  
21 SURGEON GENERAL'S REPORT ON YOUTH, WAS THERE A NUMBER, A  
22 PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE UNDER 12 AND IN THE 13 TO 17 YEAR  
23 CATEGORY THAT WAS CONSIDERED A SIGNIFICANT AUDIENCE WITH  
24 RESPECT TO COMMERCIALS?  
25 MR. ESCHER: YOUR HONOR, OBJECTION. CALLS FOR  
26 HEARSAY.  
27 THE COURT: SUSTAINED.  
28 MS. CHABER: Q. ARE THERE ANY SHOWS HERE THAT  
2140  
1 HAD A GREATER THAN 20 PERCENT VIEWERSHIP OF CHILDREN IN THE  
2 12 AND UNDER CATEGORY?  
3 MR. ESCHER: OBJECTION. LACK OF FOUNDATION.  
4 THE COURT: OKAY. YOU ARE GOING TO NEED A LAY A  
5 FOUNDATION.  
6 MS. CHABER: Q. WAS THERE AN ANALYSIS MADE OF  
7 THE SHOWS THAT WERE ON, AND THE PERCENTAGE OF VIEWERSHIP OF  
8 THOSE SHOWS WITH RESPECT TO CHILDREN UNDER THE AGE OF 12?  
9 A. YES. BOTH --  
10 THE COURT: DON'T TELL US WHAT THE INFORMATION  
11 WAS. YOU HAVE ANSWERED THAT QUESTION.  
12 GO AHEAD. YOU CAN COMPLETE YOUR ANSWER, WITHOUT  
13 GIVING US THE SUBSTANCE OF THE INFORMATION.  
14 YOU CAN GO AHEAD.  
15 THE WITNESS: YES, BUT BOTH ON AVERAGE, FOR THE  
16 AVERAGE AND SHOW BY SHOW.  
17 MS. CHABER: Q. SO THE INFORMATION THAT YOU  
18 DESCRIBED EARLIER THAT YOU RELY ON ESTABLISHES SHOW BY SHOW



19 WHAT THE PERCENTAGE OF CHILDREN UNDER THE AGE OF 12 VIEWING  
20 PARTICULAR SHOWS WERE; IS THAT CORRECT?

21 A. YES. I HESITATE, BECAUSE I DON'T RECALL OFF THE  
22 TOP OF MY HEAD WHETHER I HAD THE BREAKDOWN UNDER 12 OR JUST  
23 MINORS; THAT IS, UNDER THE AGE OF 18.

24 I THINK BOTH ARE IN THE REPORT THAT I WROTE AND  
25 PUBLISHED IN THE PEER-REVIEWED JOURNALS.

26 Q. AND IN TERMS OF MINORS, WERE THERE CERTAIN SHOWS  
27 THAT HAD A PERCENTAGE OF MINOR VIEWERS THAT WAS GREATER THAN  
28 10 PERCENT?

2141

1 MR. BARRON: JUST FOR CLARIFICATION, ARE YOU  
2 TALKING ABOUT 10 PERCENT OF ALL MINORS IN THE COUNTRY, OR WE  
3 ARE TALKING ABOUT --

4 MS. CHABER: I'M ASKING --

5 THE COURT: GO AHEAD. STATE YOUR OBJECTION.

6 MR. BARRON: I'M ASKING FOR A CLARIFICATION.  
7 ARE YOU TALKING ABOUT 10 PERCENT OF ALL MINORS IN THE  
8 COUNTRY OR 10 PERCENT OF ALL THE PEOPLE WATCHING THE SHOW AT  
9 THAT PARTICULAR HOUR?

10 MS. CHABER: Q. DOCTOR, DID YOU UNDERSTAND MY  
11 QUESTION TO MEAN THE PERCENTAGE OF THE VIEWERSHIP OF THAT  
12 SHOW WHICH WERE MINORS?

13 A. YES.

14 Q. WERE THERE SHOWS THAT YOU DETAILED HERE THAT HAD  
15 A PERCENTAGE OF MINOR VIEWERSHIP GREATER THAN 10 PERCENT OF  
16 THE PEOPLE WATCHING THE SHOW?

17 A. YES.

18 Q. AND WERE THERE -- IS IT BROKEN DOWN BY  
19 PERCENTAGE?

20 A. YES.

21 Q. WERE THERE SHOWS THAT HAD GREATER THAN 20 PERCENT  
22 VIEWERSHIP OF MINORS?

23 A. YES. IN FACT, ON AVERAGE, THE PERCENTAGE --

24 MR. BARRON: YOUR HONOR, I THINK HE IS GOING  
25 BEYOND THE QUESTION. I DON'T MIND.

26 THE COURT: YOU HAVE ANSWERED THAT QUESTION.

27 WHAT YOU ARE ABOUT TO TELL US GOES BEYOND THE  
28 SCOPE OF THAT QUESTION. WE'LL HAVE TO WAIT FOR THE NEXT

2142

1 ONE.

2 MS. CHABER: Q. WERE THERE SHOWS THAT HAD A  
3 PERCENTAGE VIEWERSHIP OF GREATER THAN 30 PERCENT MINORS?

4 A. YES.

5 Q. CAN YOU IDENTIFY A SPECIFIC SHOW AND A SPECIFIC  
6 PERCENTAGE MINOR VIEWERSHIP? IS THAT POSSIBLE TO DO?

7 A. I CAN DO A LITTLE OF THAT FROM MEMORY. WITH  
8 REFERENCE TO THE PAPERS I HAVE PUBLISHED, I CAN DO A LOT OF  
9 IT.

10 Q. COULD YOU JUST GIVE US AN EXAMPLE OF A SHOW THAT  
11 HAD A GREATER THAN 10 PERCENT VIEWERSHIP THAT WAS MINORS?

12 A. THE BEVERLY HILLBILLIES SHOW HERE.

13 Q. WHAT WAS THE PERCENTAGE OF VIEWERSHIP OF MINORS?

14 A. I BELIEVE THE PERCENTAGE VIEWERSHIP OF MINORS  
15 OVER THE SEASON WAS 38 PERCENT.

16 Q. OKAY. ANY OTHER SHOWS THAT HAD 10 PERCENT OR  
17 GREATER VIEWERSHIP THAT WERE MINORS?

18 A. 10 PERCENT OR GREATER?

19 Q. YES.

20 A. OH, I WOULD SAY PROBABLY ALMOST ALL THE SHOWS HAD  
21 10 PERCENT OR GREATER --

22 Q. HOW ABOUT 20 PERCENT?

23 THE COURT: MS. CHABER, PLEASE.

24 MS. CHABER: I'M SORRY.  
25 THE COURT: GO AHEAD. FINISH YOUR ANSWER.  
26 MS. CHABER: Q. YOU CAN'T DEFINE THAT  
27 SPECIFICALLY?  
28 A. THE LIST I RECALL IDENTIFIED THOSE WITH 30  
2143  
1 PERCENT OR GREATER. THEY WERE THE ONES WHO WERE ABOVE  
2 AVERAGE.  
3 Q. CAN YOU IDENTIFY WHICH OTHER SHOWS BESIDES THE  
4 BEVERLY HILLBILLIES THAT HAD A 30 PERCENT OR GREATER  
5 VIEWERSHIP --  
6 A. THE SHOWS --  
7 Q. -- THAT WERE MINORS?  
8 THE COURT: THE TWO OF YOU ARE GOING TO HAVE TO  
9 TALK ONE AT TIME. IT'S GETTING LATE. MAYBE WE SHOULD  
10 QUIT. ARE WE ALMOST DONE?  
11 MS. CHABER: WE'RE ALMOST DONE. I DON'T WANT TO  
12 COME BACK TO THIS, YOUR HONOR.  
13 THE WITNESS: IT'S A FAIRLY BRIEF LIST. FOR  
14 PHILIP MORRIS, THE SHOWS WERE JACKIE GLEASON AT 38 PERCENT  
15 OF ITS AUDIENCE BEING YOUTH, GLYNIS AT -- EXCUSE ME -- RED  
16 SKELTON AT 37 PERCENT OF ITS AUDIENCE YOUTH, ROUTE 66 AT 31  
17 PERCENT.  
18 FOR R.J. REYNOLDS, THE SHOWS OVER THIS 30 PERCENT  
19 CRITERION WERE BEVERLY HILLBILLIES AT 38 PERCENT, GLYNIS AT  
20 44 PERCENT, MCHALE'S NAVY AT 40 PERCENT, SUNSET STRIP AT 32  
21 PERCENT, AND SATURDAY NIGHT AT THE MOVIES AT 32 PERCENT.  
22 MS. CHABER: Q. OKAY. AND ON AVERAGE, HOW  
23 MANY CIGARETTE ADVERTISEMENTS WOULD MINORS SEE IF THEY WERE  
24 WATCHING TELEVISION AT THIS TIME PERIOD FOR THESE HOURS?  
25 MR. BARRON: OBJECTION. VAGUE AND AMBIGUOUS AS  
26 TO TIME PERIOD, YOUR HONOR.  
27 MS. CHABER: 1963 WE ARE TALKING ABOUT, AND WE  
28 ARE TALKING ABOUT FROM 7:30 TO 11:00.  
2144  
1 THE WITNESS: CHILDREN UNDER THE AGE OF 13 WOULD  
2 HAVE SEEN 845 CIGARETTE COMMERCIALS IN THAT YEAR.  
3 MS. CHABER: Q. THIS IS AN AVERAGE?  
4 A. THE AVERAGE CHILD WOULD HAVE SEEN 845. OF  
5 COURSE, IF YOU HAD WATCHED MORE THAN THE AVERAGE AMOUNT OF  
6 TELEVISION, THEY WOULD HAVE SEEN THAT MUCH MORE. THE  
7 AVERAGE TEENAGE WOULD HAVE SEEN 1350 CIGARETTE COMMERCIALS.  
8 MS. CHABER: I THINK WE CAN END THERE.  
9 THE COURT: OKAY.  
10 MS. CHABER: YOU DID WANT TO STOP?  
11 THE COURT: I DID. IT'S 4:30.  
12 MS. CHABER: SORRY.  
13 THE COURT: NOT QUITE.  
14 DR. POLLAY, WHY DON'T YOU RETURN TO ONE SEAT OR  
15 THE OTHER, PLEASE.  
16 JURORS, OVER THE COURSE OF THE EVENING, PLEASE DO  
17 NOT DISCUSS THIS CASE WITH ANYONE OR LET ANYONE DISCUSS IT  
18 WITH YOU. PLEASE DON'T FORM OR EXPRESS ANY OPINIONS ABOUT  
19 THE CASE.  
20 COUNSEL, A QUICK QUESTION. I WAS GOING TO  
21 PROPOSE -- I HAVE ANOTHER MATTER TOMORROW MORNING BEFORE THE  
22 TRIAL, WHICH IS GOING TO TAKE ME TO 9:30.  
23 I WAS GOING PROPOSE TO HAVE THE JURY IN HERE AT  
24 9:30, UNLESS ANY OF YOU WANTED IT TO BE LATER.  
25 IF YOU DO, SPEAK UP.  
26 SHALL WE START AT 9:30?  
27 MS. CHABER: I UNDERSTOOD WE WOULD DEAL WITH THE  
28 COURT LATER TONIGHT. SO I THINK 9:30 IS FINE.

2145

1 MR. BARRON: 9:30 IS FINE.  
2 THE COURT: IT'S PROBABLY AN APT DESCRIPTION OF  
3 IT TOO.  
4 MS. CHABER: LATER TONIGHT.  
5 THE COURT: OKAY.  
6 ALL RIGHT, JURORS. WE'LL START TOMORROW AT  
7 9:30. HAVE A GOOD EVENING.  
8 (THE PROCEEDINGS ADJOURNED AT 4:30 P.M.)  
9

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28